



MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

OTTAWA, Thursday, October 19, 2023
(55)

[English]

The Standing Senate Committee on Agriculture and Forestry met this day at 9 a.m., in room B45, Senate of Canada Building, the chair, the Honourable Robert Black, presiding.

Members of the committee present: The Honourable Senators Black, Burey, Cardozo, Cormier, Cotter, Dalphond, MacDonald, Miville-Dechêne, LaBoucane-Benson, Oh, Plett, Saint-Germain, Simons and Woo (14).

Participating in the meeting: Joanne Markle LaMontagne, Analyst, Library of Parliament.

Pursuant to the order of reference adopted by the Senate on Tuesday, June 13, 2023, the committee continued its consideration of Bill C-234, An Act to amend the Greenhouse Gas Pollution Pricing Act.

It was agreed that the committee proceed to clause-by-clause consideration of Bill C-234.

It was agreed that the title stand postponed.

The chair asked whether clause 1 shall carry.

The Honourable Senator Dalphond moved that Bill C-234 be amended in clause 1:

(a) on page 1, by replacing lines 4 to 15 with the following:

“1 (1) Paragraph (c) of the definition *eligible farming machinery* in section 3 of the *Greenhouse Gas Pollution Pricing Act* is replaced by the”;

(b) on page 2, by deleting lines 1 to 10.

A point of order was raised concerning the receivability of the amendment.

After debate, at 9:45 a.m., the committee suspended.

At 9:54 a.m., the committee resumed.

RULING BY THE CHAIR

Honourable senators, it is now my intention to rule on the point of order raised by Senator Burey on Senator Dalphond's amendment. I would like to thank all senators who participated in the debate on the point of order. We have heard references throughout that debate to previous rulings, so I will not repeat those references, which state the importance of the principle of the bill at second reading.

Applying the ideas around the principle to the point of order, the basic objective of Bill C-234 is to amend the Greenhouse Gas Pollution Pricing Act to expand the definition of "eligible farming machinery" — grain drying and heating and cooling for livestock — and for "qualifying farming fuels" to include "marketable natural gas." To remove structures from the bill as to exclude barns and greenhouses, in my thinking, would be destructive to the bill.

The structures themselves are essential to Bill C-234. Senator Dalphond's amendment effectively reverses the principle of the bill. Since the amendment goes against the basic principle of the bill and does not reflect the decision made by the Senate at second reading, I will deem it out of order. While debate is allowed and welcomed in this committee, I find that the amendment is inadmissible, and thus I rule in favour of Senator Burey's point of order.

The Honourable Senator Dalphond appealed the chair's ruling.

The question being put on whether the chair's ruling shall be sustained, it was negatived on the following vote:

YEAS

The Honourable Senators

Black, Burey, MacDonald, Oh, Plett — [5]

NAYS

The Honourable Senators

Cardozo, Cormier, Dalphond, LaBoucane-Benson, Miville-Dechêne, Saint-Germain, Woo — [7]

ABSTENTIONS

Cotter, Simons — [2]

Resuming debate on the motion in amendment of the Honourable Senator Dalphond.

A point of order was raised concerning the relevance of debate.

The chair ruled that debate may continue and that senators should keep the amendment in question in mind.

Resuming debate on the motion in amendment of the Honourable Senator Dalphond.

After debate, the question being put on the motion in amendment, it was adopted on the following vote:

YEAS

The Honourable Senators

Cardozo, Cormier, Dalphond, Miville-Dechêne, Simons, Saint-Germain, Woo — [7]

NAYS

The Honourable Senators

Black, Burey, Cotter, MacDonald, Oh, Plett — [6]

ABSTENTIONS

LaBoucane-Benson — [1]

It was agreed that clause 1, as amended, carry, on division.

The chair asked whether clause 2 shall carry.

The Honourable Senator Woo moved that Bill C-234 be amended in clause 2:

(a) on page 2, by replacing lines 24 to 37 with the following:

“of the day on which this Act comes into force.;

(b) on page 3, by deleting lines 1 to 9.

After debate, the question being put on the motion in amendment, it was negatived on the following vote:

YEAS

The Honourable Senators

Cardozo, Cormier, Dalphond, LaBoucane-Benson, Miville-Dechêne, Saint-Germain, Woo — [7]

NAYS

The Honourable Senators

Black, Burey, Cotter, MacDonald, Oh, Plett, Simons — [7]

ABSTENTIONS

NIL

The Honourable Senator Woo moved that Bill C-234 be amended in clause 2:

(a) on page 2, by replacing lines 24 to 37 with the following:

“of the day on which this Act comes into force.”;

(b) on page 3, by deleting lines 1 to 9.

After debate, at 11 a.m., the committee adjourned to the call of the chair.

ATTEST:

Ferda Simpson

Clerk of the Committee