



# Debates of the Senate

---

1st SESSION

•

36th PARLIAMENT

•

VOLUME 137

•

NUMBER 153

---

OFFICIAL REPORT  
(HANSARD)

**Tuesday, September 7, 1999**

---

**THE HONOURABLE GILDAS L. MOLGAT  
SPEAKER**

This issue contains the latest listing of Officers of the Senate, the Ministry,  
Senators and Members of the Senate and Joint Committees.

## CONTENTS

(Daily index of proceedings appears at back of this issue.)

*Debates*: Chambers Building, Room 943, Tel. 995-5805

---

Published by the Senate  
Available from Canada Communication Group — Publishing, Public Works and  
Government Services Canada, Ottawa K1A 0S9,  
Also available on the Internet: <http://www.parl.gc.ca>

## THE SENATE

Tuesday, September 7, 1999

The Senate met at 4:00 p.m., the Speaker in the Chair.

Prayers.

### BUSINESS OF THE SENATE

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, before proceeding with the Orders of the Day, I would like to welcome you back from vacation.

[*English*]

I trust that, after the summer recess, all honourable senators have come back full of goodwill, cooperation and understanding. I wish you all welcome back on this occasion.

### VISITORS IN THE GALLERY

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, before we proceed, I should like to acknowledge the presence in our gallery today of many distinguished visitors. I cannot possibly mention all of them by name, but I will single out two of them: the Deputy Prime Minister, the Honourable Herb Gray, accompanied by some members of the House of Commons, and the Premier of Newfoundland and Labrador, the Honourable Brian Tobin. Premier Tobin is also accompanied by some ministers from his cabinet.

• (1620)

### NEW SENATORS

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, I have the honour to inform the Senate that the Clerk has received certificates from the Registrar General of Canada showing that the following persons, respectively, have been summoned to the Senate:

Sheila Finestone, P.C.  
Ione Christensen, C.M.  
George J. Furey  
Melvin Perry  
Nick G. Sibbeston  
Isobel Finnerty

### INTRODUCTION

**The Hon. the Speaker** having informed the Senate that there were senators without, waiting to be introduced:

The following honourable senators were introduced; presented Her Majesty's writs of summons; took the oath prescribed by law, which was administered by the Clerk; and were seated:

**Hon. Sheila Finestone**, of Montreal, Quebec, introduced between Hon. B. Alasdair Graham, P.C., and Hon. Joan Fraser.

**Hon. Ione Christensen**, of Whitehorse, Yukon Territory, introduced between Hon. B. Alasdair Graham, P.C., and Hon. Jeremiah S. Grafstein.

**Hon. George J. Furey**, of St. John's, Newfoundland, introduced between Hon. B. Alasdair Graham, P.C., and Hon. P. Derek Lewis.

**Hon. Melvin Perry**, of St. Louis, Prince Edward Island, introduced between Hon. B. Alasdair Graham, P.C., and Hon. Catherine S. Callbeck.

**Hon. Nick G. Sibbeston**, of Fort Simpson, Northwest Territories, introduced between Hon. B. Alasdair Graham, P.C., and Hon. Willie Adams.

**Hon. Isobel Finnerty**, of Burlington, Ontario, introduced between Hon. B. Alasdair Graham, P.C., and Hon. Bill Rompkey.

**The Hon. the Speaker** informed the Senate that each of the honourable senators named above had made and subscribed the declaration of qualification required by the Constitution Act, 1867, in the presence of the Clerk of the Senate, the Commissioner appointed to receive and witness the said declaration.

[*Translation*]

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, first of all, I would like to greet all honourable senators and issue an extremely warm welcome to our new colleagues, who come from various regions of the country.

[*English*]

Honourable senators will recall that the origins of our parliamentary system were rooted in the historic document known as the Magna Carta, the words of which have guided the evolution of many contemporary Western democracies. In part it reads:

To no one will we sell, to no one deny or delay right or justice.

Those words, written in the 13th century, have guided the thoughts and actions of dedicated parliamentarians over many years.

• (1650)

Canada's brilliant Edward Blake spoke simply of the meaning of Parliament in the House of Commons a little over a century ago. He said:

The privileges of Parliament are the privileges of the people, and the rights of Parliament are the rights of the people.

As we enter a new century, these words remind us of a tradition which we have inherited; an unchanged tradition and a privilege very few are fortunate enough to possess. That, honourable senators, is the wonderful privilege of public service.

I take great pride today, first, in introducing Senator Sheila Finestone, because in this experienced and vigorous parliamentarian we find a person who has epitomized, in her work and her dedication to the people of this country and her province, not only the words and the spirit but the very active and disciplined pursuit of right and justice.

Someone once said that those who expect to reap the blessings of freedom must undergo the fatigue of supporting it. The indefatigable, four-term elected Member of Parliament for Mount Royal, Senator Sheila Finestone has always been respected as a quick study with an enormous capacity for understanding the fine print in complicated fields such as telecommunications, among many others. She developed a highly respected expertise in the sophisticated, fast moving, high technology sector. Throughout her parliamentary career, Sheila was an outstanding and acknowledged leader in the cause of protecting cultural and linguistic minority rights and a compelling champion of multiculturalism.

Sworn to the Privy Council in November of 1993 as secretary of state for multiculturalism and the status of women, she would lead the Canadian delegation to the 1995 United Nations Conference on Women in Beijing. At the time of her appointment to the Senate, she was chair of the Standing Joint Committee on Official Languages and a member of the Standing Committee on Justice and Human Rights and the Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs and International Trade. She is chair of the Canadian Group of the Inter-Parliamentary Union, and vice-chair of the IPU's Coordinating Committee of Women Parliamentarians. As well, she is parliamentary advisor to the Minister of Foreign Affairs on anti-personnel land mines.

Senator Finestone has a long record of community service, including serving as president of la Fédération des femmes du Québec, as vice-president of both Allied Jewish Community Services and the YMYWHA, as well as on the executive council for the "No" during the 1980 referendum. Her work has been recognized with numerous prestigious awards, including the

Samuel Bronfman Award for exceptional service to the Montreal Jewish community, and the Jackie Robinson Special Award from the Montreal Black Business Persons and Professionals.

Honourable senators, this respected legislator will add new dimensions to our job here as guardian of the rights and freedoms of Canadians. As a devoted parliamentarian, Senator Sheila Finestone brings a razor-sharp mind and tireless energy to this historic place, the workshop of government, the Senate of Canada.

Honourable senators, this past summer I visited Whitehorse to speak at a memorial service in honour of our old friend and colleague Senator Paul Lucier. As always in my visits to the Yukon over the years, I reflected on the remarkable beauty of this big, unspoiled, majestic country of treeless land and 24-hour sunlight. I thought about the tundra and the small communities, of the vision and the spirit of its wonderful people, of their future hopes and their dreams. I thought about Paul's message to those of us from outside this land of glistening snow-covered valleys and rugged mountains, to those of us who have never seen the great river christened by our First Nations, the great river from which this beautiful territory takes its name. What happens to the North will tell us a lot about the kind of people, the kind of Canadians, we are.

As we welcome Senator Ione Christensen to this chamber, we are graced by the presence of a resolute champion of the Yukon and its people who, by her energy and her spirit, has become widely known not only in her own beloved territory but across Canada as well. A distinguished public servant with deep roots in the community, she has served as justice of the peace and chair of the City of Whitehorse Planning Board. She went on to serve two terms as mayor of Whitehorse, became Commissioner of the Yukon in 1979 and chair of the Association of Yukon Municipalities.

A member of the Order of Canada, Senator Christensen has led a remarkably busy and eclectic life — and honourable senators may take that as an understatement. Among other things, she was a director of Petro-Canada and PanArctic, and worked in the Whitehorse office of the Department of Energy, Mines and Resources. She has served as an arbitrator with the Yukon Public Service Commission and as chair of the Advisory Committee on Waste Management of the Government of the Yukon, as well as becoming executive director of Crossroads Alcohol and Drug Treatment Centre and director of the National Association of Canadian Land Surveyors.

As we reflect upon the appointment of Senator Christensen to this chamber, we are reminded that the North is our great challenge and our great adventure as Canadians. The Yukon is truly a land of mystery and a land of magic. Ione brings with her an understanding of the mystery, which is unparalleled, and an intuitive sense of the magic which few could rival.

Senator Christensen, we are confident that we will learn much from the depth of your experience and the breadth of your vision in the months and the years to come.

Honourable senators, on March 31, 1949, 50 years ago this year, the wonderful island of Newfoundland became the tenth province in the Canadian federation. I understand that there has always been a debate, as Joey Smallwood once pointed out, over whether it would be historically and constitutionally as correct to say that Newfoundland absorbed Canada, or took her over, as it would be to say that Canada absorbed Newfoundland. On the occasion of this great anniversary, some Newfoundlanders might contend that the answer to this question has yet to be found.

Whatever the answer, those proud Newfoundlanders, once citizens of a small but significant nation in its own right, have brought a sense of joy and adventure and all the talent of a warm-hearted, resilient and dynamic people to the political, economic, and artistic life of our country.

Like many of his adventuresome ancestors, Senator George Furey has never been slow to respond to challenges he has found threatening to the interests of his province or his country, no matter to what province or rally he and his like-thinking, like-minded Newfoundlanders have had to fly.

There is a history to the kind of imaginative actions that George and his friends took as they landed in Montreal for the big rally which attracted over 100,000 Canadians at the height of the nation's trauma over the future of Confederation in 1995.

• (1700)

In speaking of that great rally, His Honour the Speaker made reference to the presence in the gallery of the Deputy Prime Minister, the Honourable Herb Gray, and of the Premier of Newfoundland and Labrador, the Honourable Brian Tobin, along with his special guests. Without digressing too much, I want to emphasize that both the deputy prime minister and the premier are great champions of the work of this chamber.

"Where are the Newfoundlanders?" asked First Sea Lord Winston Churchill in the desperate days of 1939. "They are the most skilled seamen in small boats in rough water who exist," he said. "Please prepare me measures whereby 1,000 may be sent at once." "Newfoundlanders" emphasized the person who later became Prime Minister Churchill, "— have nothing new to learn about the sea."

No matter where the rough waters, be it in the dark days of 1939 or the troubled, anxious hours of October 1995, the Newfoundlanders were there when the going got tough. For Senator George Furey, who seems to have inherited all the daring of generations past, the guiding idea has always been to go beyond one's fingertips in defence of what one believed was right.

A native of St. John's and a distinguished educator and lawyer, Senator Furey, like many Newfoundlanders, understands the value of cooperation in good times and in bad. As a widely respected community leader, he has given his time to numerous voluntary groups, professional boards and provincial commissions, including the Newfoundland Teachers'

Association, the Boy Scouts of Canada, the St. Clare's Mercy Hospital Ethics Committee, the Gonzaga High School Council and the Provincial Police Complaints Commission.

Senator Furey earned two Bachelor of Arts degrees and a Master's in education from Memorial University. He served as a teacher and supervising vice-principal, and later a supervising principal, of the Placentia-St. Mary's Roman Catholic School Board.

In 1980, George enrolled at Dalhousie University, earning his law degree in 1983. He was admitted to the Newfoundland bar in 1984, and by 1989 he was a senior partner in the firm of O'Brien, Furey and Smith.

Senator Furey, you come to the Senate of Canada 50 years after the hard fought campaign to bring Newfoundland into Confederation. You bring with you long years of service to your community and to your province. This chamber has been served by generations of fine public servants who have been part of the ongoing struggle to build the Canadian ideal, a special ideal based on tolerance and sharing, on equality and decency. We welcome you, Senator Furey, to this proud tradition, knowing that you will bring the same wisdom, imagination and strong sense of responsibility to the work of the Senate of Canada that you have already given to the people of Newfoundland.

**Hon. Senators:** Hear, hear!

**Senator Graham:** Honourable senators, one of the great events of the year of la Francophonie was the Congrès Mondial Acadien, which concluded with celebrations in Lafayette, Louisiana and the wonderful spectacle Cri du Bayou at the Cajundome. In many ways, the pure joy which lit up the faces of the thousands of participants was all part of the miracle of the survivance française, and the pride of the Cajuns and their cousins throughout North America in the face of the centuries old challenge of preserving the language and Acadian culture in faraway Louisiana.

For the Acadians of Atlantic Canada, enchanted by the warmth and camaraderie of their cousins deep in the American South, this was very much a realization of the strength of the distinctive people who shared a beautiful but tragic history.

[Translation]

They could see that their future and the future of the Acadian community in Louisiana depended on their being part of the national and international Francophonie.

[English]

At the fête national celebrations in Caraquet this year, on August 15, the beautiful Acadian flag flew proudly over a people who have faced one of the cruellest events of the colonial period, the deportations of 1755 to 1763. Indeed, at that time, the majority of the Acadian people were exiled to the American colonies as well as to England and France.

[Translation]

This flag, the French tricolour with a yellow star, is a symbol of national pride.

[English]

While the star represents the Assumption, the special feast day of the Acadians, it also was designed to symbolize the star of the sea which guided sailors through tempests and around threatening reefs.

In this the year of la Francophonie, that star of gold is a symbol of a people who have travelled with courage and with strength across some of the most turbulent and troubled waters on the planet. Because of the hard work of local educators and community leaders like Senator Melvin Perry, a colourful, proud and talented people continue to follow that star.

Senator Perry comes to this chamber at the conclusion of the historic Francophonie summit held in Moncton at the heart of l'Acadie, and at a time of great joy in a vibrant, culturally rich and confident Acadian community. An accomplished educator, he has been a leading promoter of Acadian culture on Prince Edward Island. Indeed, he is the first Acadian from Prince Edward Island to be appointed in over 100 years, a fitting highlight of this year of la Francophonie in Canada.

His distinguished 34-year teaching career culminated with his 15-year tenure as principal of St. Louis School. He has earned special recognition and respect for his work promoting Acadian culture in the province and in his continuing fight for the linguistic rights of Acadians on the island which has included service with the Saint Thomas Aquinas Society, La Voix Acadienne Ltée and on Entente Canada Communauté.

It was once said that a teacher affects eternity. He or she can never tell where his or her influence will stop. Today, as we welcome Senator Perry to the Senate of Canada, we celebrate a nation which has fought the vicissitudes of history and, following its star, now basks under the sunshine of proud accomplishment. As we reflect on the miracle of 3,000 children attending immersion classes down in the bayou, we remember that it is the hard work and the vision of Acadian educators like Melvin Perry who have kept the dream alive no matter where they may live in Canada.

Today, we celebrate another momentous day in the year of la Francophonie by welcoming Senator Perry to the Senate of Canada.

**Hon. Senators:** Hear, hear!

**Senator Graham:** Honourable senators, Senator Nick Sibbeston was born in Fort Simpson in the Northwest Territories, and attended residential school there, as well as in Providence, Inuvik and Yellowknife. He went on to secure a Bachelor of Arts and a law degree from the University of Alberta. However, at no time did he lose his sense of commitment to his roots, and at no time did he lose sight of his

destiny: it was to dedicate his life to public service, and particularly to the needs of the aboriginal people of the North.

As a young Métis, he knew personally the hopes and dreams of our First Nations. He knew the secrets only our First Nations truly understood. They had paddled the wilderness waters and knew the pain of the portage. They knew the treeless lands and the unspoiled rivers. They were the key to a vital part of our national identity. They were part of our special bond with the vast distances, with the adventure, the solitude and the mystery of our great Canadian wilderness, and the Canadian psyche itself.

• (1710)

From the time of his attendance at residential school, the young Nick Sibbeston understood the meaning of hope and belief in the lives of a proud people as they struggled for release from the inequities of the past. Most of all, he understood that to aspire to great things in the future, our First Nations must not only act but dream, must not only dream but believe, because the great reality of all things Canadian is that the real soul of our country will only be returned to us by the First Nations who hold the key.

The Métis people are renowned in our history for a belief in the rights of the small, as Louis Riel once said, because, great or small, those rights are the same for everyone. Senator Sibbeston's life will become a testament to these beautiful words. He went on to become a distinguished member of the Northwest Territories Legislative Assembly, where he served six years in cabinet and two years as premier. He represented the Government of the Northwest Territories as premier at first ministers' conferences on the economy and on aboriginal constitutional matters. More recently, he has worked as a justice specialist and served four years on the Canadian Human Rights Panel/Tribunal. He has also served as cultural advisor and Slavey-language advisor for the television program *North of 60*.

On all the roads he has taken in his life, Nick Sibbeston had a dream. It was a dream about equity and a level playing field for all of our people. It was a dream about respect and dignity, a dream about communities and societies where our First Nations have the right to hope, liberated from despair and intolerance — places where children have the right to grow up equal.

As we welcome Senator Sibbeston to this chamber, we do so with great pride, for this is a man who has fought over a lifetime for the rights of the small, because, great or small, those rights indeed are the same for everyone.

**Hon. Senators:** Hear, hear!

**Senator Graham:** Honourable senators, many decades ago, Nellie McClung wrote that woman's place in the new order is to bring vision and imagination to work on life's problems. If this courageous member of the valiant five were here today, she would no doubt smile approvingly as Senator Isobel Finnerty is welcomed to this chamber. No doubt she would think, as she looked at the 32 women senators seated in this chamber today, of the landmark decision in the Persons Case, delivered by Lord Stanley, Lord Chancellor of the Privy Council of Great Britain in 1929, the decision by which women became eligible to become members of the Senate of Canada.

[ Senator Graham ]

As we think of the good fight for the new order, the good fight for a fair, just, and equitable society, we think of all the straight-talking, hard-working women of extraordinary energy and dedication who have helped to take us there.

Senator Isobel Finnerty blazed a trail for women in the early post-war years, enrolling in Timmins business college, working as a medical secretary, and paralleling all that with a real flair for community service. She was appointed to the Timmins Parks and Recreation Commission in 1947 at the age of 19, and served as its sole woman member until 20 years later, in 1967. She gave her extra hours to education, the YMCA, and the Canadian Cancer Society.

Her personal success has been based on some pretty timeless truths. Isobel has always given a little more than she had to. She has always aimed a little higher than maybe even she sometimes thought possible. She has always tried a little harder than probably even she wanted to; and she has understood, in her down-to-earth way of doing things, that laughter is almost always the shortest distance between two people.

Throughout her active life, she has made an indelible mark in the field of political organization at the federal and provincial levels. Her talent and her reputation have seen her invited to train others in every province in Canada. In 1994, she was invited to Benin, Africa, as an international trainer for the National Democratic Institute for International Affairs, which is based in Washington, D.C.

Senator Finnerty's grassroots activism and joyous energy, her reputation as a straight shooter and honest broker are all much-needed resources in this chamber at present — a time when the Senate of Canada has become the whipping boy for the individual discontents of media analysts, political pundits of various persuasions, and a whole host of misinformed observers who have taken to maligning this institution. For all of us who love and honour this place, this institution, Senator Finnerty will bring new fire and new energy to the campaign to get the message out to the Canadian people, honestly and fairly.

All of us here today know that we have work to do in educating and informing the people of this country about the role of this honourable institution, an institution that has been on the cutting edge of issues which have a daily impact on their individual and collective lives and freedoms. Yes, we have work to do, and Senator Finnerty can be counted on to tirelessly take up the challenge. In the spirit of the good fight of 1929, we welcome a woman of endless energy, and a huge heart to help, to the Senate of Canada.

**Hon. Senators:** Hear, hear!

**Hon. John Lynch-Staunton (Leader of the Opposition):** Honourable senators, on behalf of the official opposition, I am pleased to join with the Leader of the Government in welcoming our six new colleagues. There is very little I can add to what he has already said, except to note with interest the seating arrangement which has been set out to accommodate our new

senators. Four are at the extreme end of the majority side and two have joined some of their colleagues on the right side of the house, which I want to add, with traditional Tory modesty, should not be considered or identified as the side of the righteous. This will allow them all to observe, from a privileged position, the sometimes perplexing conduct of the majority side, and also to follow, from this position, those whose role it is to keep this conduct in check. Perhaps in time, their observations may tempt them to seek permanent asylum over here — a request which I assure them will be given the same generous treatment as is given that of any refugee claimant.

Meanwhile, leaving aside political allegiance, one cannot but be impressed with the biography of each of the six as summarized by Senator Graham. They reinforce a claim I and others have made numerous times, and which has yet to be contradicted: The diversity of background, ability, knowledge, and commitment residing in the Senate of Canada are at least equal to, if not greater than, those found in any elected legislature in Canada, be it federal or provincial.

I urge our new colleagues not to pay heed to those shrill voices of pathetic malcontents whose negativism towards the Senate is an insult to Parliament as a whole. It is quite appropriate, in a country such as ours, as democratic as it is, to question the continued existence of an appointed body with powers equal, with few exceptions, to those of the other place. We have done so ourselves on more than one occasion in this very chamber, and none is more anxious for a properly reformed Senate than the senators themselves who sit here today, but only as part of the result of a well-informed debate, not one based on ignorance.

• (1720)

That being said, it is thanks to this appointed body that the country has been spared contradictory and flawed legislation, and even some which was clearly unconstitutional. Too often, bills are sent here in undue haste and without adequate study. It is thanks to the Senate's diligence and commitment that the final product is a vast improvement over the original version.

Honourable senators, I have no doubt that our new colleagues will make their own special contribution to this process. I wish them all the best as they assume their new responsibilities.

---

## SENATORS' STATEMENTS

### QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

**Hon. Noël A. Kinsella (Deputy Leader of the Opposition):** Honourable senators, I rise on a question of privilege. Pursuant to rule 43(7) of the *Rules of the Senate of Canada*, I rise to give oral notice that I shall raise a question of privilege in respect to a witness, namely, Dr. Shiv Chopra, who appeared before the Standing Senate Committee on Agriculture and Forestry during its study on recombinant bovine growth hormone, rBST, and its effect on the human and animal safety aspects.

Earlier today, pursuant to rule 43(3), I gave written notice to the Clerk of the Senate. At the appropriate time, I shall ask His Honour to rule on the facts that I will outline in detail in order to make a determination as to whether or not there is a *prima facie* case, as I believe there is, of breach of privilege.

Honourable senators, as today is such a special day, with the unanimous consent of the Senate, and notwithstanding rule 43(8), I ask that rule 43(8) be applied tomorrow, Wednesday, September 8, 1999. Consequently, I will not take up this matter at the end of our proceedings but, rather, I will deal with it tomorrow. If there is unanimous consent, I will proceed with this matter tomorrow.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Is it agreed, honourable senators?

**Hon. Senators:** Agreed.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** At the appropriate time tomorrow, we will proceed with the question of privilege.

## NOVA SCOTIA

IN MEMORY OF PASSENGERS AND CREW  
OF SWISSAIR FLIGHT 111

**Hon. J. Michael Forrestall:** Honourable senators, I should like to take this opportunity — and, this is the first chance that we have had to do so — to remember the 229 souls lost on September 2, 1998, with the crash of Swissair Flight 111. It was a human tragedy of unimaginable magnitude for our quiet and somewhat peaceful province.

To the families, I once again extend my heartfelt sympathy. To the people of the south shore, the volunteers, the volunteer fire-fighters, ground search and rescue, Coast Guard, emergency health services, soldiers, sailors, aircrew, RCMP and the Halifax fire and police services, I extend not only my own personal gratitude but also the gratitude of all Nova Scotians.

Honourable senators, we have heard much about this tragedy and much about the local heroism that took shape and the courage to go on, day after day, in unimaginable circumstances. There is much to be proud of, whether you were an emergency health service technician who raced outside Halifax to a point of ready alert and waited long hours, hoping, in vain, to save just one life; or whether you were searching the shore for broken bodies, as army reserve soldiers from my province's most historic regiments did; or whether you were diving to the surreal wreckage to recover key evidence and precious human remains; or whether you were flying over the scene in Sea Kings and Labradors.

Honourable senators, day after day these extraordinary people performed their assigned tasks. To do so took a form of courage and a sense of caring that is so deep in one's inner soul, words fall short of adequately expressing it.

One story I wish to recount is that of a young army captain, Trevor Jain, a reservist who joined the infantry when he went to

university. He was a private pilot, a platoon commander and a staff officer at 36 Canadian Brigade Group, headquartered in Halifax. He was finishing his last year of medical school. At 3:00 a.m., he received the first call and made his way to Shearwater, where he served throughout the crisis as the operations officer for the morgue. Day after day, hour after hour, he had the responsibility of waiting, hoping, and administering.

This is the calibre of soldier and leader that we have today in the Canadian Armed Forces. Many of the medics who worked at his side in the Shearwater morgue were also, I am proud to say, reservists. Indeed, 36 Canadian Brigade Group went immediately into action without awaiting orders — all due to the initiative of the Brigade Operations Officer, Captain Richard Dykens of the Royal Canadian Regiment. Within hours, elements of the brigade were on their way to the crash area on the initiative of one unrecognized captain who seized the initiative, as he was trained to do. That is leadership. These are a few of the individuals who did their job to a standard few can compare.

Honourable senators, I hope one day that all the stories will be told because, in this tragedy, there were great acts of human compassion that should be passed on to future generations. The lessons learned from the Swissair crash will pay dividends in the form of many lives being saved down the road. For example, for safety reasons, the use of Mylar insulation is being phased out. The investigation of this crash is another story that must and will be told. That knowledge will save lives at another time and in another place.

I would ask you all, honourable senators, to silently remember those who lost family members and friends in this terrible tragedy.

## LABOUR DAY

TRIBUTE TO ALLAN MCLEAN

**Hon. David Tkachuk:** Honourable senators, this being the day after Labour Day, it is fitting that the story of a worker in Canada came to me. Young people today are being told that they must change careers many times in their lives.

Yesterday, we celebrated the labour of Canadians, their hard work and their dedication. Today, I thought that I would tell you a story about a Canadian worker whose name is Robert Allan McLean, although he goes by "Al." His colleagues and friends held a retirement party for him on August 31. That signified the end of an era. This unassuming, down-to-earth gentlemen was neither a parliamentarian nor a judge. Nor did he win a Nobel prize. We often hear statements given about these people in this place, but today I am calling Al a special Canadian because he embodies the kind of qualities we should all be proud of and encourage in our children.

Not all of us are destined to make great achievements in science or have the opportunity to show our bravery in the face of danger. Sometimes our path may not stand out among other paths along the road of life.



Al is not really shy. He has coffee at the same place every day and chats up all the regulars. Al and his wife Shirley have two children, Tracey and Kirk.

Some of you hockey fans may know of the name Kirk McLean because he played for the Vancouver Canucks and Florida Panthers before he was traded to the New York Rangers. If you meet Al, he might not mention that he has a famous son because that is the kind of person he is.

Al is retiring from his job at the Toronto-Dominion Bank. He is the bank's longest-serving employee. In fact, he began working in 1951 in the mailroom of what was called then the Bank of Toronto. Shirley worked for the Dominion Bank. In 1955, when the two banks merged to become the Toronto-Dominion Bank, another merger of sorts took place. Al and Shirley met and they married shortly thereafter.

Everyone who has come in contact with Al loves him. He has been a hard-working, dedicated employee and friend to many. He is a happy person who, when asked what he plans to do during his retirement, muses on possibly taking a cooking course or two since his wife will not be retiring for a year and is looking forward to a hot meal being on the table when she gets home from work.

Of course Al is a hockey fan and catches his son's games whenever he can. What caught my attention first about Al was his employment record — 48 years with the Toronto-Dominion Bank, formerly the Bank of Toronto. In all that time, he took only 11 sick days.

When Al was interviewed by the in-house newspaper *Bank Notes*, he admitted that he would miss being around people every day and that he is not used to all the attention he has been getting lately.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** I regret that the honourable senator's time has expired.

**Senator Tkachuk:** Your Honour, I request leave to continue.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Is leave granted for Senator Tkachuk to continue?

**Hon. Senators:** Agreed.

**Senator Tkachuk:** Al McLean has said that he cannot sleep lately because he is wondering what the guys at work will cook up for his last day.

Al worked as a machine operator in the Toronto-Dominion Bank print shop in Toronto. He was the last remaining Bank of Toronto employee on staff.

On behalf of my colleagues and myself, I wish Al and his family all the best in his retirement. On this, the day after Labour Day, I also wish all the best to his former co-workers in their working life and in their retirement. May life be long and enjoyable. May Al continue along the special path by which he has inspired so many. May we continue to be inspired. Congratulations, Al.

## MANITOBA

### THIRTEENTH PAN-AMERICAN GAMES— TRIBUTE TO VOLUNTEERS AND CITIZENS

**Hon. Terry Stratton:** Honourable senators, I rise today to pay tribute to the people of Winnipeg, the people of Manitoba and to the 20,000 volunteers who made the Thirteenth Pan-American Games such a resounding success.

These games were the third-largest sporting event ever held and equivalent to putting on a Grey Cup game each day for 17 days. Manitobans can be particularly proud of this achievement. We succeeded in typical Manitoba fashion, coming to the games at the eleventh hour and making the opening ceremonies a virtual sell-out and buying tickets to events which insured their success. Most important, they embraced the games in typical warm and friendly Manitoba fashion. To them we owe a great gratitude.

We thank Sandy Reilly, the chair of the games for without his leadership these games would not have happened. We thank Don McKenzie, president of the society, for his persistence and tenacity over the years it took to bring the games to fruition. We thank Greg Hansen and Bobby McMahan who kept a tight rein on finances to ensure we remained within budget. We especially thank the athletes who made the games possible.

To those many other volunteers who remain nameless, they know how much hard work and sacrifice it took to succeed. They willingly paid the price of mental and physical exhaustion, ignoring time with family and friends in order to achieve success.

The three levels of government proved once again that events such as this are important to our country. The private sector showed superb participation.

To quote Sandy Reilly, the world saw Winnipeg with its lights and it was marvellous.

Our children and grandchildren have seen this event and can bask in its afterglow, knowing that the future of this province and this city is assured.

I am proud indeed to say I hail from such a great province and such a great city.

[*Translation*]

## THE FRANCOPHONIE SUMMIT

### CONGRATULATIONS TO ORGANIZERS OF MEETING IN MONCTON, NEW BRUNSWICK

**Hon. Marie-P. Poulin:** Honourable senators, many of you have just returned, as I have, from the Francophonie Summit in Moncton. All our colleagues here in this chamber and in the other place who have had the honour and the pleasure of sharing in this great success would like to express their sincere congratulations to the Prime Minister of this country, the Right Honourable Jean Chrétien, who chaired this summit on the theme of youth.

All Acadians in the Land of Evangeline gave a very warm welcome to the 52 representatives of all the countries and states making up the large family of the Francophonie. We also had the opportunity to witness the consensus the youth from all these countries were able to reach in urging all governments and states of the Francophonie to make education a priority.

Congratulations to all those who organized this great meeting of the members of the francophone family all around the world.

[English]

## ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

### CANADIAN ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION BILL, 1999

REPORT OF COMMITTEE—  
REQUEST FOR FURTHER INSTRUCTION

**Hon. Ron Ghitter:** Honourable senators, due to some unforeseen circumstances, I request leave to speak to the matter of the presentation to the chamber of the committee report on Bill C-32.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Is leave granted?

**Some Hon. Senators:** Agreed.

**Senator Ghitter:** Honourable senators, regarding the reporting of this bill certain unprecedented activities have occurred.

During the deliberations of the Standing Senate Committee on Energy, the Environment and Natural Resources over the past two weeks here in Ottawa, a motion was presented to the committee, which I will read into the record in order that honourable senators may understand the dilemma I face as chairman of that committee.

This motion was subsequently passed by a majority of the committee:

That with respect to Bill C-32, respecting pollution prevention and the protection of the environment and human health in order to contribute to sustainable development, the Committee shall follow the agreed-upon schedule of witnesses and complete its examination of those witnesses no later than Wednesday, September 1, 1999;

That if any further witnesses are found to be necessary by the Committee following the completion of the said schedule of witnesses, they shall be heard no later than Thursday, September 2, 1999;

That any vote on any motion dealing with the disposition of the said Bill be held no earlier than at the completion of the hearing of all witnesses; and

That the Chair put all questions necessary to dispose of the Bill and report the Bill to the Senate no later than 12 o'clock noon on Tuesday, September 7, 1999.

As chairman of this committee, I am under a duty to respectfully deal with motions as they come before the committee. The motion clearly says to me that I must "report the bill to the Senate no later than twelve o'clock noon on Tuesday, September 7, 1999."

• (1740)

Honourable senators, I came here at twelve o'clock today. In the presence of the Honourable Senator Atkins, I rose in this chair in an attempt to present this bill as required by my committee. Obviously, no one was here to receive it. As a result, I am in a dilemma as to what to do with a very important bill on which closure was imposed in an unprecedented way upon a committee. The dilemma is that I was obliged to report by twelve o'clock, as presented in a motion by Senator Kenny and approved by the committee.

I would suggest that the only proper way to deal with the matter is to call a special meeting of the committee to reconsider this motion, in order to bring it into line and so that I might duly and properly present the matter. At this time I do not feel that I can do so, inasmuch as I am constrained by the resolution of my committee.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, I am placed in a difficult position as points of order are not to be dealt with until after the Orders of the Day. Leave was granted to hear the Honourable Senator Ghitter. Is leave granted to hear other honourable senators?

**Hon. Noël A. Kinsella (Deputy Leader of the Opposition):** No.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, I am unable to hear any other speakers in that regard. However, Senator Ghitter has asked me if I would give this matter some consideration. I am prepared to do so.

If there is agreement, I would propose that some other honourable senator take the chair while I undertake to investigate this matter and research the precedents. Is that agreeable, honourable senators?

**Hon. Sharon Carstairs (Deputy Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, we would like some indication that we will not then get a "no" from the other side. We have graciously given our consent to Senator Ghitter to speak. We would like the opportunity to revert, if necessary, to presentation of reports from standing committees. Clearly, if we move from this item, we would need leave to revert. We must determine whether there is a fair and equitable intention on the other side, as we attempted to provide for Senator Ghitter.

**Senator Kinsella :** Honourable senators, no point of order was raised, no ruling was requested of the chair. In my opinion, there is nothing upon which the Speaker can rule.

Senator Ghitter rose, as was proper for him to do, as chairman of the committee to report that he had no report to make. We can all count; we know what a majority is, but the tyranny of the majority is only avoided when that majority's power is used perceptively, which was not done in this instance.

Senator Ghitter has placed before honourable senators the solution: namely, that his committee should meet. We would agree to grant permission for the committee to meet this evening and deal with the report, in order to come back here and present it properly. We know who has the majority; however, we must do things according to the rules.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, we gave leave to honourable Senator Ghitter. Senator Kinsella spoke without leave. In fairness, I must hear others and the Senate may then decide what they wish to do with the proposal made by Senator Ghitter, or perhaps refer it back to me. However, at this time I am forced to hear from other speakers.

**Hon. Colin Kenny:** Honourable senators, Senator Ghitter made particular reference to a motion that I moved in committee. The relevant paragraph was that the chairman put all of the necessary questions to dispose of the bill and report the bill to the Senate no later than twelve o'clock noon on Tuesday, September 7, 1999. This particular paragraph referred to the motions that would be involved if the committee were to adopt or amend the bill, or make a motion to report the bill to the Senate.

To clarify my intention, as this issue was discussed at great length in committee, I refer honourable members to take number 1330-52, where Senator Buchanan says:

Then why do we have this motion?

— referring to the motion that I had just moved, and where I replied:

The purpose of this motion is that I would personally like to see the business of this committee cleaned up by twelve noon on Tuesday, September 7. I believe a majority of the committee feels that way.

Then Senator Spivak says:

I am sure you are right.

Honourable senators, I should like to point out that had the notice read "forthwith," no one would have expected Senator Ghitter to jump up from the room and rush off to report the bill.

We were working out a timetable for the committee's work. We were coming to an agreement as to how the business of the committee would be handled. We did it in such a way that no one in the room was unclear about where we were going or what was intended.

**Hon. Nicholas W. Taylor:** Honourable senators, if there is a dilemma under which Senator Ghitter is labouring, it is entirely of his own making.

Senator Kenny made the motion, and it was very clear that by twelve o'clock noon on September 7, we were supposed to be ready to dispose of and report the bill, or not report the bill. However, it was impossible to report the bill at twelve o'clock. We knew that, and Senator Ghitter knew that at the time. He is splitting hairs. There is no comment in that sentence that says "all questions necessary to dispose of the bill and report the bill to be finished by twelve o'clock." Senator Ghitter is grasping at straws.

Further, honourable senators, there is a second item, and I have been through this as chairman of the Boreal Forest subcommittee. One cannot report a bill to the Senate outside of the time the Senate is sitting unless one receives the permission of the Senate. That permission was not granted in June.

It would have been impossible to report, even if the chairman had chosen to do so, or anyone from the committee. The Clerk would have rightfully said that there was not permission to report until the house sits. That is the way the matter stands.

For those two reasons, His Honour may feel sorry for Senator Ghitter; however, he certainly cannot rule in his favour.

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, we seem to have a difference of opinion, to put it mildly, as to what the members of the Standing Senate Committee on Energy, the Environment and Natural Resources agreed to when they passed the motion on Tuesday, August 24 concerning future business. Senator Ghitter believes that the motion required him to report to the Senate no later than twelve o'clock noon today. Notwithstanding that, as Senator Taylor has alluded, the committee has no power to order a report to be tabled when the Senate is not sitting.

Rule 98, on page 104 states:

The committee to which a bill has been referred shall report the bill to the Senate.

It does not state that the committee can report the bill to the Clerk of the Senate or to the Speaker. It states that the bill is to be reported to the Senate. It uses the word "shall," indicating that this is how it must be done, and the committee has no discretion.

• (1750)

If Senator Ghitter is correct about his interpretation of the motion, that would mean that the committee adopted a proposition that was contrary to the *Rules of the Senate* while he was in the chair; that he and the other committee members and the clerk of the committee understood this motion to mean that he had to report by twelve noon today, even though the Senate would not be sitting until 4 p.m. today; and that no one, including himself, knew that this would be contrary to the rules.

Senator Ghitter is asking us to accept an interpretation that would put the committee in conflict with the *Rules of the Senate*, but his interpretation is not shared by a majority of the committee members, including the sponsor of the motion Senator Kenny. Their interpretation would not put us in conflict with the rules and established practice in this chamber. Senator Kenny believes, as he indicated, that the intent and the effect of the motion was to ensure that all votes necessary to dispose of the bill would take place no later than twelve noon today, Tuesday, so that it could then be reported back to the Senate later that day, which is later this day.

During the debate on the motion in committee, Senator Kenny said:

...I would personally like to see the business of this committee cleaned up by 12 noon on Tuesday, September 7. I believe a majority of the committee feels that way.

He indicated that other senators agreed with that proposition.

Senator Ghitter was in the chair when Senator Kenny made this statement, but he said nothing, according to the transcript, even though it is clear that it would be impossible for the committee to table a report at noon. The committee would only be concluding its business at noon. The report would need to be prepared and translated, as is the normal procedure, and that cannot be done instantaneously. It would be a physical impossibility to conclude the work of the committee at noon and have the chairman suddenly materialize at that very moment in the Clerk's office, report in hand.

Clearly the intent was not to have the report tabled at noon, but rather to have the committee's work completed at noon so that a report could be tabled in the Senate later this day. This interpretation is supported by the final motion the committee adopted on Wednesday September 1, 1999. At that time, the Deputy Chair, Senator Taylor, was in the chair, and he said:

I do need a motion that we report this bill with observations at the next sitting of the Senate, in accordance with the August 24th resolution.

Is the motion carried?

The motion carried on division.

Honourable senators, let us be clear that the motion which was adopted by the committee did not say that the bill would be reported before the next sitting of the Senate or after the sitting of the Senate had concluded. It provided that it be reported at the next sitting of the Senate, which began at four o'clock this afternoon. We are now in the middle of that "next sitting," and the chair has an obligation, I submit, to present the report as ordered by the committee during the meeting of September 1, 1999.

The motion that was adopted also referred to the August 24 resolution, but the will of the committee was clearly expressed on September 1. If there is any ambiguity with respect to the August 24 resolution, it should be clarified by taking notice of

what the committee agreed to do on September 1, namely, to report the bill at the next sitting of the Senate. If there is conflict between the resolution of August 24 and the motion of September 1, it is one of perception only. There is no conflict if the words of the senator who sponsored the motion of August 24, Senator Kenny, are examined and given meaning and if the *Rules of the Senate* are respected.

The fact of the matter is that the committee has ordered the chair to report the bill back to the chamber without amendment but with observations, and I submit that the clear wishes of the committee members should be respected.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Does any other honourable senator wish to speak on the matter raised by the Honourable Senator Ghitter?

**Senator Ghitter:** Honourable senators, the chickens have come home to roost here. Someone somewhere is causing a little justice to be invoked in what were otherwise unprecedented and, I feel, inappropriate actions in a committee. Passing a resolution forcing closure on a committee so that it is unable to do its work properly in any kind of legislation, let alone a bill of this significance, not only demeans the actions of your committees but also prohibits them from doing their work, and we all know that the Senate does some of its finest work in committees.

My colleagues and I, during the course of the debate relative to this motion, were totally opposed to it for that reason, that is, that it would set a precedent. Remember that this was not a motion at the end of our public hearings but a motion at the start when we were still dealing with departmental officials. It was before anyone in the public had an opportunity to attend. Members of the public, at great inconvenience to themselves and at great cost to the taxpayers, came to Ottawa to speak to our committee. We had to tell them that what they said really did not matter because there was a closure motion. We could not deal with the bill appropriately as it was obvious that amendments would not be allowed.

We were then presented with this motion. Surely a chairman of any committee is obliged to deal with the wording of a motion. Had Senator Kenny meant otherwise, I will give you the wording that should have been used. It is really quite simple. The English language is not that difficult. The motion should have read that the chair put all questions to dispose of the bill no later than twelve o'clock noon Tuesday September 7, 1999 and report the bill at the next sitting of the Senate. It is a very simple wording that I or any other chairman would have understood, rather than a motion to report to the Senate no later than twelve o'clock noon on Tuesday, September 7. Clearly the wording speaks for itself. There is no magic in it.

• (1800)

I submit that the matter is easily resolved. We will call a meeting of the committee later this evening and deal with the resolution appropriately so that we can do business as usual, rather than merely subverting ourselves to the will of the majority.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, it is now six o'clock. Is it your wish that I not see the clock?

**Some Hon. Senators:** Agreed.

**Some Hon. Senators:** No.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, I have not yet been asked to rule. The matter is not in my hands; it is before the Senate. A proposal has been made by a senator, and I must await the decision of the Senate.

**Senator Carstairs:** Your Honour, there is agreement on all sides not to see the clock.

**Hon. Senators:** Agreed.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** The matter is not yet in my hands, but a proposal has been made by the chairman of the committee that the committee meet later this evening.

Is there a disposition to accept that proposal?

**Senator Kenny:** Honourable senators, I believe that a reasonable case has been made that the chair of the committee make his report now. The report is available and he has copies of it.

I move that His Honour order the chairman of the committee to make such a report.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** I cannot accept that motion. It would require notice.

[Earlier]

### VISITORS IN THE GALLERY

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, I draw your attention to the presence in the gallery of a delegation from the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe Committee on the Environment, Regional Planning and Local Authorities.

[Translation]

The delegation, headed by Mr. Akçali, is engaged in a forestry fact-finding tour across Canada. They will be visiting Quebec, Ontario and British Columbia. On behalf of all my colleagues, I welcome you to the Senate of Canada.

[English]

### PUBLIC SECTOR PENSION INVESTMENT BOARD BILL

REPORT OF COMMITTEE

**Hon. Michael Kirby,** Chairman of the Standing Senate Committee on Banking, Trade and Commerce, presented the following report:

Tuesday, September 7, 1999

The Standing Senate Committee on Banking, Trade and Commerce has the honour to present its

### TWENTY-EIGHTH REPORT

Your Committee, to which was referred Bill C-78, to establish the Public Sector Pension Investment Board, to amend the Public Service Superannuation Act, the Canadian Forces Superannuation Act, the Royal Canadian Mounted Police Superannuation Act, the Defence Services Pension Continuation Act, the Royal Canadian Mounted Police Pension Continuation Act, the Members of Parliament Retiring Allowances Act and the Canada Post Corporation Act and to make a consequential amendment to another Act, has examined the said Bill in obedience to its Order of Reference dated Thursday, June 17, 1999, and now reports the same without amendment, but with observations which are appended to this report.

Respectfully submitted,

MICHAEL KIRBY  
*Chairman*

(For text of appendix see Appendix to today's Journals of the Senate.)

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Honourable senators, when shall this bill be read the third time?

**Senator Kirby:** With leave, honourable senators, later this day.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Is leave is granted, honourable senators?

**Some Hon. Senators:** Yes.

**Some Hon. Senators:** No.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** There is no leave.

On motion of Senator Kirby, bill placed on the Orders of the Day for third reading at the next sitting of the Senate.

### PRESENT STATE AND FUTURE OF FORESTRY

REPORT OF AGRICULTURE AND FORESTRY COMMITTEE  
ON STUDY TABLED

**Hon. Nicholas W. Taylor:** Honourable senators, I wish to inform the Senate that pursuant to the order of reference adopted by the Senate on November 18, 1997, and as amended on November 24, 1998, the tenth report of the Standing Senate Committee on Agriculture and Forestry, entitled "Competing Realities: The Boreal Forest At Risk" was deposited with the Clerk of the Senate on June 28, 1999.

On motion of Senator Taylor, report placed on the Orders of the Day for consideration at the next sitting of the Senate.

**PRESENT STATE AND FUTURE OF AGRICULTURE**REPORT OF AGRICULTURE AND FORESTRY COMMITTEE  
ON STUDY TABLED

**Hon. Nicholas W. Taylor:** Honourable senators, I wish to inform the Senate that, pursuant to the order of reference adopted by the Senate on November 18, 1997 and as amended on November 24, 1998, the eleventh report of the Standing Senate Committee on Agriculture and Forestry entitled "The Way Ahead: Canadian Agriculture Priorities in the Millennium Round" was deposited with the Clerk of the Senate on August 4, 1999.

**FOREIGN AFFAIRS**COMMITTEE AUTHORIZED TO MEET  
DURING SITTING OF THE SENATE

**Hon. John B. Stewart:** Honourable senators, with leave of the Senate and notwithstanding rule 58(1)(a), I move:

That the Standing Senate Committee on Foreign Affairs have power to sit at 3:15 p.m. tomorrow, Wednesday, September 8, 1999, even though the Senate may then be sitting, and that rule 95(4) be suspended in relation thereto.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Is leave granted, honourable senators?

**Hon. Senators:** Agreed.

Motion agreed to.

**NUCLEAR ARMS**NOTICE OF MOTION TO URGE NUCLEAR WEAPONS STATES  
TO TAKE WEAPONS OFF ALERT STATUS

**Hon. Douglas Roche:** Honourable senators, I give notice that at the next sitting of the Senate I will move:

That the Senate recommends that the Government of Canada urge the nuclear weapons states, plus India, Pakistan and Israel, to take all of their nuclear forces off alert status as soon as possible.

**ABORIGINAL PEOPLES**COMMITTEE AUTHORIZED TO MEET  
DURING SITTING OF THE SENATE

**Hon. Charlie Watt:** Honourable senators, with leave of the Senate and notwithstanding the rule 58(1)(a), I move:

That the Standing Committee on Aboriginal People have the power to sit at 5:30 p.m. tomorrow, Wednesday, September 8, 1999, even though the Senate may then be sitting, and that rule 95(4) be suspended in relation thereto.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Is leave granted, honourable senators?

**Hon. Senators:** Agreed.

Motion agreed to.

**SOCIAL AFFAIRS, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY**COMMITTEE AUTHORIZED TO MEET  
DURING SITTING OF THE SENATE

**Hon. Lowell Murray:** Honourable senators, encouraged by the response to several similar motions today, with leave of the Senate and notwithstanding rule 58(1)(a), I move:

That the Standing Senate Committee on Social Affairs, Science and Technology have the power to sit at 3:30 p.m. tomorrow, Wednesday, September 8, 1999, even though the Senate may then be sitting, and that rule 95(4) be suspended thereto.

• (1810)

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Is leave granted, honourable senators?

**Hon. Senators:** Agreed.

Motion agreed to.

**POST-SECONDARY EDUCATION**

## FINANCIAL BURDEN TO STUDENTS—NOTICE OF INQUIRY

**Hon. Norman K. Atkins:** Honourable senators, I give notice that on Tuesday, September 21, 1999, I shall call the attention of the Senate to the financing of post-secondary education in Canada and particularly that portion of the financing that is borne by students, with a view to developing policies that will address and alleviate the debt load which post-secondary students are being burdened with in Canada.

**IMMIGRATION**

## PLIGHT OF CHINESE IMMIGRANTS ON WEST COAST

**Hon. Vivienne Poy:** Honourable senators, I give notice that, on September 9, 1999, I will call the attention of the Senate to the plight of Chinese migrants on the B.C. coast.

**CANADIAN ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION BILL,  
1999**

## PRESENTATION OF PETITION

**Hon. Mira Spivak:** Honourable senators, I have the honour to the present to the Senate a petition signed by 5,173 Canadian residents from every province in our country. They urge senators to amend Bill C-32; and, at a minimum, to restore measures that were removed at report stage in the other place, to protect their health and the health of their families.

## QUESTION PERIOD

### TRANSPORTATION

DISCUSSIONS BETWEEN AIR CANADA AND CANADIAN AIRLINES—TABLING BEFORE PARLIAMENT OF INSTRUCTION FROM MINISTER —GOVERNMENT POSITION

**Hon. Noël A. Kinsella (Deputy Leader of the Opposition):** Honourable senators, my question is addressed to the Leader of the Government in the Senate. During the summer recess, Canadians were informed by the government that, under the provisions of the Canada Transportation Act, a special order would be adopted. Pursuant to that order, the national airlines had 90 days within which to carry on discussions.

I have read the act, honourable senators. Section 47 not only gives the authority to the Governor in Council to make such an order but also section 47(4) provides that the minister shall cause any order made under this section to be laid before both Houses of Parliament.

Can the Leader of the Government in the Senate advise us whether it is his intention to table this order in the Senate this week, or on Monday or Tuesday of next week, since the act provides that it must be tabled within seven sitting days?

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, I shall certainly undertake to do so. I thank Senator Kinsella for bringing the matter to my attention.

AIR CANADA—PRIVATE SECTOR PROPOSAL—  
REQUEST FOR DETAILS

**Hon. Noël A. Kinsella (Deputy Leader of the Opposition):** Honourable senators, can the minister outline for the Senate the government's policy with reference to this private sector proposal respecting Air Canada?

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, the Government of Canada has created a special and time-limited process to allow private sector parties to develop proposals to restructure and strengthen the industry, and to preserve the ability of the industry to serve the travelling public in the long term.

The government does not have to, nor does it intend to, comment on the specifics of any private sector proposal until there is an agreement between all the parties involved.

**Senator Kinsella:** Honourable senators, as Canadians know, within a matter of days of this order being emitted by the government, Onex presented a fairly complex and detailed proposal. Therefore, many Canadians are wondering whether the Onex bid was made after prior consultations with the government. To put it the other way: What knowledge did the government have about the Onex bid before the section 47 order was issued?

**Senator Graham:** Honourable senators, I am not aware of any prior consultation that took place. However, I shall be happy to bring this matter to the attention of my colleagues and make the appropriate inquiries.

**Senator Kinsella:** Honourable senators, in making that inquiry, could the minister also ascertain whether or not the government knew that Air Canada had not been consulted? To what extent was this section 47 order somewhat of a blindside for Air Canada?

**Senator Graham:** Honourable senators, I am not aware of that, as I have not been party to the negotiations or to any discussions that may have taken place. I shall seek as much information as possible for my honourable friend.

[*Translation*]

### THE FRANCOPHONIE SUMMIT

MEETING HELD IN MONCTON, NEW BRUNSWICK EXCLUSION OF ACADIAN PARLIAMENTARIANS FROM NOVA SCOTIA

**Hon. Gerald J. Comeau:** Honourable senators, I would first like to congratulate the Leader of the Government in the Senate on the fine words he had for the Acadians, especially in the swearing in of Senator Perry. I also congratulate Senator Poulin, who spoke of the Acadian family on the occasion of the Francophonie Summit.

My question in fact concerns the summit. Could the Leader of the Government explain why Acadian parliamentarians from Nova Scotia were excluded from the Canadian parliamentary delegation to this summit? Nova Scotia is the only province of Canada where francophone parliamentarians were excluded.

[*English*]

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, I am not aware of who was responsible for compiling the invitation list. If, indeed, that is the case, it would be a regrettable omission, and I apologize to the Honourable Senator Comeau. I was not aware that he had not been invited. I was aware that Senator Losier-Cool was in attendance and that she was a valued member of the delegation.

I shall make further enquiries. I do not believe that anyone would be excluded deliberately. I think that it was probably an error of omission.

On behalf of the government, I hasten to apologize. I regret any feelings that may have been prompted by such a lack of due diligence. I shall make the appropriate enquiries.

[*Translation*]

**Senator Comeau:** Honourable senators, I would point out to the Leader of the Government in the Senate that eight parliamentarians from Quebec, six from Ontario, nine from New Brunswick and one from Manitoba were present at the summit. I was aware of this delegation. I myself telephoned the office of Minister Boudria, the Leader of the Government in the House of Commons, and the Prime Minister's Office. I was told that there would be no Nova Scotian francophones, Acadians from Grand-Pré, Port-Royal and the deportation region, an area the Leader of the Government is very familiar with, and

where, in every century, Acadians have been dealt tragic blows. The star on the Acadian tricolour has not shined so brightly, since Mr. Chrétien's decision. The PMO was aware. I pointed out that, if I was not an acceptable delegate, a second Acadian from Nova Scotia, Mark Muise, a member of the House of Commons, might be. The word from the Prime Minister was not to meddle in this. The delegation had been chosen. There would be no representatives from Nova Scotia. Were you not aware of this decision, and if not, why?

[English]

• (1820)

**Senator Graham:** No, I certainly was not aware of the decision. I only wish that when the Honourable Senator Comeau was telephoning Minister Duhamel's office and other ministerial offices, he had contacted me. I would have made every effort, as he would know, to ensure that any Nova Scotia senators, or any other senators who desired to attend would indeed be included on the invitation list. Again, I apologize for any omission that may have taken place in this respect.

[Translation]

**Senator Comeau:** Honourable senators, there were dancers and singers from Nova Scotia as part of the cultural events surrounding the summit. Nova Scotia's parliamentarians also want to take part in the talks. I would ask you to remember that in future.

[English]

## UNITED NATIONS

### CONFLICT IN EAST TIMOR—POSSIBILITY OF SENDING PEACEKEEPING TROOPS—GOVERNMENT POSITION

**Hon. Douglas Roche:** Honourable senators, this question is addressed to the Leader of the Government in the Senate and concerns the tragic situation in East Timor. Bearing in mind Canada's special responsibility as a member of the UN Security Council, and conscious of the bloodbath taking place and the atrocities that rogue militia forces are now committing against the people of East Timor who have just voted for independence, what is the position of the Government of Canada with respect to the formation of what has been called a "coalition of the willing" for ground troops to enforce peace in East Timor?

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, at the UN Security Council, Canada has consistently argued for the need to impress upon the Indonesian government its responsibility for maintaining peace in East Timor. This responsibility, which forms part of the May 5 agreement, includes the protection of all UN personnel as well as the people of East Timor. Canada has requested that the Security Council and the Secretary-General look at contingency plans for UN action.

**Senator Roche:** Then, honourable senators, I must ask: What criteria is the government using to determine how Canada will speak and take action at the Security Council, bearing in mind that Canada went so far as to participate in the bombing of Kosovo in order to stop the brutalization of human beings in that area? Now there is another example of a culture of violence. What is the determining factor with respect to when Canada will act in such cases?

**Senator Graham:** Honourable senators, I wish to assure the honourable senator that Canada is acting. As I indicated, we are making special representations at the United Nations. Incidentally, I should say we are absolutely appalled by the continuing violence in East Timor. We have conveyed this message clearly to the Indonesians, and continue to press the subject with them at all levels.

Foreign Minister Lloyd Axworthy has spoken, both yesterday and today, with Australian Foreign Minister Downer and with British Foreign Secretary Cook concerning the situation in East Timor and the need for further action. I understand that Canada is exploring the possibility that like-minded countries can meet this week on what might be called the margins of the APEC meeting in New Zealand to discuss the situation in East Timor and possible international action and assistance. All of this is with the understanding, of course, that any assistance would need the agreement of the Indonesian government.

### CONFLICT IN EAST TIMOR—POSSIBILITY OF SENDING PEACEKEEPING TROOPS—AVAILABILITY OF RESOURCES— GOVERNMENT POSITION

**Hon. J. Michael Forrestall:** Honourable senators, I think Canada has already gone somewhat further than the Leader of the Government is indicating. There have been communications from the United Nations today indicating that Canada has committed itself, together with Australia, New Zealand, Britain, and a handful of other, I suppose, like-minded nations.

I have the following questions: How many troops has Canada committed, or has that decision been taken yet? If it has, where will these troops come from? Out of what reserve will we find our share of the 5,000 to 7,000 troops for that war-torn area?

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, I am not aware that any decision has been made with respect to a specific number of troops. Should the current arrangement collapse, it is only prudent for the Security Council and the United Nations to begin contingency planning for a potential peacekeeping operation, and that is what is currently taking place. Certainly, as Senator Forrestall indicated, the United Nations, at the urging of Canada and other nations, would consider the establishment of such a task force. Canada would consider participation in a UN peacekeeping mission in East Timor, based on a range of considerations including the consent of the parties, security, and the current resources available to the government. As honourable senators might understand, an assessment is being made as to what resources might be available, in terms of equipment and personnel. I will be happy to bring in a report as soon as one is available.



## FOREIGN AFFAIRS

### RESOLUTION OF CONFLICT IN EAST TIMOR—POSSIBLE INVOLVEMENT OF GOVERNMENT IN TALKS WITH INDONESIA

**Hon. J. Michael Forrestall:** Honourable senators, I should like this to be clear: What is Canada doing with respect to the Indonesian government? Are we having direct talks with them, or are we relying on the United Nations to carry forward this discussion?

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, I can inform the honourable senator that strong representations are being made by Foreign Minister Axworthy and others at the highest level.

### ANTICIPATION OF CONFLICT IN EAST TIMOR FOLLOWING REFERENDUM—GOVERNMENT POSITION

**Hon. A. Raynell Andreychuk:** Honourable senators, following upon Senator Roche's comments tying in both East Timor and Kosovo, I have a question. Certainly, the issues in Kosovo were known before we took NATO action. What has come about there, of course, is that the Serbs in Kosovo are being subjected to atrocities by the KLA. I believe we did not do enough thinking about the consequences before we took that action.

With respect to East Timor, is the Leader of the Government saying that neither the Canadian government nor the Canadian representatives at the United Nations anticipated the kind of violence that is occurring now? Anyone who has followed the East Timor situation would know with certainty that, following a vote for independence, there would be violence. Is the minister saying that there were no contingency plans made and no preparatory action taken, either by the Canadian government, in its consultations with Indonesia, or by our Canadian representatives at the UN through the Security Council?

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, as I indicated earlier, Canada has been monitoring the situation and has made very strong representations to the United Nations. My understanding is that a UN delegation is to arrive in Jakarta tomorrow for meetings with the Indonesian president. We will continue to monitor the situation and, as it evolves, I will be happy to bring a report to my colleagues in the Senate.

[*Translation*]

**Hon. Pierre Claude Nolin:** Honourable senators, can the Leader of the Government say how many Canadians currently reside in East Timor?

[*English*]

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** I made that inquiry today, honourable senators, and I have not yet

received the answer. I shall attempt to do so, and perhaps I can bring forward the information tomorrow.

**Senator Nolin:** When the minister was interviewed by Canadian Press yesterday, he said it would be an error for Canada to impose sanctions on Indonesia. Can the Leader of the Government give a more detailed explanation as to why it would have been an error to impose sanctions?

• (1830)

**Senator Graham:** Honourable senators, not having made the statement myself, I shall attempt to have it clarified.

## CANADIAN HERITAGE

### STATUS OF PLAN FOR PROPOSED NEW WAR MUSEUM—GOVERNMENT POSITION

**Hon. J. Michael Forrestall:** Honourable senators, could the minister tell us when the government will make an official announcement with regard to its intention to construct a new Royal Canadian War Museum? We are now being told that there is a growing concern among the people involved that the government intends to let the Royal Canadian War Museum issue die.

**Hon. B. Alasdair Graham (Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, I would be very surprised if that were the case but, again, I will undertake to bring forward an answer at the earliest possible occasion.

## BUSINESS OF THE SENATE

**Hon. Sharon Carstairs (Deputy Leader of the Government):** Honourable senators, I believe that all honourable senators would agree that we should rise now, with the clear understanding that everything will remain on the Order Paper in the order in which it appears today.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Is it agreed, honourable senators?

**Hon. Marcel Prud'homme:** Honourable senators, the honourable senator was kind enough to consult with the independent senators. I cannot speak for Senator Roche, but I believe that we would both be in agreement with that proposal.

**The Hon. the Speaker:** Is it agreed, then, honourable senators, that all matters on the Order Paper will stand, and remain in the position in which they are now on the Order Paper?

**Hon. Senators:** Agreed.

The Senate adjourned until tomorrow at 2 p.m.

## **APPENDIX**

Officers of the Senate

The Ministry

Senators

(Listed according to seniority, alphabetically and by provinces)

Committees of the Senate

**THE SPEAKER**

THE HONOURABLE GILDAS L. MOLGAT

**THE LEADER OF THE GOVERNMENT**

THE HONOURABLE B. ALASDAIR GRAHAM, P.C.

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION**

THE HONOURABLE JOHN LYNCH-STAUNTON

---

**OFFICERS OF THE SENATE**

**CLERK OF THE SENATE AND CLERK OF THE PARLIAMENTS**

PAUL BÉLISLE

**DEPUTY CLERK, PRINCIPAL CLERK, LEGISLATIVE SERVICES**

RICHARD GREENE

**LAW CLERK AND PARLIAMENTARY COUNSEL**

MARK AUDCENT

**USHER OF THE BLACK ROD**

MARY McLAREN

**THE MINISTRY**

According to Precedence

(September 7, 1999)

The Right Hon. Jean Chrétien	Prime Minister
The Hon. Herbert Eser Gray	Deputy Prime Minister
The Hon. Lloyd Axworthy	Minister of Foreign Affairs
The Hon. David M. Collenette	Minister of Transport
The Hon. David Anderson	Minister of the Environment
The Hon. Ralph E. Goodale	Minister of Natural Resources and Minister responsible for the Canadian Wheat Board
The Hon. Sheila Copps	Minister of Canadian Heritage
The Hon. John Manley	Minister of Industry
The Hon. Paul Martin	Minister of Finance
The Hon. Arthur C. Eggleton	Minister of National Defence
The Hon. Anne McLellan	Minister of Justice and Attorney General of Canada
The Hon. Allan Rock	Minister of Health
The Hon. Lawrence MacAulay	Solicitor General of Canada
The Hon. Alfonso Gagliano	Minister of Public Works and Government Services
The Hon. Lucienne Robillard	President of the Treasury Board and Minister responsible for Infrastructure
The Hon. Martin Cauchon	Minister of National Revenue and Secretary of State (Economic Development Agency of Canada for the Regions of Quebec)
The Hon. Jane Stewart	Minister of Human Resources Development
The Hon. Stéphane Dion	President of the Queen's Privy Council for Canada and Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs
The Hon. Pierre Pettigrew	Minister of International Trade
The Hon. Don Boudria	Leader of the Government in the House of Commons
The Hon. B. Alasdair Graham	Leader of the Government in the Senate
The Hon. Lyle Vanclief	Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food
The Hon. Herb Dhaliwal	Minister of Fisheries and Oceans
The Hon. Claudette Bradshaw	Minister of Labour
The Hon. George Baker	Minister of Veterans Affairs and Secretary of State (Atlantic Canada Opportunities Agency)
The Hon. Robert Daniel Nault	Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development
The Hon. Maria Minna	Minister for International Cooperation
The Hon. Elinor Caplan	Minister for Citizenship and Immigration
The Hon. Ethel Blondin-Andrew	Secretary of State (Children and Youth)
The Hon. Raymond Chan	Secretary of State (Asia-Pacific)
The Hon. Hedy Fry	Secretary of State (Multiculturalism) (Status of Women)
The Hon. David Kilgour	Secretary of State (Latin America and Africa)
The Hon. James Scott Peterson	Secretary of State (International Financial Institutions)
The Hon. Ronald J. Duhamel	Secretary of State (Western Economic Diversification) and Francophonie
The Hon. Andrew Mitchell	Secretary of State (Rural Development) (Federal Economic Development Initiative for Northern Ontario)
The Hon. Gilbert Normand	Secretary of State (Science, Research and Development)
The Hon. Denis Coderre	Secretary of State (Amateur Sport)

## SENATORS OF CANADA ACCORDING TO SENIORITY

(September 7, 1999)

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
Herbert O. Sparrow	Saskatchewan	North Battleford, Sask.
Gildas L. Molgat, Speaker	Ste-Rose	Winnipeg, Man.
Edward M. Lawson	Vancouver	Vancouver, B.C.
Bernard Alasdair Graham, P.C.	The Highlands	Sydney, N.S.
Raymond J. Perrault, P.C.	North Shore-Burnaby	North Vancouver, B.C.
Louis-J. Robichaud, P.C.	L'Acadie-Acadia	Saint-Antoine, N.B.
Jack Austin, P.C.	Vancouver South	Vancouver, B.C.
Willie Adams	Nunavut	Rankin Inlet, Nunavut
Philip Derek Lewis	St. John's	St. John's, Nfld.
Reginald James Balfour	Regina	Regina, Sask.
Lowell Murray, P.C.	Pakenham	Ottawa, Ont.
C. William Doody	Harbour Main-Bell Island	St. John's, Nfld.
Peter Alan Stollery	Bloor and Yonge	Toronto, Ont.
Peter Michael Pitfield, P.C.	Ontario	Ottawa, Ont.
William McDonough Kelly	Port Severn	Mississauga, Ont.
Leo E. Kolber	Victoria	Westmount, Que.
John B. Stewart	Antigonish-Guysborough	Bayfield, N.S.
Michael Kirby	South Shore	Halifax, N.S.
Jerahmiel S. Grafstein	Metro Toronto	Toronto, Ont.
Anne C. Cools	Toronto Centre	Toronto, Ont.
Charlie Watt	Inkerman	Kuujuuaq, Que.
Daniel Phillip Hays	Calgary	Calgary, Alta.
Joyce Fairbairn, P.C.	Lethbridge	Lethbridge, Alta.
Colin Kenny	Rideau	Ottawa, Ont.
Pierre De Bané, P.C.	De la Vallière	Montreal, Que.
Eymard Georges Corbin	Grand-Sault	Grand-Sault, N.B.
Brenda Mary Robertson	Riverview	Shediac, N.B.
Jean-Maurice Simard	Edmundston	Edmundston, N.B.
Michel Cogger	Lauzon	Knowlton, Que.
Norman K. Atkins	Markham	Toronto, Ont.
Ethel Cochrane	Newfoundland	Port-au-Port, Nfld.
Eileen Rossiter	Prince Edward Island	Charlottetown, P.E.I.
Mira Spivak	Manitoba	Winnipeg, Man.
Roch Bolduc	Golfe	Sainte-Foy, Que.
Gérald-A. Beaudoin	Rigaud	Hull, Que.
Pat Carney, P.C.	British Columbia	Vancouver, B.C.
Gerald J. Comeau	Nova Scotia	Church Point, N.S.
Consiglio Di Nino	Ontario	Downsview, Ont.
Donald H. Oliver	Nova Scotia	Halifax, N.S.
Noël A. Kinsella	New Brunswick	Fredericton, N.B.
John Buchanan, P.C.	Nova Scotia	Halifax, N.S.
Mabel Margaret DeWare	New Brunswick	Moncton, N.B.
John Lynch-Staunton	Grandville	Georgeville, Que.
James Francis Kelleher, P.C.	Ontario	Sault Ste. Marie, Ont.
J. Trevor Eyton	Ontario	Caledon, Ont.
Wilbert Joseph Keon	Ottawa	Ottawa, Ont.
Michael Arthur Meighen	St. Marys	Toronto, Ont.
Normand Grimard	Quebec	Noranda, Que.
Thérèse Lavoie-Roux	Quebec	Montreal, Que.
J. Michael Forrestall	Dartmouth and Eastern Shore	Dartmouth, N.S.
Janis Johnson	Winnipeg-Interlake	Winnipeg, Man.
Eric Arthur Berntson	Saskatchewan	Saskatoon, Sask.
A. Raynell Andreychuk	Regina	Regina, Sask.

## ACCORDING TO SENIORITY

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
Jean-Claude Rivest	Stadacona	Quebec, Que.
Ronald D. Ghitter	Alberta	Calgary, Alta.
Terrance R. Stratton	Red River	St. Norbert, Man.
Marcel Prud'homme, P.C.	La Salle	Montreal, Que.
Fernand Roberge	Saurel	Ville Saint-Laurent, Que.
Leonard J. Gustafson	Saskatchewan	Macoun, Sask.
Erminie Joy Cohen	New Brunswick	Saint John, N.B.
David Tkachuk	Saskatchewan	Saskatoon, Sask.
W. David Angus	Alma	Montreal, Que.
Pierre Claude Nolin	De Salaberry	Quebec, Que.
Marjory LeBreton	Ontario	Manotick, Ont.
Gerry St. Germain, P.C.	Langley-Pemberton-Whistler	Maple Ridge, B.C.
Lise Bacon	De la Durantaye	Laval, Que.
Sharon Carstairs	Manitoba	Victoria Beach, Man.
Landon Pearson	Ontario	Ottawa, Ont.
Jean-Robert Gauthier	Ottawa-Vanier	Ottawa, Ontario
John G. Bryden	New Brunswick	Bayfield, N.B.
Rose-Marie Losier-Cool	New Brunswick	Bathurst, N.B.
Céline Hervieux-Payette, P.C.	Bedford	Montreal, Que.
William H. Rompkey, P.C.	Newfoundland	North West River, Labrador, Nfld.
Lorna Milne	Ontario	Brampton, Ont.
Marie-P. Poulin	Northern Ontario	Ottawa, Ont.
Shirley Maheu	Rougemont	Ville Saint-Laurent, Que.
Nicholas William Taylor	Sturgeon	Bon Accord, Alta.
Léonce Mercier	Mille Isles	Saint-Élie d'Orford, Que.
Wilfred P. Moore	Stanhope St./Bluenose	Chester, N.S.
Lucie Pépin	Shawinigan	Montreal, Que.
Fernand Robichaud, P.C.	New Brunswick	Saint-Louis-de-Kent, N.B.
Catherine S. Callbeck	Prince Edward Island	Central Bedeque, P.E.I.
Marisa Ferretti Barth	Repentigny	Pierrefonds, Que.
Serge Joyal, P.C.	Kennebec	Montreal, Que.
Thelma J. Chalifoux	Alberta	Morinville, Alta.
Joan Cook	Newfoundland	St. John's, Nfld.
Archibald (Archie) Hynd Johnstone	Prince Edward Island	Kensington, P.E.I.
Ross Fitzpatrick	Okanagan-Similkameen	Kelowna, B.C.
The Very Reverend Dr. Lois M. Wilson	Toronto	Toronto, Ont.
Francis William Mahovlich	Toronto	Toronto, Ont.
Calvin Woodrow Ruck	Dartmouth	Dartmouth, N.S.
Richard H. Kroft	Winnipeg	Winnipeg, Man.
Douglas James Roche	Edmonton	Edmonton, Alta.
Joan Thorne Fraser	De Lorimier	Montreal, Que.
Aurélien Gill	Wellington	Mashteuiatsh, Pointe-Bleue, Que.
Vivienne Poy	Toronto	Toronto, Ont.
Sheila Finestone, P.C.	Montarville	Montreal, Que.
Ione Christensen	Yukon	Whitehorse, Yukon Territory
George Furey	Newfoundland	St. John's, Nfld.
Melvin Perry	Prince Edward Island	St. Louis, P.E.I.
Nick G. Sibbeston	Northwest Territories	Fort Simpson, N.W.T.
Isobel Finnerty	Ontario	Burlington, Ont.

## SENATORS OF CANADA

### ALPHABETICAL LIST

(September 7, 1999)

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
Adams, Willie	Nunavut	Rankin Inlet, Nunavut
Andreychuk, A. Raynell	Regina	Regina, Sask.
Angus, W. David	Alma	Montreal, Que.
Atkins, Norman K.	Markham	Toronto, Ont.
Austin, Jack, P.C.	Vancouver South	Vancouver, B.C.
Bacon, Lise	De la Durantaye	Laval, Que.
Balfour, Reginald James	Regina	Regina, Sask.
Beaudoin, Gérald-A.	Rigaud	Hull, Que.
Berntson, Eric Arthur	Saskatchewan	Saskatoon, Sask.
Bolduc, Roch	Golfe	Sainte-Foy, Que.
Bryden, John G.	New Brunswick	Bayfield, N.B.
Buchanan, John, P.C.	Nova Scotia	Halifax, N.S.
Callbeck, Catherine S.	Prince Edward Island	Central Bedeque, P.E.I.
Carney, Pat, P.C.	British Columbia	Vancouver, B.C.
Carstairs, Sharon	Manitoba	Victoria Beach, Man.
Chalifoux, Thelma J.	Alberta	Morinville, Alta.
Christensen, Ione	Yukon Territory	Whitehorse, Yukon Territory
Cochrane, Ethel	Newfoundland	Port-au-Port, Nfld.
Cogger, Michel	Lauzon	Knowlton, Que.
Cohen, Erminie Joy	New Brunswick	Saint John, N.B.
Comeau, Gerald J.	Nova Scotia	Church Point, N.S.
Cook, Joan	Newfoundland	St. John's, Nfld.
Cools, Anne C.	Toronto Centre	Toronto, Ont.
Corbin, Eymard Georges	Grand-Sault	Grand-Sault, N.B.
De Bané, Pierre, P.C.	De la Vallière	Montreal, Que.
DeWare, Mabel Margaret	New Brunswick	Moncton, N.B.
Di Nino, Consiglio	Ontario	Downsview, Ont.
Doody, C. William	Harbour Main-Bell Island	St. John's, Nfld.
Eyton, J. Trevor	Ontario	Caledon, Ont.
Fairbairn, Joyce, P.C.	Lethbridge	Lethbridge, Alta.
Ferretti Barth, Marisa	Repentigny	Pierrefonds, Que.
Finestone, Sheila, P.C.	Montarville	Montreal, Que.
Finnerty, Isobel	Ontario	Burlington, Ont.
Fitzpatrick, Ross	Okanagan-Similkameen	Kelowna, B.C.
Forrestall, J. Michael	Dartmouth and Eastern Shore	Dartmouth, N.S.
Fraser, Joan Thorne	De Lorimier	Montreal, Que.
Furey, George	Newfoundland	St. John's, Nfld.
Gauthier, Jean-Robert	Ottawa-Vanier	Ottawa, Ont.
Ghitter, Ronald D.	Alberta	Calgary, Alta.
Gill, Aurélien	Wellington	Mashteuiatsh, Pointe-Bleue, Que.
Grafstein, Jeremiah S.	Metro Toronto	Toronto, Ont.
Graham, Bernard Alasdair, P.C.	The Highlands	Sydney, N.S.
Grimard, Normand	Quebec	Noranda, Que.
Gustafson Leonard J.	Saskatchewan	Macoun, Sask.
Hays, Daniel Phillip	Calgary	Calgary, Alta.
Hervieux-Payette, Céline, P.C.	Bedford	Montreal, Que.
Johnson, Janis	Winnipeg-Interlake	Winnipeg, Man.
Johnstone, Archibald (Archie) Hynd	Prince Edward Island	Kensington, P.E.I.
Joyal, Serge, P.C.	Kennebec	Montreal, Que.
Kelleher, James Francis, P.C.	Ontario	Sault Ste. Marie, Ont.
Kelly, William McDonough	Port Severn	Mississauga, Ont.
Kenny, Colin	Rideau	Ottawa, Ont.
Keon, Wilbert Joseph	Ottawa	Ottawa, Ont.

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
Kinsella, Noël A.	New Brunswick	Fredericton, N.B.
Kirby, Michael	South Shore	Halifax, N.S.
Kolber, Leo E.	Victoria	Westmount, Que.
Kroft, Richard H.	Winnipeg	Winnipeg, Man.
Lavoie-Roux, Thérèse	Quebec	Montreal, Que.
Lawson, Edward M.	Vancouver	Vancouver, B.C.
LeBreton, Marjory	Ontario	Manotick, Ont.
Lewis, Philip Derek	St. John's	St. John's, Nfld.
Losier-Cool, Rose-Marie	New Brunswick	Bathurst, N.B.
Lynch-Staunton, John	Grandville	Georgeville, Que.
Maheu, Shirley	Rougemont	Ville Saint-Laurent, Que.
Mahovich, Francis William	Toronto	Toronto, Ont.
Meighen, Michael Arthur	St. Marys	Toronto, Ont.
Mercier, Léonce	Mille Isles	Saint-Élie d'Orford, Que.
Milne, Lorna	Ontario	Brampton, Ont.
Molgat, Gildas L. Speaker	Ste-Rose	Winnipeg, Man.
Moore, Wilfred P.	Stanhope St./Bluenose	Chester, N.S.
Murray, Lowell, P.C.	Pakenham	Ottawa, Ont.
Nolin, Pierre Claude	De Salaberry	Quebec, Que.
Oliver, Donald H.	Nova Scotia	Halifax, N.S.
Pearson, Landon	Ontario	Ottawa, Ontario
Pépin, Lucie	Shawinigan	Montreal, Que.
Perrault, Raymond J., P.C.	North Shore-Burnaby	North Vancouver, B.C.
Perry, Melvin	Prince Edward Island	St. Louis, P.E.I.
Pitfield, Peter Michael, P.C.	Ontario	Ottawa, Ont.
Poulin, Marie-P.	Northern Ontario	Ottawa, Ont.
Poy, Vivienne	Toronto	Toronto, Ont.
Prud'homme, Marcel, P.C.	La Salle	Montreal, Que.
Rivest, Jean-Claude	Stadacona	Quebec, Que.
Roberge, Fernand	Sauvel	Ville Saint-Laurent, Que.
Robertson, Brenda Mary	Riverview	Shediac, N.B.
Robichaud, Fernand, P.C.	New Brunswick	Saint-Louis-de-Kent, N.B.
Robichaud, Louis-J., P.C.	L'Acadie-Acadia	Saint-Antoine, N.B.
Roche, Douglas James	Edmonton	Edmonton, Alta.
Rompkey, William H., P.C.	Newfoundland	North West River, Labrador
Rossiter, Eileen	Prince Edward Island	Charlottetown, P.E.I.
Ruck, Calvin Woodrow	Dartmouth	Dartmouth, N.S.
St. Germain, Gerry, P.C.	Langley-Pemberton-Whistler	Maple Ridge, B.C.
Sibbeston, Nick	Northwest Territories	Fort Simpson, N.W.T.
Simard, Jean-Maurice	Edmundston	Edmundston, N.B.
Sparrow, Herbert O.	Saskatchewan	North Battleford, Sask.
Spivak, Mira	Manitoba	Winnipeg, Man.
Stewart, John B.	Antigonish-Guysborough	Bayfield, N.S.
Stollery, Peter Alan	Bloor and Yonge	Toronto, Ont.
Stratton, Terrance R.	Red River	St. Norbert, Man.
Taylor, Nicholas William	Sturgeon	Bon Accord, Alta.
Tkachuk, David	Saskatchewan	Saskatoon, Sask.
Watt, Charlie	Inkerman	Kuujuuaq, Que.
Wilson, The Very Reverend Dr. Lois M.	Toronto	Toronto, Ont.



**SENATORS OF CANADA**  
**BY PROVINCE AND TERRITORY**

(September 7, 1999)

**ONTARIO—24**

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
1	Lowell Murray, P.C. . . . .	Pakenham . . . . . Ottawa
2	Peter Alan Stollery . . . . .	Bloor and Yonge . . . . . Toronto
3	Peter Michael Pitfield, P.C. . . . .	Ontario . . . . . Ottawa
4	William McDonough Kelly . . . . .	Port Severn . . . . . Missassauga
5	Jerahmiel S. Grafstein . . . . .	Metro Toronto . . . . . Toronto
6	Anne C. Cools . . . . .	Toronto Centre . . . . . Toronto
7	Colin Kenny . . . . .	Rideau . . . . . Ottawa
8	Norman K. Atkins . . . . .	Markham . . . . . Toronto
9	Consiglio Di Nino . . . . .	Ontario . . . . . Downsview
10	James Francis Kelleher, P.C. . . . .	Ontario . . . . . Sault Ste. Marie
11	John Trevor Eyton . . . . .	Ontario . . . . . Caledon
12	Wilbert Joseph Keon . . . . .	Ottawa . . . . . Ottawa
13	Michael Arthur Meighen . . . . .	St. Marys . . . . . Toronto
14	Marjory LeBreton . . . . .	Ontario . . . . . Manotick
15	Landon Pearson . . . . .	Ontario . . . . . Ottawa
16	Jean-Robert Gauthier . . . . .	Ottawa-Vanier . . . . . Ottawa
17	Lorna Milne . . . . .	Ontario . . . . . Brampton
18	Marie-P. Poulin . . . . .	Northern Ontario . . . . . Ottawa
19	The Very Reverend Dr. Lois M. Wilson . . . . .	Toronto . . . . . Toronto
20	Francis William Mahovlich . . . . .	Toronto . . . . . Toronto
21	Vivienne Poy . . . . .	Toronto . . . . . Toronto
22	Isobel Finnerty . . . . .	Ontario . . . . . Burlington
23	. . . . .	. . . . .
24	. . . . .	. . . . .

## SENATORS BY PROVINCE AND TERRITORY

## QUEBEC—24

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
1 Leo E. Kolber	Victoria	Westmount
2 Charlie Watt	Inkerman	Kuujuuaq
3 Pierre De Bané, P.C.	De la Vallière	Montreal
4 Michel Cogger	Lauzon	Knowlton
5 Roch Bolduc	Golfe	Sainte-Foy
6 Gérald-A. Beaudoin	Rigaud	Hull
7 John Lynch-Staunton	Grandville	Georgeville
8 Jean-Claude Rivest	Stadacona	Quebec
9 Marcel Prud'homme, P.C.	La Salle	Montreal
10 Fernand Roberge	Saurel	Ville de Saint-Laurent
11 W. David Angus	Alma	Montreal
12 Pierre Claude Nolin	De Salaberry	Quebec
13 Lise Bacon	De la Durantaye	Laval
14 Céline Hervieux-Payette, P.C.	Bedford	Montreal
15 Shirley Maheu	Rougemont	Ville de Saint-Laurent
16 Léonce Mercier	Mille Isles	Saint-Élie d'Orford
17 Lucie Pépin	Shawinigan	Montreal
18 Marisa Ferretti Barth	Repentigny	Pierrefonds
19 Serge Joyal, P.C.	Kennebec	Montreal
20 Joan Thorne Fraser	De Lorimier	Montreal
21 Aurélien Gill	Wellington	Mashteuiatsh, Pointe-Bleue
22 Sheila Finestone, P.C.	Montarville	Montreal
23		
24		

## SENATORS BY PROVINCE—MARITIME DIVISION

## NOVA SCOTIA—10

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
1 Bernard Alasdair Graham, P.C.	The Highlands	Sydney
2 John B. Stewart	Antigonish-Guysborough	Bayfield
3 Michael Kirby	South Shore	Halifax
4 Gerald J. Comeau	Nova Scotia	Church Point
5 Donald H. Oliver	Nova Scotia	Halifax
6 John Buchanan, P.C.	Nova Scotia	Halifax
7 J. Michael Forrestall	Dartmouth and Eastern Shore	Dartmouth
8 Wilfred P. Moore	Stanhope St./Bluenose	Chester
9 Calvin Woodrow Ruck	Dartmouth	Dartmouth
10		

## NEW BRUNSWICK—10

THE HONOURABLE		
1 Louis-J. Robichaud, P.C.	L'Acadie-Acadia	Saint-Antoine
2 Eymard Georges Corbin	Grand-Sault	Grand-Sault
3 Brenda Mary Robertson	Riverview	Shediac
4 Jean-Maurice Simard	Edmundston	Edmundston
5 Noël A. Kinsella	New Brunswick	Fredericton
6 Mabel Margaret DeWare	New Brunswick	Moncton
7 Erminie Joy Cohen	New Brunswick	Saint John
8 John G. Bryden	New Brunswick	Bayfield
9 Rose-Marie Losier-Cool	New Brunswick	Bathurst
10 Fernand Robichaud, P.C.	New Brunswick	Saint-Louis-de-Kent

## PRINCE EDWARD ISLAND—4

THE HONOURABLE		
1 Eileen Rossiter	Prince Edward Island	Charlottetown
2 Catherine S. Callbeck	Prince Edward Island	Central Bedeque
3 Archibald (Archie) Hynd Johnstone	Prince Edward Island	Kensington
4 Melvin Perry	Prince Edward Island	St. Louis

---



---

 SENATORS BY PROVINCE—WESTERN DIVISION
 

---



---

 MANITOBA—6
 

---

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
1 Gildas L. Molgat, Speaker	Ste-Rose	Winnipeg
2 Mira Spivak	Manitoba	Winnipeg
3 Janis Johnson	Winnipeg-Interlake	Winnipeg
4 Terrance R. Stratton	Red River	St. Norbert
5 Sharon Carstairs	Manitoba	Victoria Beach
6 Richard H. Kroft	Manitoba	Winnipeg

---

 BRITISH COLUMBIA—6
 

---

THE HONOURABLE		
1 Edward M. Lawson	Vancouver	Vancouver
2 Raymond J. Perrault, P.C.	North Shore-Burnaby	North Vancouver
3 Jack Austin, P.C.	Vancouver South	Vancouver
4 Pat Carney, P.C.	British Columbia	Vancouver
5 Gerry St. Germain, P.C.	Langley-Pemberton-Whistler	Maple Ridge
6 Ross Fitzpatrick	Okanagan-Similkameen	Kamloops

---

 SASKATCHEWAN—6
 

---

THE HONOURABLE		
1 Herbert O. Sparrow	Saskatchewan	North Battleford
2 Reginald James Balfour	Regina	Regina
3 Eric Arthur Berntson	Saskatchewan	Saskatoon
4 A. Raynell Andreychuk	Regina	Regina
5 Leonard J. Gustafson	Saskatchewan	Macoun
6 David Tkachuk	Saskatchewan	Saskatoon

---

 ALBERTA—6
 

---

THE HONOURABLE		
1 Daniel Phillip Hays	Calgary	Calgary
2 Joyce Fairbairn, P.C.	Lethbridge	Lethbridge
3 Ronald D. Ghitter	Alberta	Calgary
4 Nicholas William Taylor	Sturgeon	Bon Accord
5 Thelma J. Chalifoux	Alberta	Morinville
6 Douglas James Roche	Edmonton	Edmonton

---

---



---

 SENATORS BY PROVINCE AND TERRITORY
 

---



---

 NEWFOUNDLAND—6
 

---



---

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
1 Philip Derek Lewis	St. John's	St. John's
2 C. William Doody	Harbour Main-Bell Island	St. John's
3 Ethel Cochrane	Newfoundland	Port-au-Port
4 William H. Rompkey, P.C.	Newfoundland	North West River, Labrador
5 Joan Cook	Newfoundland	St. John's
6 George Furey	Newfoundland	St. John's

---

 NORTHWEST TERRITORIES—1
 

---



---

THE HONOURABLE		
1 Nick G. Sibbeston	Northwest Territories	Fort Simpson

---

 NUNAVUT—1
 

---



---

THE HONOURABLE		
1 Willie Adams	Nunavut	Rankin Inlet

---

 YUKON TERRITORY—1
 

---



---

THE HONOURABLE		
1 Ione Christensen	Yukon Territory	Whitehorse

---

**DIVISIONAL SENATORS**

---

---

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE		
1 Normand Grimard .....	Quebec .....	Noranda, Que.
2 Thérèse Lavoie-Roux .....	Quebec .....	Montreal, Que.

---

**ALPHABETICAL LIST OF STANDING, SPECIAL AND JOINT COMMITTEES**

(As of September 7, 1999)

\*Ex Officio Member

**ABORIGINAL PEOPLES**

<b>Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Watt</b>	<b>Deputy Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Johnson</b>
Honourable Senators:			
Adams,	Comeau,	Johnson,	St. Germain,
Andreychuk,	Gill,	*Lynch-Staunton,	Watt.
Austin,	Graham,	(or Kinsella)	
Chalifoux,	(or Carstairs)	Pearson,	

*Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection*

*Adams, Andreychuk, Austin, Beaudoin, Doody, Forest, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Johnson*

*\*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Marchand, Pearson, Taylor, Twinn, Watt.*

**AGRICULTURE AND FORESTRY**

<b>Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Gustafson</b>	<b>Deputy Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator</b>
Honourable Senators:			
Chalifoux,	Gustafson,	Rivest,	Spivak,
Fairbairn,	Hays,	Robichaud,	Stratton,
*Graham,	*Lynch-Staunton,	( <i>Saint-Louis-de-Kent</i> )	Taylor.
(or Carstairs)	(or Kinsella)	Rossiter,	
		Sparrow,	

*Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection*

*Bryden, Callbeck, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Gustafson, Hays, \*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting),*

*Rivest, Robichaud (Saint-Louis-de-Kent), Rossiter, Sparrow, Spivak, Stratton, Taylor, Whelan.*

**SUBCOMMITTEE ON BOREAL FOREST**  
(Agriculture and Forestry)

<b>Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Taylor</b>	<b>Deputy Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Spivak</b>
Honourable Senators:			
Chalifoux,	*Lynch-Staunton,	Robichaud,	Stratton,
*Graham,	(or Kinsella)	( <i>Saint-Louis-de-Kent</i> )	Taylor.
(or Carstairs)		Spivak,	

**BANKING, TRADE AND COMMERCE**

<b>Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Kirby</b>	<b>Deputy Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Tkachuk</b>
Honourable Senators:			
Angus,	Hervieux-Payette,	Kolber,	Meighen,
Callbeck,	Kelleher,	Kroft,	Oliver,
De Bané,	Kenny,	*Lynch-Staunton,	Tkachuk.
*Graham,	Kirby,	(or Kinsella)	
(or Carstairs)			

*Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection*

*Angus, Austin, Callbeck, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Hervieux-Payette, Kelleher, Kirby, Kolber, \*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Meighen, Oliver, Stanbury, Stewart, Tkachuk.*

---

**ENERGY, THE ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

<b>Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Ghitter</b>	<b>Deputy Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Taylor</b>
Honourable Senators:			
Adams,	Cook,	Hays,	Nolin,
Buchanan,	Ghitter,	Hervieux-Payette,	Poulin,
Chalifoux,	*Graham,	Lynch-Staunton,	Spivak,
Cochrane,	(or Carstairs)	(or Kinsella)	Taylor.

*Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection*

*Buchanan, Butts, Cochrane, Ghitter, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Gustafson, Hays, Kirby, \*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Spivak, Stanbury, Rompkey, Taylor, Watt.*

---

**FISHERIES**

<b>Chair:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Comeau</b>	<b>Deputy Chairman:</b>	<b>Honourable Senator Perrault</b>
Honourable Senators:			
Adams,	*Graham,	Mahovlich,	Robertson,
Comeau,	(or Carstairs)	Meighen,	Robichaud,
Cook,	*Lynch-Staunton,	Perrault,	( <i>Saint-Louis-de-Kent</i> )
	(or Kinsella)		Stewart.

*Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection*

*Adams, Butts, Carney, Comeau, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Jessiman, Losier-Cool, \*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Meighen, Perrault, Petten, Robichaud (Saint-Louis-de-Kent), Rossiter, Stewart.*

---



### FOREIGN AFFAIRS

**Chair: Honourable Senator Stewart**

Honourable Senators:

Andreychuk,	De Bané,
Bolduc,	Di Nino,
Carney,	Grafstein,
Corbin,	

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Andreychuk**

*Graham,	Robertson,
(or Carstairs)	Stewart,
Losier-Cool	Stollery.
*Lynch-Staunton,	
(or Kinsella)	

*Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection*

*Andreychuk, Bacon, Bolduc, Carney, Corbin, De Bané, Doody, Grafstein, \*Graham (or Carstairs), \*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), MacDonald, Stewart, Stollery, Whelan.*

### INTERNAL ECONOMY, BUDGETS AND ADMINISTRATION

**Chair: Honourable Senator Rompkey**

Honourable Senators:

Bryden,	*Graham,
De Bané,	(or Carstairs)
DeWare,	Kinsella,
Di Nino,	LeBreton,
Forrestall,	*Lynch-Staunton,
	(or Kinsella)

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Nolin**

Maheu,	Robichaud,
Milne,	(Saint-Louis-de-Kent)
Nolin,	Rompkey,
Poulin,	Stollery,
	Taylor.

*Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection*

*Atkins, Callbeck, De Bané, DeWare, Di Nino, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Kinsella, LeBreton, \*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Maheu, Nolin, Poulin, Robichaud (Saint-Louis-de-Kent), Rompkey, Stollery, Taylor, Wood.*

### LEGAL AND CONSTITUTIONAL AFFAIRS

**Chair: Honourable Senator Milne**

Honourable Senators:

Andreychuk,	Eyton,
Beaudoin,	Fraser,
Bryden,	*Graham,
Buchanan,	(or Carstairs),

**Acting Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Nolin**

Lewis,	Nolin,
*Lynch-Staunton,	Pearson,
(or Kinsella)	Pépin.
Milne,	
Moore,	

*Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection*

*Beaudoin, Cogger, Doyle, Gigantès, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Jessiman, Lewis, Losier-Cool, \*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Milne, Moore, Nolin, Pearson, Watt.*

---

**LIBRARY OF PARLIAMENT (Joint)**
**Joint Chair: Honourable Senator Robichaud**

Honourable Senators:

Bolduc,

Grimard,

Kroft,

**Deputy Chairman:**

Losier-Cool,

Robichaud,

*(L'Acadie-Acadia).*
***Original Members agreed to by Motion of the Senate***
*Bolduc, Corbin, DeWare, Doyle, Gigantès, Grafstein, Robichaud (L'Acadie-Acadia).*


---

**NATIONAL FINANCE**
**Chair: Honourable Senator Stratton**

Honourable Senators:

Bolduc,

Ferretti Barth,

Cook,

Fraser,

Cools,

\*Graham,

Eyton,

*(or Carstairs)*
**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Cools**

Johnstone,

Mahovlich,

Lavoie-Roux,

Moore,

\*Lynch-Staunton,

St. Germain,

*(or Kinsella)*

Stratton.

***Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection***
*Bolduc, Cools, Eyton, Ferretti Barth, Forest, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Lavoie-Roux,  
\*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Mercier, Moore, Poulin, St. Germain, Sparrow, Stratton.*


---

**SUBCOMMITTEE ON CANADA'S EMERGENCY AND DISASTER PREPAREDNESS  
(National Finance)**
**Chair: Honourable Senator Stratton**

Honourable Senators:

Cook,

Ferretti Barth,

\*\*Cools,

Fraser,

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Fraser**

\*Graham,

\*Lynch-Staunton,

*(or Carstairs)**(or Kinsella)*

Lavoie-Roux,

Stratton.

**\*\**(ex officio member as decided by the National Finance Committee on March 24, 1999)***


---

### OFFICIAL LANGUAGES (Joint)

**Joint Chair: Honourable Senator Losier-Cool**

Honourable Senators:

Beaudoin,

Fraser,

Gauthier,

Kinsella,

**Deputy Chair:**

Losier-Cool,

Rivest,

Robichaud,

*(L'Acadie-Acadia).*
***Original Members agreed to by Motion of the Senate***

*Beaudoin, Gauthier, Kinsella, Losier-Cool, Pépin, Rivest, Robichaud (L'Acadie-Acadia)  
Robichaud (Saint-Louis-de-Kent), Simard.*

---

### PRIVILEGES, STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

**Chair: Honourable Senator Maheu**

Honourable Senators:

Andreychuk,

Atkins,

Bacon,

Beaudoin,

Cook,

Cools,

DeWare,

Grafstein,

\*Graham,  
(or Carstairs)
**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Robertson**

Joyal,

Kelly,

\*Lynch-Staunton,  
(or Kinsella)

Maheu,

Rossiter,

Sparrow,

Stollery.

***Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection***

*Bosa, Corbin, Doyle, Grafstein, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Grimard, Kelly, Lewis,  
\*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Maheu, Marchand,  
Milne, Pearson, Petten, Robertson, Rossiter.*

---

### SCRUTINY OF REGULATIONS (Joint)

**Joint Chair: Honourable Senator Hervieux-Payette**

Honourable Senators:

Grimard,

Hervieux-Payette,

**Deputy Chair:**

Kelly,

Moore.

***Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection***

*Cogger, Ferretti Barth, Grimard, Hervieux-Payette, Kelly, Lewis, Mercier, Moore.*

---

## SELECTION

**Chair: Honourable Senator**

Honourable Senators:

Atkins, Grafstein,  
DeWare, \*Graham,  
Fairbairn, (or Carstairs)  
Kinsella,

**Deputy Chair:**

\*Lynch-Staunton,  
(or Kinsella)  
Mercier, Pépin,  
Robichaud,  
(*L'Acadie-Acadia*).

***Original Members agreed to by Motion of the Senate***

*Atkins, Corbin, DeWare, Fairbairn, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Hébert, Kinsella,  
\*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting) Lewis, Phillips, Stanbury.*

---

## SOCIAL AFFAIRS, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

**Chair: Honourable Senator Murray**

Honourable Senators:

Balfour, Gill,  
Cohen, \*Graham,  
Cools, (or Carstairs)  
Ferretti Barth,

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator**

Lavoie-Roux, Murray,  
LeBreton, Poy.  
\*Lynch-Staunton,  
(or Kinsella)

***Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection***

*Bonnell, Bosa, Cohen, Cools, Forest, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Haidasz, Lavoie-Roux, LeBreton,  
\*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Maheu, Murray, Pépin, Phillips.*

---

SUBCOMMITTEE ON VETERANS AFFAIRS  
(Social Affairs, Science and Technology)**Chair: Honourable Senator Balfour**

Honourable Senators:

Balfour, Cools,  
Cohen, \*Graham,  
(or Carstairs)

**Deputy Chairman: Honourable Senator Johnstone**

\*Lynch-Staunton,  
(or Kinsella)  
Poy, Robichaud,  
(*Saint-Louis-de-Kent*)

---

### TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS

**Chair: Honourable Senator Poulin**

Honourable Senators:

Adams,	Forrestall,
Buchanan,	*Graham, (or Carstairs)
Callbeck,	Johnson,
Fitzpatrick,	

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Forrestall**

Joyal,	Roberge,
*Lynch-Staunton, (or Kinsella)	Rompkey.
Maheu,	Spivak.
Poulin,	

*Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection*

*Adams, Atkins, Bacon, Buchanan, De Bané, Forrestall, \*Graham (or Carstairs), Johnson,  
\*Lynch-Staunton (or Kinsella, acting), Mercier, Perrault, Poulin, Roberge, Rompkey*

---

### SUBCOMMITTEE ON COMMUNICATIONS (Transport and Communications)

**Chair: Honourable Senator Poulin**

Honourable Senators:

Bacon,	Johnson,
*Graham, (or Carstairs)	*Lynch-Staunton, (or Kinsella)

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Spivak**

Maheu,	Spivak.
Poulin,	

---

### SUBCOMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION SAFETY (Special)

**Chair: Honourable Senator Forrestall**

Honourable Senators:

Adams,	*Graham, (or Carstairs)
Forrestall,	Johnstone,

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Adams**

*Lynch-Staunton, (or Kinsella)	Perrault,
	Roberge,
	Spivak.

---

## CONTENTS

**Tuesday, September 7, 1999**

	PAGE		PAGE
<b>Business of the Senate</b>			
The Hon. the Speaker .....	3733	<b>Present State and Future of Agriculture</b>	
		Report of Agriculture and Forestry Committee on Study Tabled.	
		Senator Taylor .....	3744
<b>Visitors in the Gallery</b>			
The Hon. the Speaker .....	3733	<b>Foreign Affairs</b>	
		Committee Authorized to Meet During Sitting of the Senate.	
		Senator Stewart .....	3744
<b>New Senators</b>			
Introduction. The Hon. the Speaker .....	3733	<b>Nuclear Arms</b>	
Senator Graham .....	3733	Notice of Motion to Urge Nuclear Weapons States to Take Weapons	
Senator Lynch-Staunton .....	3737	Off Alert Status. Senator Roche .....	3744
<hr/>			
<b>SENATORS' STATEMENTS</b>			
<b>Question of Privilege</b>			
Senator Kinsella .....	3737	<b>Aboriginal Peoples</b>	
		Committee Authorized to Meet During Sitting of the Senate.	
		Senator Watt .....	3744
<b>Nova Scotia</b>			
In Memory of Passengers and Crew of Swissair Flight 111.		<b>Social Affairs, Science and Technology</b>	
Senator Forrestall .....	3738	Committee Authorized to Meet During Sitting of the Senate.	
		Senator Murray .....	3744
<b>Labour Day</b>			
Tribute to Allan McLean. Senator Tkachuk .....	3738	<b>Post-Secondary Education</b>	
		Financial Burden to Students—Notice of Inquiry.	
		Senator Atkins .....	3744
<b>Manitoba</b>			
Thirteenth Pan-American Games—		<b>Immigration</b>	
Tribute to Volunteers and Citizens. Senator Stratton .....	3739	Plight of Chinese Immigrants on West Coast	
		Senator Poy .....	3744
<b>The Francophonie Summit</b>			
Congratulations to Organizers of Meeting in Moncton, New Brunswick.		<b>Canadian Environmental Protection Bill, 1999 (Bill C-32)</b>	
Senator Poulin .....	3739	Presentation of Petition. Senator Spivak .....	3744
<hr/>			
<b>ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS</b>			
<b>Canadian Environmental Protection Bill, 1999 (Bill C-32)</b>			
Report of Committee—Request for Further Instruction.		<b>Transportation</b>	
Senator Ghitter .....	3740	Discussions Between Air Canada and Canadian Airlines—	
Senator Kinsella .....	3740	Tabling before Parliament of Instruction from Minister—	
Senator Carstairs .....	3740	Government Position. Senator Kinsella .....	3745
Senator Kenny .....	3741	Senator Graham .....	3745
Senator Taylor .....	3741	Air Canada—Private Sector Proposal—Request for Details.	
Senator Graham .....	3741	Senator Kinsella .....	3745
		Senator Graham .....	3745
<hr/>			
<b>Visitors in the Gallery</b>			
The Hon. the Speaker .....	3743	<b>The Francophonie Summit</b>	
		Meeting Held in Moncton, New Brunswick Exclusion of Acadian	
		Parliamentarians From Nova Scotia. Senator Comeau .....	3745
		Senator Graham .....	3746
<hr/>			
<b>Public Sector Pension Investment Board Bill (Bill C-78)</b>			
Report of Committee. Senator Kirby .....	3743	<b>United Nations</b>	
		Conflict in East Timor—Possibility of Sending Peacekeeping	
		Troops—Government Position. Senator Roche .....	3746
		Senator Graham .....	3746
		Conflict in East Timor—Possibility of Sending Peacekeeping	
		Troops—Availability of Resources—Government Position	
		Senator Forrestall .....	3746
		Senator Graham .....	3746

**Foreign Affairs**

Resolution of Conflict in East Timor—Possible Involvement of Government in Talks with Indonesia. Senator Forrestall .....	3747
Senator Graham .....	3747
Anticipation of Conflict in East Timor Following Referendum—Government Position. Senator Andreychuk ....	3747
Senator Graham .....	3747
Senator Nolin .....	3747

**Canadian Heritage**

Status of Plan for Proposed New War Museum— Government Position. Senator Forrestall .....	3747
Senator Graham .....	3747

**Business of the Senate**

Senator Carstairs .....	3747
Senator Prud'homme .....	3747

<b>Appendix</b> .....	i
-----------------------	---



*If undelivered, return COVER ONLY to:*  
Public Works and Government Services Canada —  
Publishing  
45 Sacré-Coeur Boulevard,  
Hull, Québec, Canada K1A 0S9