

**CANADA** 

# Debates of the Senate

2nd SESSION

40th PARLIAMENT

VOLUME 146

NUMBER 66

OFFICIAL REPORT (HANSARD)

Tuesday, November 3, 2009

THE HONOURABLE NOËL A. KINSELLA SPEAKER

This issue contains the latest listing of Senators, Officers of the Senate, the Ministry, and Senators serving on Standing, Special and Joint Committees.

# **CONTENTS**

(Daily index of proceedings appears at back of this issue).

Debates Service: D'Arcy McPherson, Chambers Building, Room 943, Tel. 613-995-5756 Publications Centre: David Reeves, Chambers Building, Room 969, Tel. 613-947-0609

### THE SENATE

## Tuesday, November 3, 2009

The Senate met at 2 p.m., the Speaker pro tempore in the chair.

Prayers.

[Translation]

#### AFGHANISTAN—FALLEN SOLDIER

#### SILENT TRIBUTE

The Hon. the Speaker pro tempore: Honourable senators, before we proceed, I would ask you to rise and observe one minute of silence in memory of Sapper Steven Marshall, whose tragic death occurred while serving his country in Afghanistan.

Honourable senators then stood in silent tribute.

### SENATORS' STATEMENTS

### **TRIBUTES**

THE LATE RIGHT HONOURABLE ROMÉO LEBLANC, P.C., C.C., C.M.M., C.D.

The Hon. the Speaker pro tempore: Honourable senators, pursuant to rule 22(10), the Leader of the Opposition has requested that the time provided for the consideration of Senators' Statements be extended today for the purpose of paying tribute to the Right Honourable Roméo Leblanc, P.C., whose death occurred on June 24, 2009.

I would remind honourable senators that, pursuant to our rules, each senator will be allowed three minutes and may speak only once, for a maximum time of tributes of fifteen minutes.

[English]

Hon. Noël A. Kinsella: Honourable senators, the Right Honourable Roméo LeBlanc served this honourable house as its forty-third Speaker. Today, as we pay tribute to this remarkable Canadian, it is only appropriate that the forty-sixth Speaker of the Senate would rise at his desk in this chamber to salute the life's journey of one of our most distinguished predecessors. Our friend, the Right Honourable Roméo LeBlanc, was an outstanding son of l'Acadie, a distinguished New Brunswicker and the finest Atlantic Canadian to occupy the vice-regal office in Ottawa as the twenty-fifth Governor General of Canada.

[Translation]

Throughout his career, Mr. LeBlanc was known for his humility and his endless battle for French language and culture. He used his Acadian roots to show that francophones outside Quebec could succeed within Canada, and to show that francophones and anglophones could work together.

He became a prominent figure in the Acadian revival, and was known in Canada and throughout the entire world as a voice for the people of New Brunswick, regardless of their social origin.

[English]

The field of education in our province was enriched by His Excellency who began as a teacher in Drummond High School and later through the teaching of French and civics at the New Brunswick Teachers' College in Fredericton. As the New Brunswick member of federal cabinet, having served as Minister of Fisheries and the Environment and later Minister of Public Works, His Excellency was always loyal to the people of our province of New Brunswick.

Roméo du Cove was the affectionate appellation by which the young Roméo LeBlanc was known. He was born in Cormier's Cove, a small community of 28 houses. He grew up during the Great Depression. In an interview, he recalled how hunger was a fact of life for some and how food was given generously in that small community.

As a student at the University of St. Joseph's College in Memramcook, Roméo LeBlanc was a beneficiary of the wonderful teachers from Congrégation de Sainte-Croix. It was during his St. Joseph's years that His Excellency served as editorin-chief of the college newspaper, an experience that was to presage an attraction to the field of journalism, which took him on assignments throughout the world and to the role of press secretary in the Prime Minister's Office of Canada.

It was our privilege, honourable senators, to have been his colleagues in the Senate of Canada, where he served as Speaker with fairness, integrity and sensitivity. We will remember him as an intelligent, dedicated man who contributed to the well-being of his country. It was, therefore, appropriate that the leadership of a thankful nation joined with his family, friends and community to lay him at rest in his beloved Memramcook. May he be at peace in the bosom of Abraham.

Hon. James S. Cowan (Leader of the Opposition): Honourable senators, the Right Honourable Roméo LeBlanc was a fiercely proud Acadian, New Brunswicker and Canadian. He epitomized, in so many ways, the best of what this country is and can be. Roméo LeBlanc did not come from privilege. He was born in 1927 in Cormier's Cove, New Brunswick, the youngest of seven children. He grew up during the Depression on a subsistence farm. Despite the difficult circumstances, his talents and potential were evident from a young age.

People can react to life situations in many ways. Roméo LeBlanc responded with courage and optimism. Those who were privileged to know him saw these traits demonstrated over and over no matter what challenges were presented to him. Each time his chosen life path was knocked off course by events beyond his control, he turned around and set out on a new path.

This man, who ended up deeply involved in the political life of this country, began as a teacher and journalist. He used to quote an Inuit proverbial phrase — a long time ago in the future — which, as he described it, meant: Let the children see our history and maybe it will help to shape the future.

• (1410)

As a teacher, he taught others to see that history. As a journalist, he wrote down the present, creating the historical record. Later, as a parliamentarian and cabinet minister, he took that history and helped shape the Canadian future.

As press secretary to Prime Ministers Pearson and Trudeau, from 1967 to 1971, he was a witness to both extraordinarily exciting and terribly difficult times in our nation's history. In 1972, he was elected to represent Westmorland-Kent and was re-elected on three occasions. He served as cabinet minister in several portfolios under Prime Minister Trudeau, but the portfolio for which he will always be most closely associated is Fisheries. He served as the Minister of Fisheries in three of Prime Minister Trudeau's cabinets, becoming the longest serving Fisheries minister in Canadian history.

Perhaps, most importantly — certainly to him — was the moniker he acquired. He was known as the "fishermen's friend." In 1984, Prime Minister Trudeau summoned him to this chamber, where he sat for the next decade. His work as a senator focused a great deal on international activities and issues. In 1993, he was appointed Speaker of the Senate. His integrity and good judgment earned him the respect of senators on both sides of the chamber.

In February 1995, Roméo LeBlanc was appointed Canada's twenty-fifth Governor General, the first Acadian and Maritimer to serve in that position.

When he died on June 24, 2009, he left a truly extraordinary legacy: An example of a man from a small community, in a small province, who rose to the highest position in the land, never for a moment forgetting his origins or his gratitude to the many people who helped make his success possible.

He loved this country, and all that it represents, with a fierce pride. He was a deeply committed Acadian. It was his birthright and his joy. He was a proud defender of the French language. He believed in the power of government to do good. He knew first-hand how much government can help those less fortunate to do better and, perhaps, like him, achieve even beyond their dreams.

His family always came first. He loved his family with a pride and devotion that was always a joy to see. His wife Diana, daughter Geneviève, and of course, his deeply loved son Dominic, the member of Parliament for a riding that he once held, are his greatest legacy. How proud he would be to see Dominic making such a great contribution to the family business of public service.

When he was installed as Governor General, Mr. LeBlanc said, "If I am to be known for anything, I would like it to be for encouraging Canadians, for knowing a little bit about their daily, extraordinary courage, and for wanting that courage to be recognized."

More than 2,000 people travelled to the small village of Memramcook to pay their respects at Roméo LeBlanc's funeral. His life was truly extraordinary. He would no doubt have said that his achievements were only possible because of the values and convictions of the people of Canada. However, there is no question that Canada is a better place because of the Right Honourable Roméo LeBlanc.

Hon. Bill Rompkey: I, too, want to say a few words on behalf of an old friend of mine. I want to acknowledge the presence of Dominic and, of course, other members of the family, as well. As Senator Cowan has said, perhaps the best tribute to Roméo is his son, and he would be proud of Dominic's accomplishments.

I want to recollect about the sons of politicians. My own son Peter, who was two years old when I came to Ottawa in 1972, looked up at his mother when he was five years old and said, "Mom, have I been in politics all my life?" I have a picture of Dominic in Swift Current when we were down at Don Jamieson's for an Atlantic caucus. Dominic was just a boy and now he is a man, and that is the best tribute that can be paid to Roméo.

He was elected with me in 1972. We both sat on the Fisheries Committee. We discovered that, although we spoke different languages, we were the same people. I was a relatively new Canadian but I found out that this man had similar interests, and similar people as the ones I represented.

Then he went on to be minister. I want to talk about the way he ran that department. There are people here today in the gallery who were with him: Jean Haché and Joe Gough are both here, and they know — along with others — that the way Roméo ran that department was not simply as a leader and a chief but as a friend. There was a kind of cohesion in that department that, I am sad to say, I do not think we have today.

Not only could they approach the minister, but Len Cowley, who was Regional Director in Newfoundland, could pick up the phone and get through to Roméo's office. That was the kind of office he ran. He was in touch with what was happening at the local level.

I once took him down to La Scie, on the East Coast of Newfoundland, and I have to say that of all the ministers, he was the one who related to them and they related to him. Again, language was not a barrier. It was a question of personality, of character and background, and he understood them and they understood him. I will never forget that particular meeting.

I want to emphasize one instance, in particular, that I think illustrates the way that Roméo became known as the "fishermen's minister." In the 1970s, we discovered 11,000 tonnes of deep sea shrimp off the Newfoundland and Labrador coast as a result of research. Roméo had to decide how to allocate it. He allocated it by ensuring a number of those licences were put aside for the fishermen of the North Coast of Newfoundland and Labrador, even though they did not have the infrastructure.

As a result, the fishermen's co-op, the Labrador Fishermen's Union Shrimp Company, exists today because Roméo took that step of ensuring those licences were put aside so that, when they

could, they would develop them. That co-op runs all the plants along the coast of Labrador today and it is due to Roméo LeBlanc. That is why he is known as the "fishermen's minister."

[Translation]

Hon. Fernand Robichaud: Honourable senators, six months ago, with the death of the Right Honourable Roméo Leblanc, Acadia and the whole country were plunged into national mourning. To date, nearly everything that can be has been said and written about his careers as a teacher, a journalist, a politician and Governor General. Much has also been said about his values, his commitments, his talents and his numerous achievements. He lived a very full life with no regrets.

Today, I would like to talk about the person I knew. I was always impressed by his warm welcome and his empathy for people. Everyone called him Roméo. If anyone dared to call him Mr. Minister, Roméo would simply say, "Stop that."

Roméo knew the people in his riding, and they knew him. He knew how to listen to people and put them at ease. No matter who needed to be heard, Roméo took the time to meet with them, listen to them and understand their situation.

Roméo was someone who did not hesitate to put on his boots, roll up his sleeves and venture out to the wharves to see what sort of condition they were in and discuss it with the fishers. He could relate to people on their own level, listening to them and understanding their concerns. He always found the words to explain the steps to take or the solutions to problems.

Roméo loved to meet people. He was disarmingly straightforward and got along well with townspeople and city folk, officials and business people, workers and academics. He would offer his friends a bowl of stew he had made or a salad of tomatoes he had grown himself.

Roméo loved to laugh. He loved to tell lively, funny stories just as much as he loved to welcome people at home and elsewhere. Moreover, people who met him only briefly felt as though they had known him forever.

Honourable senators, that ability to be comfortable with people and put them at ease stayed with him throughout his career. That empathy for others served him very well in the highest offices in this country, which he held with intelligence, simplicity and dignity. People were drawn to his humanity and his humility.

Honourable senators, I want to join all those who have recognized Roméo Leblanc as a great Canadian who served his people, his province and his country well. Thank you, Roméo!

• (1420)

Hon. Rose-Marie Losier-Cool: Honourable senators, today I would like to bid an official farewell to a great man from my part of the country, the Right Honourable Roméo LeBlanc, who passed away on June 24.

As the very first Acadian to represent Canada when he was appointed Governor General in February 1995, Roméo LeBlanc became another powerful symbol of modern Acadia, just like Ti-Louis Robichaud before him. He showed us that History with a capital "H" can bring justice to those it once wronged.

But Roméo LeBlanc was a guiding light well before taking up his country's highest office. I remember him as an inspiring summer school teacher in Memramcook before he entered politics alongside greats such as Pearson and Trudeau.

I remember the incredible work he did for his constituents as the member for Kent-Westmorland from 1972 to 1984. They will not forget their former member anytime soon, though their riding is now known as Beauséjour and their representative is his son, Dominic, to whom I pledge my full support.

I will never forget his memorable time at Fisheries and Oceans, when he fought so hard for one of our economy's critical industries, an industry that so many Acadians participate in. He continued to defend the industry after retiring, and his name was associated with a medal awarded each year in honour of responsible fishing practices.

I know that, like me, many of you have wonderful memories of Senator Roméo Leblanc, who sat in this chamber from 1984 to 1995 and who even presided over the Senate during his last year on the Hill. When Roméo LeBlanc was appointed Governor General, it was my honour to replace him here in the Senate.

Throughout his long career, Roméo LeBlanc regularly changed titles, offices and residences, but two things remained constant and were admired by all: his big heart and his simplicity. These two qualities are typically rare, but less so among Acadians, and Roméo LeBlanc was one of their greatest spokespeople.

I thank him from the bottom of my heart for having represented us so well, and I am sure that he is still proud of us wherever he is. I will end with a line from a lovely Acadian folk song, Roméo LeBlanc's favourite and the song that was sung at the former fisheries minister's funeral, "Friends, let us leave quietly; the fishing will be good."

My sincere condolences to you, Dominic, and to your whole family.

[English]

Hon. Joseph A. Day: Honourable senators, is it one's career that defines the person, or is it the person who defines his career? Roméo LeBlanc was a wonderfully diverse person who had a wonderfully diverse career, but I suggest to you his career was more a function of his personality and upbringing than vice versa.

He was the youngest of seven children born in a small francophone community in southeastern New Brunswick. Being the youngest of seven may have explained why the other members of the family helped him to finish high school when none of them had had that opportunity. He continued his studies and obtained a Bachelor of Arts degree from the University of St. Joseph's College in Memramcook. Next, he worked in Montreal at a student newspaper and later at *L'Evangeline*, a French newspaper in Moncton. He soon returned to St. Joseph's to complete his education degree, after which he taught for a period of time until he received a scholarship to attend the Sorbonne in Paris.

He returned to Canada and was soon hired by Radio-Canada, where he remained for eight years working in Washington and London. In 1967, Prime Minister Lester Pearson persuaded Roméo LeBlanc to return to Canada and work in his office at the Prime Minister's Office in Ottawa.

Shortly after, Mr. Pearson resigned and Pierre Trudeau became leader of the Liberal Party and Prime Minister. Roméo LeBlanc stayed on with Mr. Trudeau until 1971, when he returned to work at the University of Moncton, at the time a very fast growing, French-language university.

An opportunity came for him to run for political office in 1972. The only difficulty was that his opponent for the Liberal Party nomination was also named Roméo LeBlanc. His opponent was much shorter, so we called him "little Romeo." Big Romeo won the nomination and proceeded to Ottawa, where he became a cabinet minister from 1974 until 1984, with a hiatus of nine months during Joe Clark's government.

Roméo LeBlanc is probably best known for his work as Minister of Fisheries. Honourable senators have heard many stories of him being a friend of the fishermen. I remember him well during this period as the minister responsible for New Brunswick, and how fair he was in the involvement of the federal government in the development of the Province of New Brunswick.

He served in this chamber for nine years, his final year as Speaker. I was privileged to be here in the chamber when he was sworn in as the twenty-fifth Governor General of Canada. There was not a dry eye in the gallery, I can tell you, from all my Acadian friends who were in attendance with me.

#### [Translation]

Honourable senators, Roméo LeBlanc was a gentle, modest and accomplished man, who communicated his principles of loyalty to family and society throughout his province and indeed the entire nation—very successfully. Here in the Senate, we would like Roméo LeBlanc's children, Dominic and Geneviève, to know what a difference he made to the people of New Brunswick and the rest of Canada.

[English]

Hon. Jerahmiel S. Grafstein: Honourable senators, I rise to pay tribute to the late and great Roméo LeBlanc.

I first met Roméo when I came to Ottawa in the 1960s as chief of staff to a minister in the Pearson government. Roméo was the go-to man for advice. He was available for all bushy-tailed, overeager, overambitious young assistants, as many of us were.

Roméo was an unusual man and a most unlikely politician. He was modest, almost shy, unassuming, humble and so unlike most public or, in particular, political men. He was a great listener. He was truly bilingual, or might I say, trilingual. He spoke careful, impeccable English; he was articulate in French; and he spoke grassroots Acadian. As a teacher, journalist, broadcaster, press officer, writer and speaker, he loved both the written and spoken word. He was a great speech writer and an excellent and

compelling, if modest, speaker in the Churchillian style. He was a simple man, always refusing to take credit for his many accomplishments and always refraining from the limelight. Both Mr. Pearson and Mr. Trudeau cherished the written and spoken word, and his words and advice to them were highly regarded and respected.

I will also remember Roméo as an approachable politician who had a golden gut. He did not need to read polls. He could tell you what the public opinion was on any issue. He was a remarkable Canadian who made a difference in all that he did and to everyone he met. Our hearts go out to Dominic, my friend, and to his family. His light will continue to burn brightly in our memory. Godspeed.

### VISITOR TO THE SENATE

The Hon. the Speaker pro tempore: Honourable senators, may I draw to your attention the presence, below the bar, of the honourable member for Beauséjour, Dominic LeBlanc.

On behalf of all honourable senators, I welcome you to the Senate of Canada.

#### TRIBUTES

# THE LATE HONOURABLE GEORGE ISAAC SMITH, M.B.E.

Hon. Fred J. Dickson: Honourable senators, I am humbled and honoured to stand in this chamber and respectfully suggest that we reflect now on the commitment and dedication to public service of the late Honourable George Isaac Smith, better known to most as "G.I." or "Ike."

A tribute in his honour is being presented by the Colchester Historical Society in the society's museum in Truro, Nova Scotia, from November 7, 2009 to April 2010. I compliment the officers and directors of the society for their ongoing success and commitment to delivering extensive historical programs in Colchester to its residents and visitors.

Honourable senators, I think we all agree that the Honourable G.I. Smith had a distinguished career of public service spanning almost 50 years: soldier, MLA, cabinet minister in the provincial government under Robert L. Stanfield, Premier of Nova Scotia, and senator.

From my work as a law partner of Senator Smith's in the early 1970s, and my association with his many friends of all political beliefs, I have concluded — no doubt like you, honourable senators — that he unquestionably gave of himself, always in the public interest and for the service of his country. Ike sought nothing in return.

The many accomplishments of his career can only be described by the word "excellence." Sir John A. Macdonald often spoke of the "builders of Canada." Honourable senators, I know you will agree that G.I. not only had but demonstrated all the qualities worthy of that label.

• (1430)

Honourable Senator Eugene Forsey, in describing the talents of Honourable Senator Smith, said:

Honourable senators, I cannot hope to compete in either eloquence or wit with the Honourable Senator Smith. I am moved, however, to say I think we have had another proof of the extraordinary asset that has been brought to this chamber by the appointment of Honourable Senator Smith.

Senator Forsey went on to say:

I do not mean by this to endorse every sentence uttered, but it is perfectly clear that we have now amongst us a very distinguished acquisition to this chamber.

Before his political career, Senator Smith went on active service with the North Nova Scotia Highlanders in 1939, just before the outbreak of hostilities. He continued to serve actively until six months after the end of World War II. Senator Smith had an exemplary military career achieving the rank of Lieutenant-Colonel, becoming a member of the Order of the British Empire and being honoured by the Dutch government with the Order of Orange Nassau.

G.I. embarked upon a second successful campaign following his return from military service. He joined others to rejuvenate the Progressive Conservative Party of Nova Scotia under the leadership of Robert L. Stanfield, ending 23 years of Liberal rule in 1956. G.I. was instrumental, as Minister of Finance and Economics, in carrying forward the Progressive Conservative agenda for industrial development in Nova Scotia.

Senator Smith succeeded Robert Stanfield as Premier of Nova Scotia. He played a leading role in the establishment of Medicare in Nova Scotia. As a minister, premier and senator, he played a leading role in incorporating into the Constitution those sections dealing with regional disparity and equalization.

Honourable senators, may I have two more minutes?

The Hon. the Speaker: The Honourable Senator Mahovlich.

### THE LATE MR. TED KENNEDY

**Hon. Francis William Mahovlich:** Honourable senators, I rise to pay tribute to the quintessential Toronto Maple Leaf who passed away on August 14, 2009: Ted "Teeder" Kennedy.

Born in Port Colborne, Ontario, Ted grew up with the love of hockey and was first scouted by the Montreal Canadiens at the age of 16. While that relationship was short-lived, he had a long and successful career as a centre with the Toronto Maple Leafs. During his 12 seasons with the team, he was team captain for nine years, won five Stanley Cups and won the Hart Trophy for most valuable player.

Former Leafs owner and manager Conn Smythe said that he was not a superbly gifted athlete in the way that some players were, but that he accomplished more than most of them by never playing a shift where he did not give everything he had. Others

will remember him as a great team captain, one who showed tremendous determination, resolve and constant will to succeed.

He retired briefly in 1955, only to return the following season and play 30 games. When the Toronto Maple Leafs did not make the playoffs that year, he sat out the last three games so that management could look at what he called, "the new generation to lead the team." That new generation player he sat out for was Frank Mahovlich.

After his retirement from the game, Ted coached Peterborough's junior hockey team and pursued his passion for thoroughbred racing by opening and operating a thoroughbred racing centre. He was also involved with the Special Olympics in Canada. He was named to the Hockey Hall of Fame in 1966 and was one of the first Leafs to have his number raised to the roof at Maple Leaf Gardens.

Ted was a great man and one that I respected tremendously. He will be greatly missed by the many fans who would call out on Saturday night, "Come on, Teeder!"

### **VETERANS WEEK**

Hon. Michael A. Meighen: Honourable senators, Thursday, November 5, marks the first day of Veterans Week in Canada, to be officially launched with a ceremony in the Senate Chamber the following morning. Culminating with Remembrance Day on November 11, Veterans Week gives citizens from all parts of the country an opportunity to thank our veterans and their families for their service to Canada. Veterans Week is a time to honour all those veterans who suffered injuries, risked their lives and, in too many cases, sacrificed their lives so that we might live in freedom. Honourable senators, our veterans, both living and departed, are heroes in every sense of the word. They deserve our eternal gratitude and reverence.

From those who served in two world wars, the Korean conflict and various international peacekeeping missions to those who have fought in Afghanistan, our veterans have answered the call for Canada. They have answered the call in defence of the values and principles that we have in common. They have sacrificed to ensure our way of life. In times of war and peace, Canada's veterans have done much to distinguish themselves and to inspire pride in this country. They have helped to forge Canada's identity. This is their legacy to us. It is a legacy that our men and women in uniform bravely continue today in Afghanistan.

Veterans Week is an opportunity to reflect upon those many contributions. Along with Remembrance Day, it is also a time when we can pay our respects to those veterans and soldiers who have passed on.

### [Translation]

Most importantly of all, we must take the time to remember that freedom is not free and never has been. In fact, it comes at a heavy, often tragic cost. We only need to count the tombstones of our fallen soldiers who died serving their country. We are privileged to live in a country like Canada, and we owe much, if not all of that to the ordinary men and women who have made the most extraordinary sacrifices. We must never forget them.

Honourable senators, our veterans are not looking for glory, for they have already achieved that. They simply want us to remember their comrades-in-arms, those who never made it back with them, those whom they promised they would never forget.

[English]

Honourable senators, we should take the occasion of Veterans Week to thank the families of our veterans and the families of our men and women in Canada's military for the support they give to their loved ones. The families, too, serve our country. As we pay tribute to our veterans during Veterans Week, we must be humble in the knowledge that whatever we do it can never be enough to honour those who have given of themselves so that we might have the privilege of living in the greatest country in the world. Lest we forget.

• (1440)

[Translation]

### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION

2009 ANNUAL REPORT TABLED

Hon. Gerald J. Comeau (Deputy Leader of the Government): Honourable senators, pursuant to section 94(1) of the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act, I have the honour to present, in both official languages, the 2009 annual report on immigration.

### **PUBLIC SAFETY**

OFFICE OF THE CORRECTIONAL INVESTIGATOR—2008-09 ANNUAL REPORT TABLED

Hon. Gerald J. Comeau (Deputy Leader of the Government): Honourable senators, I have the honour to table, in both official languages, the 2008-09 annual report of the Office of the Correctional Investigator, pursuant to section 192 of the Corrections and Conditional Release Act.

#### STUDY ON FEDERAL GOVERNMENT'S RESPONSIBILITIES TO FIRST NATIONS, INUIT AND METIS PEOPLES

FIFTH REPORT OF ABORIGINAL PEOPLES COMMITTEE—GOVERNMENT RESPONSE TABLED

Hon. Gerald J. Comeau (Deputy Leader of the Government): Honourable senators, I have the honour to table, in both official languages, the government's response to the fifth report of the Standing Senate Committee on Aboriginal Peoples, entitled New Voter Identification Procedures and Related Impacts on Aboriginal Peoples and Communities in Canada.

### GLOBAL CENTRE FOR PLURALISM

2007-08 AND 2008-09 ANNUAL REPORTS AND SUMMARY OF 2009 CORPORATE PLAN TABLED

Hon. Gerald J. Comeau (Deputy Leader of the Government): Honourable senators, I have the honour to table the 2007-08 and 2008-09 annual reports of the Global Centre for Pluralism and the 2009 Summary of the Corporate Plan for the Global Centre for Pluralism.

[English]

#### AUDITOR GENERAL

### NOVEMBER 2009 REPORT TABLED

The Hon. the Speaker: Honourable senators, I have the honour to table, in both official languages, the November 2009 report of the Auditor General of Canada pursuant to section 7(3) of the Auditor General Act.

ACCESS TO INFORMATION ACT AND PRIVACY ACT— 2008-09 ANNUAL REPORT TABLED

The Hon. the Speaker: Honourable senators, I have the honour to table, in both official languages, the 2008-09 Annual Report of the Office of the Auditor General of Canada on the Access to Information Act and the Privacy Act, pursuant to section 72 of both said acts.

### CANADIAN NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSOCIATION

CONFERENCE ON NATO'S NEW STRATEGIC CONCEPT: LAUNCHING THE PROCESS, JULY 7, 2009—REPORT TABLED

Hon. Jane Cordy: Honourable senators, I have the honour to table, in both official languages, the report of the Canadian parliamentary delegation of the Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association to the Conference on NATO's New Strategic Concept: Launching the Process, held in Brussels, Belgium, on July 7, 2009.

#### REMEMBRANCE DAY

### NOTICE OF INQUIRY

**Hon. Anne C. Cools**: Honourable senators, pursuant to rules 56(1) and (2) and 57(2), I give notice that, two days hence, I will call the attention of the Senate to:

(a) this year's Remembrance Day on November 11, 2009, when we shall remember, celebrate and honour the veterans of Canada, those who served, and those who fell in active combat in their assigned theatres of war particularly in World War II, in defence of God, King, and Country, Canada, the British Commonwealth and the Allied countries: and

- (b) to Canadian airmen in World War II, particularly those who served with Royal Air Force Bomber Command, being both those with 6 Group R.C.A.F., and those with the other Bomber Command Squadrons, including Squadron Leader Ian Bazalgette, and some Canadian Senators, to those Canadian airmen in arms who faced many thousands of German anti-aircraft guns nightly; and
- (c) to the Nanton Lancaster Society Air Museum, in Nanton, Alberta, and its own Canada's Bomber Command Memorial, being a wall of remembrance wherein are inscribed the names of the 10,643 fallen Canadian airmen as a monument to their sacrifice: and
- (d) to the August 15, 2009 Nanton Lancaster Society Air Museum's remembrance ceremony which also celebrated the twinning of the towns Nanton, Alberta and Senantes, France, and which ceremony was attended by the Mayors of these two towns; and
- (e) to Squadron Leader Ian Bazalgette an Albertan raised in England, who received the Victoria Cross for his courage in landing his crippled, enflamed Lancaster Bomber, with its injured crew, while successfully avoiding the destruction of Senantes, a village of 200 people, whose residents retrieved his body, hid it from the Germans and later buried him in their church yard where he now rests, fully adopted by the people of Senantes; and
- (f) to the numerous volunteers and concerned individuals whose tireless efforts preserve and maintain their Lancaster Society Air Museum, their Lancaster Bomber, and their wall of remembrance dedicated to the 10,643 Canadian airmen who fell in Bomber Command, that Command which for many years was the only Allied offensive against Fortress Europe; and
- (g) to honour, to celebrate, to uphold and to thank all the remarkable Canadian veterans for their incalculable contributions to humanity during World War II.

# **QUESTION PERIOD**

#### HEALTH

### H1N1 FLU VACCINE

Hon. James S. Cowan (Leader of the Opposition): Honourable senators, my question is for the Leader of the Government in the Senate.

The H1N1 influenza pandemic first surfaced in April. On April 27, the leader of the Liberal Party demanded that the government come up with a plan to deal with the outbreak. Health Minister Aglukkaq told Canadians that her government had "a national plan for disease outbreaks" and that they were

following it. On April 28, the next day, she assured members in the other place that the government plan "included the stockpiling of vaccines for provinces and territories."

In May 2009, the United States and the United Kingdom placed orders for the H1N1 vaccine. On July 7, the World Health Organization recommended massive vaccinations in response to H1N1. The United States, France, the Netherlands and Switzerland soon had signed supply contracts

Only on August 6, three months after the United States first placed its order, did the Canadian government finally order the vaccine for Canadians. On July 7, the WHO recommended that pregnant women receive the non-adjuvanted version of the vaccine, but this government waited until September 4, two months later, to place its order for this vaccine for pregnant women.

China began mass vaccinations on September 21; Australia on September 30; the United States on October 5; Sweden on October 12; Japan on October 19; Britain on October 21. Canadians did not receive their first dose until October 26.

Why did the government put Canadians at the end of the line? Why did the government not act sooner to protect Canadians, as other countries were able to do for their citizens?

Hon. Marjory LeBreton (Leader of the Government and Minister of State (Seniors)): Honourable senators, the government has and had a plan with the provinces and territories. The premiers, when they met in the summer in Regina, agreed to this plan. The pandemic plan was put in place by the government as a result of SARS. The premiers agreed to the plan. When the ministers of health met in Winnipeg, they agreed to the plan to follow the recommendations of Canada's public health officials that they would produce the seasonal flu vaccine. We are all aware that the seasonal flu claims a significant number of Canadian lives each year.

I hasten to point out that the Southern Hemisphere went through the second wave of the H1N1 before any vaccines were available. The honourable senator used a date for Australia, which was in effect much after the second wave of the flu had hit.

The United States, as it is clear, did not have injectable vaccine. They were using live vaccine through a nasal spray, which was not safe for any of the vulnerable groups. It was used for healthy people under the age of 49 years, with no underlying health issues. It was not administered to small children.

Honourable senators, I wish to report again that 6 million doses of H1N1 have been delivered to the provinces and territories. We are rolling out the largest mass immunization campaign in our history ahead of schedule.

### • (1450)

Canada has more H1N1 vaccine per capita than any other country. More vaccine will be delivered next week and in the weeks to follow. The vaccine is being delivered as quickly as it is being produced.

Our government and the provinces and territories jointly determined priority groups for H1N1 vaccine distribution. All levels of government agreed that the first vaccination phase would be for the priority groups only: pregnant women, children under five, health care providers and adults with underlying health conditions. There is enough vaccine available for all priority groups and, again, I urge all politicians of all political stripes to work together to support our public health officials and provincial and territorial health ministers in rolling out this vaccine.

The honourable senator asked about the unadjuvanted vaccine. We were following the advice of the World Health Organization who, in midsummer, suggested that pregnant women be given the choice of unadjuvanted vaccine. Last Friday the World Health Organization came out with an update that both adjuvanted and unadjuvanted vaccines were safe.

Senator Cowan: I have a supplementary question. In my home province of Nova Scotia, as of Friday, only 160,000 doses of the vaccine had been received by provincial health authorities. Last week, Nova Scotia received 56,000 doses. That number is dropping to 19,000 this week. Provincial and municipal health authorities have been working hard to prepare for this mass vaccination for months, yet now they are told that they will receive massively fewer doses than expected and planned, and this is as Canadians' fears over the pandemic are mounting.

Why was this government not prepared? Why are Canadians not able to access the vaccines that the Conservative government tells them they now need? The Conservative government is now saying that all Canadians will be vaccinated by Christmas. That is too late. This flu is peaking now. This is just not good enough.

I ask again: With months to prepare, why was this government not ready to address the pandemic?

**Senator LeBreton:** First, honourable senators, the advice of our public health officials is not conclusive. As Dr. Butler-Jones has pointed out, we are living in real time and situations change, such as the decision by the World Health Organization last Friday.

The fact is that there is not conclusive evidence that H1N1 is peaking. There is a view that it will not peak until early to mid-January. Let us put this in perspective.

All along, the government, working with our suppliers and with the public health officials in the provinces and territories, said that we would have a vaccine available for every Canadian who wished to take the vaccine. Initially, on the advice of public health officials, we said the vaccine would be available the first week of November. If the honourable senator will recall, the plan was that the most vulnerable would be the ones vaccinated first and that the vaccine would roll out over the months of November and December, up to the period near Christmas. This is the sound advice of public health officials. Health Canada released the vaccine and declared it safe earlier than was originally anticipated and, therefore, the government was able to immediately ship 6,015,000 vaccines across the country.

The honourable senator mentioned specific numbers in Nova Scotia, and I think in today's newspapers there is a listing of each province and how many vaccines they have, adjuvanted and

unadjuvanted. That clearly indicates there is vaccine available for the vulnerable groups. Obviously, certain jurisdictions have had some distribution problems, but there are many other areas of great success.

The government is following the plan devised by the federal, provincial and territorial health ministers, their premiers and the public health officials. The plan is working. We are the only country in the world, the first in the world, to have the vaccine available for all of our citizens. We should all support and work hard to ensure that this —

Senator Mitchell: You are making it up.

Senator LeBreton: I am not. It is available.

**Senator Carstairs:** There are six million doses but there are 33 million people.

Senator LeBreton: There were six million doses put out for the most vulnerable. There are more doses coming up this week and next week. As you will recall, this was to be rolled out over two months. Surely no one in this country believes that any government of whatever political stripe is not doing everything humanly possible to ensure that the vaccines are distributed and made available to those who are the most vulnerable. Once the most vulnerable are vaccinated, then the plan is to go to the next level.

That is what is happening and I have great faith in Dr. Butler-Jones and all of his colleagues in the public health field. They are working extremely hard but, as Dr. Butler-Jones pointed out over the weekend, we are living in real time because this flu situation changes daily, as we saw with the World Health Organization directive last Friday.

Everyone is working extremely hard. The minister is working extremely hard. The federal government and the provinces and territories are cooperating. This does not need to be a situation where people are running around pointing fingers. That is not what the government is doing. The government is working extremely hard and will continue to work hard.

Ultimately, it is Canadians whom we will work with here. I heard someone saying this is a communications problem. This is a health care problem and is only a communications problem in the minds of some. We are doing everything possible to ensure that this vaccine is distributed and that Canadians who want it will be vaccinated.

**Senator Cowan:** Senator Tardif just whispered in my ear that it is not a question of efforts; it is a question of results. That is what we are talking about.

Does the minister not acknowledge the fact that the government led these provincial and territorial authorities to believe that there would be a rollout of a certain number of doses? The provincial and municipal authorities laid out vaccination clinics and advertised those clinics based upon numbers provided to them by the federal government. The numbers were not made up by the provincial or territorial government. The numbers were provided by the federal government, and it was on that basis that the

municipal, provincial and territorial leaders laid out the clinics. It is as a result of the failure of the federal government to deliver the doses that were promised that this mass confusion and elevated concern has occurred. Does the minister not acknowledge that to be the case?

**Senator LeBreton:** Actually, honourable senators, the vaccines are continuing to be rolled out. The initial 6,015,000 doses are out there. I noticed that some provinces are now doing an accounting of how many vaccines they have actually put in people's arms. There are sufficient vaccines out there to deal with the priority vulnerable groups, and the vaccines are continuing to roll out. As soon as they are available, they are rolled out.

I was just reading in the newspaper this morning that in my own area of Ottawa they are speaking to the Ontario health authorities, telling them they have enough vaccine until the end of the week. At that time they expect the Ontario government to distribute more. The first tranche is being looked after now.

#### • (1500)

As Dr. Butler-Jones said over the weekend, after the initial rush has presented itself in the line ups, the provinces, territories and health authorities will have time to fine-tune their delivery because we are living in real time. This is the situation we are facing which requires the cooperation of all levels of government and the public.

There has been an appeal to the public not to jump the queue. There will be sufficient vaccine for everyone who wants or needs it. All levels of government must continue every effort to stay focused on this flu and provide Canadian citizens with access to the vaccine.

**Hon. Jane Cordy:** It is the responsibility of the provinces to distribute the vaccine, but it is the responsibility of the federal government to provide the vaccine to the provinces. The Leader of the Government in the Senate has said numerous times this afternoon that the provinces have enough vaccine.

In my province of Nova Scotia, the Minister of Health, Maureen MacDonald, said there simply is not enough vaccine for people who may legitimately need it. Is Minister MacDonald wrong?

Senator LeBreton: I will repeat this information again: 6 million doses of the H1N1 vaccine have been delivered to the provinces and territories. We are rolling out the largest mass immunization campaign in Canadian history ahead of schedule. Canada currently has more H1N1 vaccine per capita than any other country in the world. That is right now.

The Government of Canada and the provinces and territories jointly determine priority groups for H1N1 vaccine distribution. Obviously, the Minister of Health in Nova Scotia was part of that discussion.

Both levels of government agree that the first vaccination phase will be for priority groups such as pregnant women, children under five, health care providers and adults with underlying health conditions. There is enough vaccine out there for all priority groups. It is sad and unfortunate that this situation has been miscommunicated by spreading fear when more vaccine will be delivered next week and in the weeks to follow. Vaccine is distributed as quickly as possible and as quickly as it is produced. We are pleased that so many Canadians are heeding the call to be vaccinated against the H1N1 virus.

**Senator Cordy:** My question was, is Minister MacDonald wrong? Does Nova Scotia have enough vaccine?

**Senator LeBreton:** She is part of a federal-provincial-territorial ministerial group with the public health authorities. They are the ones who provide the information within the ministries of health.

I will have to check how many vaccine doses have been sent to Nova Scotia.

Senator Cowan: One hundred fifty thousand.

Senator LeBreton: I will make an inquiry. One thing we have been told is that several provinces have done an outstanding job of keeping the vulnerable groups as a priority. The problem has been that a couple of local jurisdictions have allowed people to jump the queue, and that situation has created long line-ups. However, most have stuck to the plan with vulnerable priority groups and there is ample evidence that those provinces are delivering the vaccine extremely well.

I remind honourable senators that we are only in the early stages of this program and we have always said that the vaccine will be rolled out throughout the months of November and December. No one would think that any situation could be devised where 30 million people could be vaccinated in seven days.

**Hon. Dennis Dawson:** We are not blaming the provinces or the agencies. We are blaming the government because we were told we would be supplied. We have the example from Nova Scotia. I will give the example from Quebec: Four hundred fifty thousand vaccine doses were coming in.

#### [Translation]

From 450,000 vaccine doses, we are now down to 160,000 vaccine doses a week. We are not blaming the province or the agencies. It is very clear that the federal government is to blame. It is just the Leader of the Government in the Senate who does not realize it. She is saying that people are misinformed. Her government spent \$100 million to talk about a budget, which, for all intents and purposes, still has not been adopted or used by the government, but it does not have enough money to inform Canadians — Quebecers in particular — about what they should expect from this government.

#### [English]

**Senator LeBreton:** That is flat-out false. By the way, we are not blaming anyone. I have never, nor has the minister or government, thrown around the word "blame."

This effort is collaborative. The provinces and territories, the ministers of health, the premiers and the chief public health officials are working around the clock to deliver information. Again today, Dr. Butler-Jones and Minister Aglukkaq are out there — every single day — informing Canadians about the situation.

With regard to the province of Quebec, a significant number of vaccines have been delivered to the province of Quebec. If you care to look for them, there are tremendous success stories coming out of the province of Quebec.

In our Ottawa newspapers and in some areas on the Ottawa side of the river certain situations seem to exhibit confusion. Yet, on the Quebec side, the vaccine is rolling out. Obviously, when they agreed to the plan public health officials, the ministers of health in the provinces and the federal government, wanted to make sure that the first delivery of vaccines were for the people for whom it was recommended by the plan.

I believe, honourable senators, if we stopped running around looking for bad news stories, there are some good news stories here. Everyone is working extremely hard. The government is working extremely hard. No one in this country, no matter what political party they belong to, believes for a moment that everyone is not doing everything they possibly can. My hat goes off to our public health officials who are out there on the front lines.

As we know, in this country the delivery of health care falls within the jurisdiction of the provinces. The provinces have been co-operating, and they are part of the plan. The federal, provincial and territorial governments deserve a significant amount of credit.

Speaking of the territorial governments, we have a situation where they were part of the most vulnerable community. They are delivering the vaccines. They are following the plan. That is why we do not have a situation in the North where people are being left out, because the territories followed the plan to attend to the most vulnerable first. That is what all the provinces and territories are doing. A few public health officials in some larger centres allowed some people to jump the queue. I believe that they now have that under control, and I expect a more orderly roll-out of the vaccine. This will continue as more vaccine is delivered every day.

• (1510)

Hon. Claudette Tardif (Deputy Leader of the Opposition): Honourable senators, in my province of Alberta, residents arrived at clinics in the early hours of the morning on the weekend to receive their vaccine, only to be confronted with signs indicating that the clinics had been closed until further notice. Albertans have no flu vaccine "until further notice."

What notice does this government need to rectify the situation in Alberta?

Senator LeBreton: Honourable senators, I saw some of the news reports out of Alberta. I repeat that 6 million doses of vaccine were sent out. When the vaccine was given approval, the provinces and territories and the federal government agreed that the most vulnerable would be vaccinated first.

Unfortunately, there have been some incidents of people jumping the queue or misunderstandings of who should be in the line-up. There have been some glitches in Alberta and Ontario, but the public health authorities, the ministers of health and the municipal health officials, are working very hard together.

As I mentioned, the vaccine is being delivered as it is produced. Everyone should work together to support our public health workers and to ensure that Canadians realize that all levels of government are seized with this problem and that, unlike most people in the world, every Canadian who wants to be vaccinated will be vaccinated.

[Translation]

Hon. Lucie Pépin: Honourable senators, my question is for the Leader of the Government in the Senate. I want to thank the leader for sending the federal H1N1 Preparedness Guide to our offices. This is a very useful document. Every Canadian deserves to have a copy of it.

The government knows that the best way to inform Canadians is to send them information at home. Last August, Canadians received information at home on the Home Renovation Tax Credit as well as an envelope to keep their receipts in. That idea might apply to H1N1.

Can the Leader of the Government in the Senate assure us that the government will correct its mistake and send information on the H1N1 virus directly to Canadians at home the way it did in August for the Home Renovation Tax Credit?

[English]

**Senator LeBreton:** Honourable senators, an information brochure was sent to Canadian households. I received one in my mailbox about two weeks ago. It provides information about H1N1 and where people can call for further information.

We are working in partnership with the provinces and territories, and they have also sent out a great deal of information. Newspapers and television are carrying many advertisements from all levels of government providing information to the public. Once the misunderstanding is worked out of the system, I believe the public will respond.

As Dr. Butler-Jones said on the weekend, public health workers will use the experience of the first week of the rollout to improve systems. We have already seen that in many jurisdictions.

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### **CRIMINAL CODE**

BILL TO AMEND—SECOND READING—DEBATE CONTINUED

On the Order:

Resuming debate on the motion of the Honourable Senator Martin, seconded by the Honourable Senator Neufeld, for the second reading of Bill C-268, An Act to amend the Criminal Code (minimum sentence for offences involving trafficking of persons under the age of eighteen years).

Hon. Lillian Eva Dyck: Honourable senators, I rise today as the critic for Bill C-268, An Act to amend the Criminal Code (minimum sentence for offences involving trafficking of persons under the age of eighteen years), which was introduced as a private member's bill by the member of Parliament for Kildonan—St. Paul, Joy Smith, on January 29, 2009.

I would like to commend Mrs. Smith for her work in trying to combat the trafficking of women and children and for her work in making this bill a reality.

The bill amends existing provisions of the Criminal Code and introduces new mandatory minimum sentencing guidelines for the trafficking of persons under the age of 18 years, but it does not address sex trafficking specifically.

I will briefly review the current legislation.

Pursuant to the Criminal Code of Canada and the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act, human trafficking became a Criminal Code offence in November 2005. The provisions dealing with human trafficking are set out in sections 279.01 to 279.04 of the Criminal Code.

Section 279.01 deals with trafficking in persons and prohibits anyone from recruiting, transporting, transferring, receiving, holding, concealing or harbouring a person, or exercising control or influence over the movements of a person for the purpose of exploiting or facilitating the exploitation of that person, and provides for a maximum penalty of 14 years to life where it involves kidnapping, aggravated assault, aggravated sexual assault or the death of the victim.

• (1520)

Section 279.02 deals with material benefit and prohibits anyone from receiving a financial or other material benefit for the purpose of committing or facilitating the exploitation of that person, with a maximum penalty of 10 years.

Sections 279.03 and 279.04 deal with withholding or destroying documents and with exploitation. I will not go through them today because there is no change in Bill C-268.

Under the current Criminal Code, there exists no distinction on sentencing requirements for offences committed against victims based on age. With regard to the Immigration and Refugee Act, which came into effect in 2002, section 118 states the following:

- (1) No person shall knowingly organize the coming into Canada of one or more persons by means of abduction, fraud, deception or use or threat of force or coercion.
- (2) For the purpose of subsection (1), "organize", with respect to persons, includes their recruitment or transportation and, after their entry into Canada, the receipt or harbouring of those persons.

The maximum penalty for this offence is life imprisonment, a fine of \$1 million, or both. The first-ever charges under section 118 were laid in April 2005, but are currently being challenged for vagueness.

With regard to the description and analysis of Bill C-268, this bill contains eight clauses, the majority of them dealing with amending subsections in order for the substantive changes to be cohesive with the Criminal Code.

The substantive changes of Bill C-268 include the following: Clause 1 amends the definition of "offence" in section 183 of the Criminal Code to include, under section 279.01(1), the trafficking of a person under the age of 18 years.

Clause 2 concerns the trafficking of persons under the age of 18 years and establishes that offences of human trafficking whereby a person recruits, transports, transfers, receives, holds, conceals or harbours a person under the age of 18 years, for the purpose of exploitation or facilitating exploitation, is liable to the following sentencing guidelines: Section 279.01(1)(a) outlines that human trafficking of a minor with the intent of exploitation, or facilitation of exploitation that is committed through kidnapping, aggravated assault or aggravated sexual assault or causes death to, is liable to a minimum punishment of six years or to a maximum punishment of life imprisonment.

Section 279.01(1)(b) outlines that all other offences of human trafficking involving persons under 18 years of age are punishable by a minimum of five years, to a maximum of 14 years' imprisonment.

Neither clause 3 nor clause 4 has any changes with respect to the Criminal Code.

It is worth noting, however, that the bill as originally presented in the other place did not contain a clause specifying a mandatory minimum penalty when the trafficker subjected the child to harsher treatment. The bill was amended in the other place to include the minimum six-year sentence when the victim is so treated.

Honourable senators, in July 2009 the Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs hosted a public forum to raise awareness about human trafficking and the sexual exploitation of First Nations women and children in Winnipeg, Manitoba.

Grand Chief Ron Evans said:

Both U.S. and Canadian government reports have shown and demonstrated that Aboriginal and First Nation women and children are at greater risk of becoming victims of human trafficking than any other group in Canada. We make a huge mistake when we turn women and children into objects for personal gratification. They are human beings and if we fail in our duty to treat them that way, it's like we are ripping strips off our own humanity.

Now I would like to go through the lessons I learned as I attended that conference, starting with the magnitude of the problem of human trafficking.

The RCMP estimates that 800 to 1,200 people are trafficked in and through Canada every year, however, many advocacy groups set the number at 15,000. Many women and children are trafficked from Asia, Eastern Europe and Latin America for sexual exploitation. This situation involves persons, primarily women and children, subjected to exploitation through force and/or coercion into prostitution or forced labour. It is important to note that most women and minors are trafficked for the sex trade.

With regard to Bill C-268, there were reasons put forward why we need the current legislation. In other words, what is wrong with the current Criminal Code and what is weak about the current legislation?

The arguments given to support the enactment of Bill C-268 are based mainly on two precedents under the Criminal Code. In both cases, paltry penalties were applied to two men who trafficked underage girls in the sex trade. In 2008, a Niagara man was convicted of human trafficking and received only three years for the offence. That man made over \$350,000 from the sexual exploitation of a 15-year-old girl.

More recently, a Montreal man was convicted of human trafficking. He was sentenced to two years' imprisonment for trafficking a 17-year-old girl and selling her for sex.

There have been about 30 human trafficking convictions since 2005 — a very small number compared to the estimated number of trafficked persons. It is important to note that virtually no discussion of the other convictions with respect to this bill has occurred so far, and I would like to see that happen during the study of the bill.

At the conference in Winnipeg, I was shocked to hear that Canada is a preferred country for trafficking people, because of our weak laws. I was appalled to hear that those who know what is happening on the streets feel helpless to stop this activity. They are helpless on those streets where men troll for sex, and where the same johns pick up the same young underage girls over and over.

Now I will talk about the process of human trafficking, because it is important for us to understand what this is all about. According to the information provided, mainly by the RCMP, we see that traffickers are very skilled in their activities. They know where to look for their victims and they know how to get them under their control. They target bus stops and malls. They target runaways, schools, group homes and shelters where abused women and our youth are housed temporarily. They know where to go.

According to the RCMP, there are three basic elements in the process of human trafficking: recruitment, transport and exploitation.

With regard to recruitment, traffickers know how to entice and lure the victim, who is usually vulnerable or gullible, and they lure that victim by various means. They offer them hope, perhaps a job, love or a new life. In some cases, the trafficker pretends that he is in love with the victim. They give them gifts. This is organized recruitment, as I said before. They target schools, malls, safe houses, bus stations, airports, playgrounds, bars and nightclubs, the Internet, and so on.

With regard to transport, traffickers isolate the victim from their family and friends to make them more vulnerable to manipulation, so that when they are alone, who will they believe? They will believe their trafficker. The traffickers exploit their victims. They know how to manipulate them and how to apply coercion and threats. Initially the trafficker is nice to the person, but as time goes on the trafficker manipulates them. For example, they showed a video where one trafficker pretended he was in love with his victim and he manipulated her so that she agreed to work as a stripper, and gradually she agreed to do more and more things until she became totally under his control.

(1530)

In addition, traffickers threaten to rape, beat, murder or traffic the victim's family members, and they may threaten to expose the victim's line of work to family or community, in which case the victim feels ashamed and therefore trapped because the victim does not know where to go for help.

We were told about the factors that contribute to being trafficked. In general, the RCMP told us there were factors such as poverty, gender, with women being more susceptible, the presence of domestic violence, the lack of social safety networks, and ill-informed families. For Aboriginal women specifically, again, we were told there is poverty was a factor. Also, among victims, there is a high rate of homeless, single mothers, a high rate of domestic violence, and the presence of addictions.

Honourable senators will notice that poverty was first on both lists. According to the *United Nations Chronicle*, "Poverty will always remain one of the root causes for women and children to be lured into prostitution and/or sex work." In addition, the United States Agency for International Development emphasized:

Trafficking is inextricably linked to poverty. Wherever privation and economic hardship prevail, there will be those destitute and desperate enough to enter into the fraudulent employment schemes that are the most common intake systems in the world of trafficking.

Honourable senators, the greater degree of poverty amongst Aboriginals makes them more vulnerable to exploitation by those engaged in human trafficking. According to the Report Card on Child Poverty in Saskatchewan, 50 per cent of Aboriginal children, compared to 19 per cent of all other children in Saskatchewan, lived in poverty in 2001. In Canada as a whole, one in four First Nations children, compared to one in six other children, live in poverty.

The effects of poverty on one's vulnerability to being exploited are exemplified by this quotation from an Aboriginal sex trafficking victim. She said:

I wish I didn't have to do this sex trade. I do it to get food for my son. It's really easy for people to pre-judge and say that people have a choice to do this, but if you don't have a home to go to or you don't have any kinds of structures in your life, it's not as easy as it seems.

In addition, honourable senators, the Aboriginal Women's Network has reported that prostituted girls and women in downtown Vancouver have experienced violence, abuse, homelessness and exploitation at disproportionate rates. Eighty per cent had a history of childhood sexual violence. Seventy-two per cent had a history of childhood physical violence. Eighty-six per cent were or had been homeless. Eighty per cent had been physically assaulted by johns. Seventy per cent had been threatened with a weapon. Seventy per cent had been raped more than five times, and this includes by johns.

It is not a pretty picture; not what they had hoped for; not the dream world that they were promised by their pimp or trafficker.

Honourable senators, there are basically three types of human trafficking: People are trafficked to work in the sex trade or other forms of servitude such as domestic labourers, agricultural workers, hotel or restaurant workers, or other forms of servitude. Sex trafficking, or the trafficking of persons specifically for the purpose of sexual exploitation, is the most common type of trafficking. In fact, the U.S. Department of State estimates that 80 per cent of all victims of international human trafficking are forced into the commercial sex industry.

In terms of child trafficking, in most circumstances, children under the age of 18 are channelled into the sex trade industry. Because of this fact, child trafficking is considered one of the worst manifestations of human trafficking.

Then we have the general category of labour trafficking, which is an act where someone engages in any conduct that may or could cause the victim to believe that their safety or the safety of someone known to them will be threatened if they refused to provide labour or any kind of work. Apparently, the definition in Canada is broad enough that it also includes the sex trade.

Honourable senators, human trafficking is a hugely profitable business. In the example that I gave above, the man who trafficked a girl earned \$350,000 from her work in the sex trade. It is believed that trafficking in humans is replacing trafficking in guns and drugs. That is how profitable human trafficking is. It is a huge problem. I cannot believe that in a country such as ours something like this goes on.

Many people and agencies support Bill C-268. Many recommendations by international and bilateral commissions, such as the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child and its optional protocol on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, have urged Canada to adopt a form of mandatory minimum sentencing for human traffickers of minors, to which this bill is responding.

For the most part, response to Bill C-268 has been positive. Member of Parliament Joy Smith, after tabling the bill in early 2009, presented the House of Commons with a petition of more than 14,000 Canadians demanding that the penalties to child traffickers fully reflect the gravity of the crime.

As of about a week ago, I received nearly 100 emails asking that the Senate pass Bill C-268 quickly, without amendment. Several of these messages indicated that the bill could have incorporated harsher penalties, but the perceived need to enact a bill before the Vancouver Olympic Games was seen as sufficient reason not to pursue this avenue. I agree that we should pass this bill as quickly as possible, but we should not do so without ensuring that the bill is sound and strong.

I will talk about the importance of Bill C-268 for Aboriginal families.

In the June 2009 Trafficking in Persons Report released by Secretary of State Hillary Clinton, Canada was identified as a "source, transit, and destination country for men, women and children trafficked for the purposes of commercial sexual exploitation and forced labour": the two types. In addition, the report commented that "Canadian women and girls, many of whom are Aboriginal, are trafficked internally for commercial sexual exploitation."

One study in particular, conducted by the Native Women's Association of Canada Sisters in Spirit program found that in Winnipeg, 90 per cent of the children being exploited in the sex trade were Aboriginal, even though Aboriginals represent only about 10 per cent of the population. Other studies have made it clear that Aboriginal children are overrepresented in exploitation.

According to the Stop Sex with Kids campaign based in Winnipeg, many First Nation children are being sexually exploited on the streets of Winnipeg. Each year, an estimated 400 children and youth are exploited on the streets. Seventy to eighty per cent of these children are Aboriginal, and 85 to 90 per cent are young girls, a terrible problem and a horrible statistic.

In Saskatoon, it is estimated that approximately 300 people turn to sex work at least once a year to make money to survive. According to the EGADZ Downtown Youth Centre, 36 Aboriginal girls under the age of 18 have been confirmed as involved in sex work. These numbers are most likely an underestimate.

According to a recent research paper by Anupriya Sethi, many Aboriginal girls are involved in exploitation, following a trafficking process that involves the movement of the girls through many major cities such as Saskatoon, Edmonton, Calgary, Regina, Winnipeg and Vancouver. The author makes it clear that though poverty is a factor that makes Aboriginal girls more susceptible to being trafficked, other factors, such as the horrific legacy of residential school abuse and the lingering effects of colonization, contribute to their vulnerability to exploitation.

• (1540)

I would now like to discuss the bill itself. Can the bill be further improved? Is the bill tough enough? Are the penalties tough enough?

Bill C-268, as it stands, has three serious shortcomings. These became evident to me when I reviewed the legislation enacted in the U.S. in 2008. First, in the United States, the Trafficking Victims Protection Act defines two categories of minors: those under 14 years of age, and those 14 and up to but under 18 years of age. This recognizes the greater vulnerability of younger minors and it acknowledges the fact that the average age at which girls are introduced into the sex trade is 12 or 13 years of age.

Second, the penalties in the U.S. are harsher than what are being proposed in Bill C-268. An offence of sex trafficking involving a person older than 14 years of age but under the age of 18 incurs a fine and a minimum sentence of 10 years imprisonment and a maximum sentence of life imprisonment in the U.S. An offence of sex trafficking involving a child under the age of 14 incurs a fine and a minimum sentence of 15 years imprisonment and a maximum sentence of life imprisonment. These are stiffer sentences in the U.S.

It is also important to take note that the American law also imposes a fine. This, too, is important to keep in mind and consider at some point in time as we continue to refine our laws on human trafficking. It is clear that human traffickers make huge amounts of money. I doubt that spending five years in prison will deter them if they are allowed to keep the hundreds of thousands or, perhaps, even millions of dollars that they have made by exploiting women, children and men.

Honourable senators, I wish that I could make a PowerPoint presentation in the chamber here with a chart that would show the differences between the U.S. law and the Canadian law — that is, the U.S. law with its two different age categories and higher minimum mandatory sentences combined also with a fine.

The third flaw in Bill C-268 is the most serious. It really undermines the bill. The main weakness of this bill is that it does not name the real problem that it is intended to address; that is, sex trafficking of children. The bill does not actually focus on stopping the sex trafficking of children. It does not contain the phrases "child sex trafficking", "child sex trade" or "commercial sex trade" or any other phrase that would indicate it is meant to stop the trafficking of children for the purpose of exploitation in the commercial sex trade. Yet, the main argument to support the minimum penalties are based on section 212(2.1) of the Criminal Code which imposes a five-year mandatory minimum sentence for the aggravated offence of living off the avails of prostitution of a person under the age of 18 — quite clearly a sex-related offence.

Furthermore, in drafting Bill C-268, Professor Perrin argues that it is important to provide Crown prosecutors with charging options that best suit the facts of child sexual exploitation involving a pimp or trafficker. Yes, honourable senators, "child sexual exploitation involving a trafficker"; and "sexual exploitation", not other forms of labour exploitation.

I urge the committee members who review Bill C-268 to examine and carefully analyze Professor Perrin's statements and their reference to section 212(2.1).

Honourable senators, we are being urged to pass Bill C-268 without amendment and to do so quickly. However, I fear that the bill in its present form will not do justice to children because it does not address sex trafficking directly. Of course, we know that most children are trafficked for victimization in the commercial sex trade, but Bill C-268 does not differentiate children trafficked for exploitation in the sex trade from those trafficked for forced labour. Those two forms of trafficking are vastly different iterms of their horrendous impact on the victim and the huge profit to the trafficker. Every person would agree that a child trafficked to work in the commercial sex trade is in a far worse situation than a child forced to work as a labourer in a hotel, restaurant, agricultural or other type of servitude.

Honourable senators, I am haunted by the memory of seeing Aboriginal girls who were only about nine or ten years old on the streets of Regina, where men drive by to pick them up for sexual services — I repeat: nine and ten years old. Surely, there is a world of difference between a nine-year-old Aboriginal girl trafficked in the sex trade, compared to a nine-year-old boy trafficked to work, for example, in the restaurant business to wash dishes or clean bathrooms.

I hope this extreme comparison indicates the serious nature of the omission of the explicit nature of the type of trafficking that the bill is intended to address, namely, trafficking for the purpose of work in the sex trade and not in just any other form of servitude. While I do not want to minimize the harsh treatment that the boy in my hypothetical scenario would face, he would not have been sexually violated repeatedly as girls in the sex trade are.

Honourable senators, the American child trafficking legislation that I outlined a few minutes ago specifically targets sex trafficking. In the name of the bill, it actually says "child sex trafficking." Somehow, this key element was missed during the drafting of Bill C-268. Certainly, it seems to be the intention of the bill to address child sex trafficking, gauging from the speeches by the member who initiated the bill, the petitioners and the general public who have contacted us. Mrs. Smith states that the victims of trafficking suffer horrific mental, physical and sexual abuse during their captivity. She further said that in Canada today, child sex slavery is alive and well and that these girls and women are destined for the sex trade. Furthermore, as noted previously, the examples used to convince us of the need for Bill C-268 are cases involving female minors used in the commercial sex trade.

The people who have contacted us, mainly through email, have taken the advice of the Canada Family Action Coalition. They virtually all ask us that the Canadian government, including the Senate, needs to be tough on crime and particularly crimes against women and children. They say things like "women and girls are trafficked." Others note that Bill C-268 would put Canada on par with Thailand's standard, a country internationally known for its sex tourism industry. All of these messages indicate that they are concerned about the sex trade, because we know that women and children are destined for the sex trade.

Perhaps it was missed during the drafting of the bill because all the evidence indicates that sex trafficking is the major type of human trafficking. One just assumes it is in the actual wording of the bill, and therefore reads it into the bill. Certainly that is what I did. After reading the information on human trafficking, I assumed the bill was targeting child sex trafficking specifically, but it is not.

#### • (1550)

Honourable senators, I feel as though I am on the horns of a dilemma. On the one hand, I believe the bill should be passed, but, on the other hand, I believe it is fundamentally flawed and soft on the crime of child trafficking because it does not contain wording that addresses child sex trafficking specifically.

How can we not name the offence of sex trafficking of children, persons under the age of 18? Until we specifically name and identify the problem of child sex trafficking, we will not be able to end it. We have to name it. We owe it to the victims who have been trafficked for the sex trade to name what has happened to them as sex trafficking of minors, not just as trafficking of minors. It is a big distinction.

If we do not amend the bill so that it addresses child sex trafficking specifically, we would be sentencing traffickers of children for work in non-sex forms of labour — such as in the domestic, hotel and restaurant services — to a five-year minimum sentence, and traffickers of children for work in the sex trade to the same mandatory five-year minimum sentence.

Is that fair? Is that the right thing to do? Surely the punishment for trafficking of children for the sex trade ought to have higher penalties than trafficking for other types of labour. In the U.S., as near as I can tell, there are no mandatory minimum sentences for trafficking for the purposes of forced labour.

Honourable senators, I hope that you agree with me and that the committee reviewing Bill C-268 will make amendments that, first, incorporate the specific notion of trafficking minors for the explicit purpose of exploiting them in the commercial sex trade; second, incorporate the two different age categories, as has been done in the U.S.; and, third, incorporate a fine, as has been done in the U.S.

The first proposed amendment is essential to make the bill do what most everyone seems to think it will; that is, enact harsher penalties for the sex trafficking of minors.

The second proposed amendment acknowledges the different vulnerabilities of minors under the age of 14 and the more heinous nature of the offence to them and the fact that we have children 9 to 13 years old on the streets of our cities.

The third possible amendment is meant to prevent convicted traffickers from keeping the substantial monies that they made at the expense of their victims. The One is Too Many: A Citizens' Summit on Human Trafficking at the 2010 Olympics and Beyond organization noted that "as long as trafficking remains a profitable industry, the number of victims will only increase."

Honourable senators, if we fail to rise to the challenge, and if we do not make Bill C-268 tougher, we will be failing the children of Canada and the children of other countries who will continue to be trafficked here because of a weak-spirited law. According to Secretary of State Hillary Clinton's Trafficking in Persons report from June 2009 — I said this previously and I will say it

again — "Canada is a destination country for sex tourists, particularly from the United States." If we do not have a child sex trafficking law that is as tough as the American law, traffickers will continue to operate in Canada and sexually exploit our girls and boys. We need a law as tough as theirs.

Honourable senators, here is the challenge for us as individuals and as members of the committee who will review the bill: Are we willing to be bold? Are we willing to insist that the bill be amended so that child sex trafficking is specifically named and that the penalties are actually aimed at the specific offence of child sex trafficking? That is what Canadians are asking us to do in the many letters and emails that they have sent to us.

This amendment is critically important. All of us in this chamber and in the other place have a responsibility to all Canadian children to work together and, as quickly as possible, to get an amended bill that sets minimum mandatory penalties for trafficking children for the specific purpose of exploiting them in the commercial sex trade.

For the sake of the thousands of children who have suffered the horrors of exploitation in the sex trade, we — each and every one of us, each senator, regardless of political affiliation — must be bold. I ask honourable senators to stand up for all Canadian children and demand that the crime of child sex trafficking be specifically addressed in this bill.

Honourable senators, we must do our duty. We must be bold. We must listen to the public who are outraged about child sex trafficking. We must use our minds in determining the soundness of the bill, and our hearts in trying to help the victims and in listening to those who have petitioned on the victims' behalf. It is equally important that we search deep within our souls to ensure that we make the morally and spiritually right decision. Bill C-268 is a step in the right direction, but as is, it is not bold. It is not strong. It is weak. At the very least, we must amend the bill so that it names trafficking of minors for the sex trade specifically and separately from forced labour of any other kind.

Honourable senators, let me conclude by saying much work has gone into the drafting of this bill. I commend Mrs. Joy Smith and Professor Benjamin Perrin for their tremendous work. They have worked very hard at creating all the details that go into the drafting of the bill. Like a mouse who knows every tiny detail around his or her world, they know the details of the bill and the horrific details of the world of child trafficking. On the medicine wheel of life, the mouse is as important as the hawk. The hawk flies above the mouse and sees the big picture. For the sake of the children who are trafficked, we must also be like the hawk and see the big picture. We must see that we are trying to stop the trafficking of children for the sex trade specifically. Thank you.

Hon. Roméo Antonius Dallaire: Will the honourable senator accept a question?

Senator Dyck: Yes.

Senator Dallaire: The sexual exploitation of Aboriginal children is the subject of an informal committee that Senator Pearson created and that I chair. The topic of a means of curtailing the demand has often come up as part of the solving of this horrific

problem in our country. Does the honourable senator see the question of taking away from the judges their ability to establish minimum sentencing and the requirement for sentencing as the essence of curtailing this demand? Is it just one step or part of a bigger plan? Has it been presented as part of a grander design to curtail this through other initiatives, social or economic?

• (1600)

**Senator Dyck:** Honourable senators, Senator Dallaire raises an important issue. I focused only on the bill. I did not want to go into other ways of dealing with the issue.

Of course, there is a demand. Unfortunately, most of our laws dealing with prostitution or sexual exploitation are weak. A male demand for women's and children's bodies drives the demand. Profit to the trafficker drives demand as well. Other things have to be done to help the victims and to stop the demand.

With regard to demand from the men buying sex from women and children, there must be stiffer laws as in other countries or, perhaps, a societal change may come about through greater education. A massive education campaign should take place to educate all Canadians. This issue should be talked about in sex education in our schools. We have to protect our young boys so that when they grow up, they do not think it is okay to go out on the street to buy sex from a girl. Do we teach that subject in our schools now? I do not think we do.

Some people at the conference that are much better educated about this issue than I am — I am no expert — have said that the sex trade is a form of male sexualized violence. People are laughing, but it is true. We have to focus on this issue directly and ask hard questions.

This bill is necessary. We have to take the steps. We have to start somewhere. This bill is a good way to start provided that we label it as sex trafficking. I am not sure it will make a huge impact, but it is a start.

I commend Mrs. Smith who has done a tremendous amount of work. Canadians are happy that she has done this work.

**Hon.** Gerry St. Germain: The honourable senator made reference to the sponsor of the bill in the House and those that created this particular piece of legislation as having done an excellent job. Can the honourable senator's amendments be part of another bill? Is amending this bill the best way to proceed?

Sometimes, amended bills lose the focus of what they were intended to do originally. I agree with the thrust of the honourable senator's amendments.

The Hon. the Speaker: I will remind honourable senators that Senator Dyck's time has expired.

Senator Dyck: May I have five minutes more?

Hon. Senators: Agreed.

**Senator Dyck:** Honourable senators, in my opinion, the best way forward is to insert "commercial sex trade" into this bill. I do not think the change will have a significant impact. The

honourable senator says that sometimes amendments cause the bill to lose their focus. I argue that this change will add focus, not take away from it. I would encourage all of us, and the committee members in particular, to think of ways to insert those words. In the U.S. law, the wording is simple: sex trafficking.

I praise the drafters of the bill because they have done a good job. In drafting something, one is so focused on the idea of the sex trade that one can read the words into the bill without the words actually being there. I read the bill through repeatedly and I thought it was talking about the sex trade. When I looked at the American law, I suddenly realized there is no mention of "the sex trade" or "commercial sex act" in Bill C-268.

**Hon. Sharon Carstairs:** Honourable senators, Senator Dyck has proposed that there should be a fine attached to this law, as we have done recently in drug laws with penalties from large fines to confiscation of property. Has the honourable senator considered any range of fines? Does the American bill address the concept of a range within the fine?

**Senator Dyck:** I am not sure if there is a range. I did not see a range in the U.S. law.

In the example of the man in Niagara, if he made \$350,000 from selling a girl, he should not be able to keep that \$350,000. It should go to a general pool used for the healing and rehabilitation of victims. That money was essentially hers, only he took it.

**Hon. Tommy Banks:** Honourable senators, I ask this question out of ignorance and I apologize for that.

Did the honourable senator refer to, and if not, is she aware of, Senator Phalen's bill dealing with this subject? Does the honourable senator think the two bills are at odds? If so, which is preferable? Does the honourable senator have views on that particular bill?

**Senator Dyck:** I believe there are two bills on the subject of human trafficking. Both bills deal more with the issuance of temporary resident permits, which is different from Bill C-268.

**Senator Banks:** With leave of the Senate, I ask to adjourn the debate on this bill in the name of Senator Cools.

(On motion of Senator Banks, for Senator Cools, debate adjourned.)

# CANADIANS' SUPPORT FOR NEW DIRECTION IN FOOD PRODUCTION

INQUIRY—DEBATE CONTINUED

On the Order:

Resuming debate on the inquiry of the Honourable Senator Spivak calling the attention of the Senate to Canadians' support for new direction in food production.

Hon. Tommy Banks: Honourable senators, this being the fifteenth day for this inquiry on the Order Paper, I had undertaken with our recent colleague, Senator Spivak, that

I would speak on this inquiry. However, I am not prepared. Honourable senators, I would appreciate the courtesy of a few more days to prepare my remarks. I move adjournment in my name for the rest of my time.

(On motion of Senator Banks, debate adjourned.)

• (1610)

#### **IRAN**

MOTION TO SUPPORT DEMOCRATIC ASPIRATIONS OF THE IRANIAN PEOPLE—DEBATE ADJOURNED

Hon. Jerahmiel S. Grafstein, pursuant to notice of October 28, 2009, moved:

That,

- (a) Canada supports the democratic aspirations of the people of Iran;
- (b) Canada condemns the use of violence and force by Iranian authorities against their own people to suppress pro-democracy demonstrations following the Iranian presidential elections of June 12, 2009;
- (c) Canada condemns the use of torture by Iranian authorities;
- (d) Canada calls for the immediate release of all political prisoners held in Iran;
- (e) Canada calls on Iran to fully respect all of its human rights obligations, both in law and in practice;
- (f) Canada condemns Iran's complete disregard for legally binding UN Security Council Resolutions 1696, 1737, 1747, and 1803 and International Atomic Energy Agency requirements;
- (g) Canada affirms its opposition to nuclear proliferation and condemns any pursuit by Iran of nuclear weapons capability;
- (h) Canada recommends to international organizations of which it is a member that a new set of targeted sanctions be implemented against Iran, in concert with allies, unless Iran comes into compliance with its human rights and nuclear obligations in law and in practice.

He said: Honourable senators, I rise briefly to comment on this resolution and to urge support of the motion which is timely and self-explanatory. By the way, this mirrors a resolution that was passed unanimously in the other place a short time ago. The wording is exactly the same.

I think it is a fair and thoughtful resolution

Honourable senators, this was passed unanimously in the other place. Why this motion? Why now? The world community of nations is seized of the issue of the clear aims and objectives of the President of Iran. He makes no mistake about what he says. He has issued proclamations and declarations at the United Nations, not once, but twice. He also speaks in Iran. For years, Iran has fomented terrorism and antagonism towards the West, throughout the Middle-East and beyond. Iran has supported terrorist groups with words and materials. There is no question about that. Iran is a totalitarian state.

This state is under scrutiny by its own people, who rose during the last election and were suppressed during the course of a supposedly democratic election. In the 1930s, the Western world chose to ignore the rise of totalitarianism.

How is that situation different today? It is not different by much. We have been warned. The President of Iran is seeking nuclear power and refused, as late as last week, to comply with UN resolutions for transparency. Instead, he delays, while he continues his nuclear plans unabated.

I would like to read some quotes in today's *New York Times*, the international edition, page A4, about the question of nuclear weapons:

Iran's leadership has once again equivocated after agreeing to a deal that would ease its nuclear standoff with the West.

The article goes on to say:

On Monday, —

That is Monday of this week.

— Secretary of State Hillary Rodham Clinton said that Tehran had to accept the deal in full, with no changes. And the British foreign minister, David Miliband, emerged from a meeting in Moscow with his Russian counterpart, Sergey V. Lavrov, to declare, "We both want to see a prompt response."

... France and Germany warned Iran on Monday that there was a limit to their patience.

Again, that is from this article.

The French Foreign Minister, Bernard Kouchner, said, We are waiting for a reply. If the reply is aimed at delaying matters, as we believe, then we will not accept it."

The whole world is up in verbal arms against the Iranians and their objectives.

Honourable senators, we must turn back to the 1930s. All honourable senators present know this history. In the 1930s, the world opinion was divided against the rise of totalitarianism. The British Parliament, French Parliament, Belgium Parliament, Norwegian Parliament and the Canadian Parliament said let it be; it will work itself out.

As a matter of fact, Canada turned its back on the League of Nations and withdrew from a critical resolution against the rise of Italian fascism and its effort to invade Abyssinia. We pulled out at a crucial moment.

If history teaches us anything, it teaches us to be vigilant against defined and clear-cut objectives. To be fair to the President of Iran, he has been clear and fair in the sense that he clearly set out his objectives. His objectives are to establish Iran as regional power, backed with nuclear weapons. That is his objective. There is nothing complicated about that. Meanwhile, the rest of the world says "no" over and over.

Therefore, I urge honourable senators to support this resolution as quickly as possible, so that the voice of the Canadian Parliament — both houses — can say to Iran, and to the world, that this Parliament listens, this Parliament has reacted and this Parliament will not stand silent.

**Hon. Consiglio Di Nino:** Honourable senators, this is an issue that the world is charged with and which has huge implications however it is dealt with.

I will make a general statement that I support what Senator Grafstein has said. I have only, for the first time, seen this resolution. I would like to engage in the debate and make comments. Therefore, I move adjournment of the debate.

(On motion of Senator Di Nino, debate adjourned.)

#### **BUSINESS OF THE SENATE**

Hon. Gerald J. Comeau (Deputy Leader of the Government): I have a proposition I would like to make to honourable senators. With leave, I ask that those committees which have permission to sit this afternoon be allowed to sit until the call of the chair at 5:15 p.m. for the vote.

Therefore, for those committees which had permission to sit, I propose that they be allowed to do so.

The Hon. the Speaker: Honourable senators, we are at the end of the Order Paper. Pursuant to rule 7(2), the sitting is suspended until 5:15 p.m., whereupon the bells to call in the senators will be sounded until 5:30 p.m., at which time the senators will take a deferred vote on Motion No. 86.

Do I have permission to leave the chair?

Hon. Senators: Agreed.

(The sitting of the Senate was suspended.)

• (1730)

(The sitting of the Senate was resumed.)

### NATIONAL SECURITY AND DEFENCE

QUORUM FOR SUBCOMMITTEE ON AGENDA AND PROCEDURE—MOTION ADOPTED

On the Order:

Resuming debate on the motion of the Honourable Senator Tkachuk, seconded by the Honourable Senator Cochrane:

That it be an instruction to the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence that it adopt a motion to provide that its Subcommittee on Agenda and Procedure may only convene provided that it meets its quorum of three members and that one member from each recognized party is present.

Motion adopted on the following division:

# YEAS THE HONOURABLE SENATORS

Andreychuk Angus Brazeau Brown Champagne Di Nino Dickson Duffy Eaton	Martin Meighen Murray Nancy Ruth Neufeld Nolin Ogilvie Oliver Patterson
Duffy	Oliver
Finley	Prud'homme
Fortin-Duplessis Frum	Raine Rivard
Gerstein Greene	St. Germain Seidman
Housakos Keon	Stewart Olsen Stratton
Lang LeBreton	Tkachuk Wallace—37
MacDonald	

### NAYS THE HONOURABLE SENATORS

Banks Callbeck	Kenny Losier-Cool
Carstairs	Mahovlich
Cordy	Milne
Cowan	Mitchell
Dallaire	Moore
Dawson	Munson
Day	Pépin
Downe	Peterson
Dyck	Poulin
Eggleton	Ringuette
Fox	Rompkey
Fraser	Sibbeston
Grafstein	Smith
Harb	Tardif
Hubley	Watt
Joyal	Zimmer—34

### ABSTENTIONS THE HONOURABLE SENATORS

Cools-1

(The Senate adjourned until Wednesday, November 4, 2009, at 1:30 p.m.)

# **APPENDIX**

Officers of the Senate

The Ministry

Senators

(Listed according to seniority, alphabetically and by provinces)

Committees of the Senate

### THE SPEAKER

The Honourable Noël A. Kinsella

## THE LEADER OF THE GOVERNMENT

The Honourable Marjory LeBreton, P.C.

## THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION

The Honourable James S. Cowan

### OFFICERS OF THE SENATE

## CLERK OF THE SENATE AND CLERK OF THE PARLIAMENTS

Gary W. O'Brien

### LAW CLERK AND PARLIAMENTARY COUNSEL

Mark Audcent

## USHER OF THE BLACK ROD

Kevin MacLeod

### THE MINISTRY

(In order of precedence)

(November 3, 2009)

The Right Hon. Stephen Joseph Harper The Hon. Robert Douglas Nicholson The Hon. Jean-Pierre Blackburn

The Hon. Gregory Francis Thompson The Hon. Marjory LeBreton

The Hon. Chuck Strahl

The Hon. Peter Gordon MacKay

The Hon. Stockwell Day

The Hon. Vic Toews The Hon. Rona Ambrose The Hon. Diane Finley The Hon. Beverley J. Oda The Hon. Jim Prentice The Hon. John Baird The Hon. Lawrence Cannon

The Hon. Tony Clement The Hon. James Michael Flaherty The Hon. Josée Verner

> The Hon. Jay D. Hill The Hon. Peter Van Loan The Hon. Gerry Ritz

The Hon, Jason Kenney The Hon. Christian Paradis The Hon. James Moore

The Hon. Leona Aglukkaq The Hon. Lisa Raitt The Hon. Gail A. Shea The Hon. Gary Lunn The Hon. Gordon O'Connor The Hon. Helena Guergis The Hon. Diane Ablonczy The Hon. Rob Merrifield The Hon. Lynne Yelich The Hon. Steven John Fletcher The Hon. Gary Goodyear The Hon. Denis Lebel

> The Hon. Keith Ashfield The Hon. Peter Kent

Prime Minister

Minister of Justice and Attorney General of Canada Minister of National Revenue and Minister of State (Agriculture)

Minister of Veterans Affairs

Leader of the Government in the Senate and

Minister of State (Seniors)

Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development and Federal Interlocutor for Metis and Non-Status Indians Minister of National Defence and Minister for the Atlantic Gateway

Minister of International Trade and Minister for the Asia-Pacific Gateway

President of the Treasury Board

Minister of Labour

Minister of Human Resources and Skills Development

Minister for International Cooperation

Minister of the Environment

Minister of Transport, Infrastructure and Communities Minister of Foreign Affairs and Minister of State (National Capital Commission)

Minister of Industry

Minister of Finance

President of the Queen's Privy Council, Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs and

Minister for La Francophonie

Leader of the Government in the House of Commons Minister of Public Safety

Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food and Minister for the Canadian Wheat Board

Minister of Citizenship, Immigration and Multiculturalism

Minister of Public Works and Government Services Minister for Official Languages and Minister of

Canadian Heritage

Minister of Health

Minister of Natural Resources

Minister of Fisheries and Oceans

Minister of State (Sport)

Minister of State and Chief Government Whip

Minister of State (Status of Women)
Minister of State (Small Business and Tourism)

Minister of State (Transport)
Minister of State (Western Economic Diversification)
Minister of State (Democratic Reform)

Minister of State (Science and Technology)

Minister of State (Economic Development Agency of Canada for the Regions of Quebec)

Minister of State (Atlantic Canada Opportunities Agency)

Minister of State of Foreign Affairs (Americas)

# **SENATORS OF CANADA**

# ACCORDING TO SENIORITY

(November 3, 2009)

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
The Honourable		
Lowell Murray P.C.	Pakenham	Ottawa Ont
Peter Alan Stollery	Bloor and Yonge	Toronto, Ont.
Peter Michael Pitfield, P.C.	Ottawa-Vanier	Ottawa, Ont.
Jerahmiel S. Grafstein	Metro Toronto	Toronto Ont
Anne C. Cools	Toronto Centre-York	Toronto Ont
Charlie Watt	Inkerman	Kunimaa One
Iovce Fairbairn P.C.	Lethbridge	Lethbridge Alta
Colin Kenny	Rideau	Ottawa Ont
	De la Vallière	
Ethel Cochrane	Newfoundland and Labrador	Port-au-Port Nfld & Lab
	Nova Scotia	
	Ontario	
	South Shore	
	Fredericton-York-Sunbury	
	Ottawa	
Michael Arthur Meighen	St. Marys	Toronto, Ont.
	Manitoba	
	Saskatchewan.	
	Stadacona	
	Red River	
Marcel Prud'homme, P.C	La Salle	Montreal, Que.
David Tkachuk	Saskatchewan.	Saskatoon, Sask.
	Alma	
	De Salaberry	
	Ontario	
Gerry St. Germain, P.C	Langley-Pemberton-Whistler	Maple Ridge, B.C.
Sharon Carstairs, P.C	Manitoba	Winnipeg, Man.
Rose-Marie Losier-Cool	Tracadie	Tracadie-Sheila, N.B.
Céline Hervieux-Payette, P.C	Bedford	Montreal, Que.
William H. Rompkey, P.C	Newfoundland and Labrador	St. John's, Nfld. & Lab.
Lorna Milne	Peel County	Brampton, Ont.
	Nord de l'Óntario/Northern Ontario	
Wilfred P. Moore	Stanhope St./South Shore	Chester, N.S.
Lucie Pépin	Shawinegan	Montreal, Que.
	New Brunswick	
Catherine S. Callbeck	Prince Edward Island	Central Bedeque, P.E.I.
Serge Joyal, P.C	Kennebec	Montreal, Que.
Francis William Mahovlich	Toronto	Toronto, Ont.
Joan Thorne Fraser	De Lorimier	Montreal, Que.
Vivienne Poy	Toronto	Toronto, Ont.
George Furey	Newfoundland and Labrador	St. John's, Nfld. & Lab.
	Northwest Territories	
	Alberta	
Jane Cordy	Nova Scotia	Dartmouth, N.S.
	Prince Edward Island	
Mobina S. B. Jaffer	British Columbia	North Vancouver, B.C.

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
Jean Langinta	Saurel	Magag Que
Jean Laponite	Saint John-Kennebecasis	Hampton N D
Cooper S. Bolton D.C.	Newfoundland and Lahradan	Candan Nifld & Lah
Down and Louisman	Newfoundland and Labrador	Vander, Nild. & Lab.
Raymond Lavigne	Montarville	verdun, Que.
David P. Smith, P.C	Cobourg	Toronto, Ont.
Maria Chaput	Manitoba	Sainte-Anne, Man.
Pana Merchant	Saskatchewan	Regina, Sask.
Pierrette Ringuette	New Brunswick	Edmundston, N.B.
	Charlottetown	
Paul J. Massicotte	De Lanaudière	Mont-Saint-Hilaire, Que.
Mac Harb	Ontario	Ottawa, Ont.
Terry M. Mercer	Northend Halifax	Caribou River, N.S.
	Ottawa/Rideau Canal	
	Alberta	
	Alberta	
	Alberta	
Robert W. Peterson	Saskatchewan	Regina, Sask.
	Saskatchewan	
Art Eggleton, P.C	Ontario	Toronto, Ont.
Nancy Ruth	Cluny	Toronto, Ont.
Roméo Antonius Dallaire	Gulf	Sainte-Foy, Que.
	Nova Scotia	
Andrée Champagne, P.C	Grandville	Saint-Hyacinthe, Que.
Hugh Segal	Kingston–Frontenac–Leeds	Kingston, Ont.
Larry W. Campbell	British Columbia	Vancouver, B.C.
Rod A. A. Zimmer	Manitoba	Winnipeg, Man.
Dennis Dawson	Lauzon	Sainte-Foy, Que.
Francis Fox, P.C	Victoria	Montreal, Que.
Sandra Lovelace Nicholas	New Brunswick	Tobique First Nations, N.B.
Bert Brown	Alberta	Kathyrn, Alta.
Fabian Manning	Newfoundland and Labrador	St. Bride's, Nfld. & Lab.
	Nova Scotia	
Stephen Greene	Halifax - The Citadel	Halifax, N.S.
Michael L. MacDonald	Cape Breton	Dartmouth, N.S.
Michael Duffy	Prince Edward Island	Cavendish, P.E.I.
Percy Mockler	New Brunswick	St. Leonard, N.B.
John D. Wallace	New Brunswick	Rothesay, N.B.
Michel Rivard	The Laurentides	Quebec, Que.
	Ontario	
Irving Gerstein	Ontario	Toronto, Ont.
Pamela Wallin	Saskatchewan.	Kuroki Beach, Sask.
Nancy Greene Raine	Thompson-Okanagan-Kootenay	Sun Peaks, B.C.
Yonah Martin	British Columbia	Vancouver, B.C.
	British Columbia	
	Yukon	
	Repentigny	
Leo Housakos	Wellington	Laval Que
Suzanne Fortin-Dunlessis	Rougemont	Quebec Que c
Donald Neil Plett	Landmark	Landmark Man
Michael Douglas Finley	Ontario-South Coast	Simcoe Ont
	Ontario	
Claude Carignan	Mille Isles	Saint-Fuctache Oue
Incape Damare	Rigaud	Hudson Oue
Judith G. Saidman (Pinlay)	De la Durantaye	Saint Banhaäl Oua
Carolun Stawart Olean	Now Proposite	Sant-Kaphaei, Que.
Valvin Vannath Ogilvia	New Brunswick	Canning N.S.
	Annapolis Valley - Hants	
Dennis Cicii Fattersull	Nunavut	iqaiuit, inuliavut

# **SENATORS OF CANADA**

# ALPHABETICAL LIST

(November 3, 2009)

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address	Political Affiliation
The Honourable			
Andreychuk, A. Raynell	Saskatchewan	. Regina, Sask	. Conservative
Angus, W. David	Alma	. Montreal, Que	Conservative
Baker, George S., P.C	Newfoundland and Labrador	. Gander, Nfld. & Lab	Liberal
		. Edmonton, Alta	
Brazeau, Patrick	Repentigny	. Gatineau, Que	. Conservative
Brown, Bert	Alberta	. Kathyrn, Alta	. Conservative
Callbeck, Catherine S	Prince Edward Island	. Central Bedeque, P.E.I	. Liberal
Campbell, Larry W	British Columbia	. Vancouver, B.C	. Liberal
Carignan, Claude	Mille Isles	. Saint-Eustache, Que	. Conservative
		. Winnipeg, Man	
Champagne, Andrée, P.C	Grandville	. Saint-Hyacinthe, Que	. Conservative
Chaput, Maria	Manitoba	. Sainte-Anne, Man	. Liberal
Cochrane, Ethel	Newfoundland and Labrador	. Port-au-Port, Nfld. & Lab	. Conservative
		. Saulnierville, N.S	
		. Toronto, Ont	
		. Dartmouth, N.S	
		. Halifax, N.S.	
Dallaire, Roméo Antonius	Gulf	. Sainte-Foy, Que	. Liberal
		. Ste-Foy, Que	
Day, Joseph A	Saint John-Kennebecasis	. Hampton, N.B	Liberal
De Bané, Pierre, P.C	De la Vallière	. Montreal, Que	. Liberal
Demers, Jacques	Rigaud	. Hudson, Que	. Conservative
		. Halifax, N.S	
Di Nino, Consiglio	. Ontario	. Downsview, Ont	Conservative
		. Charlottetown, P.E.I	
		. Cavendish, P.E.I	
		. Saskatoon, Sask	
		. Caledon, Ont	
		Toronto, Ont.	
Fairbairn, Joyce, P.C.	. Lethbridge	. Lethbridge, Alta	Liberal
		. Simcoe, Ont	
Fortin-Duplessis, Suzanne	Rougemont	. Quebec, Que	. Conservative
Fox, Francis, P.C	. Victoria	. Montreal, Que	. Liberal
Fraser, Joan Thorne	. De Lorimier	. Montreal, Que	. Liberal
Frum, Linda	Ontario	. Toronto, Ont	. Conservative
		St. John's, Nfld. & Lab	
		Toronto, Ont.	
		Toronto, Ont.	
		. Halifax, N.S.	
		Ottawa, Ont.	
		. Montreal, Que	
Housakos, Leo	weilington	Laval, Que	. Conservative
Hubley, Elizabeth M		Kensington, P.E.I.	. Liberal
Janer, Mobina S. B	British Columbia	North Vancouver, B.C	Liberal

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address	Political Affiliation
	Besignation	11001035	- Inmuton
Johnson Janis G	Manitaba	. Gimli, Man	Concernative
Ioval Serge P C	Kennebec	. Montreal, Que	Liberal
Kenny, Colin	. Rideau	Ottawa, Ont.	. Liberal
Keon, Wilbert Joseph	Ottawa	Ottawa, Ont.	Conservative
Kinsella, Noël A., Speaker	Fredericton-York-Sunbury	. Fredericton, N.B	. Conservative
Lang, Hector Daniel	Yukon	. Whitehorse, Yukon	. Conservative
Lapointe, Jean	Saurel	. Magog, Que	. Liberal
Lavigne, Raymond	Montarville	. Verdun, Que	Liberal
LeBreton, Marjory, P.C	Ontario	. Manotick, Ont	. Conservative
Losser-Cool, Rose-Marie	New Brunewick	Tracadie-Sheila, N.B	Liberal
MacDonald Michael I	Cape Breton	Dartmouth, N.S.	Conservative
Mahovlich, Francis William	Toronto	Toronto, Ont.	Liberal
Manning, Fabian	. Newfoundland and Labrador	St. Brides's, Nfld. & Lab	. Conservative
Martin, Yonah	British Columbia	Vancouver, B.C.	. Conservative
Massicotte, Paul J	De Lanaudière	. Mont-Saint-Hilaire, Que	. Liberal
McCoy, Elaine	Alberta	. Calgary, Alta	. Progressive Conservative
Meighen, Michael Arthur	St. Marys	Toronto, Ont.	. Conservative
Mercer, Terry M	Northend Halifax	. Caribou River, N.S	. Liberal
Merchant, Pana	Saskatchewan	Regina, Sask	Liberal
Milne, Lorna	Alborto	Brampton, Ont	Liberal
Mockler Percy	New Brunswick	St. Leonard, N.B.	Conservative
Moore Wilfred P	Stanhone St /South Shore	Chester, N.S.	Liberal
Munson, Jim	. Ottawa/Rideau Canal	Ottawa, Ont.	. Liberal
Murray, Lowell, P.C	. Pakenham	Ottawa, Ont	. Progressive Conservative
Nancy Ruth	Cluny	. Toronto, Ont	. Conservative
Neufeld, Richard	British Columbia	. Fort St. John, B.C	. Conservative
Nolin, Pierre Claude	De Salaberry	. Quebec, Que	. Conservative
Ogilvie, Kelvin Kenneth	Annapolis Valley - Hants	Canning, N.S.	. Conservative
Oliver, Donald H	South Shore	. Halifax, N.S.	. Conservative
Patterson, Dennis Glen	Nunavut	. Iqaluit, Nunavut	. Conservative
Peterson Robert W	Saskatchewan	. Montreal, Que	Liberal
Pitfield Peter Michael P.C.	Ottawa-Vanier	Ottawa, Ont.	Independent
Plett Donald Neil	Landmark	Landmark Man	Conservative
Poulin, Marie-P	. Nord de l'Ontario/Northern Ontario	· Ottawa, Ont	. Liberal
Poy, Vivienne	Toronto	. Toronto, Ont	. Liberal
Prud'homme, Marcel, P.C	La Salle	. Montreal, Que	Independent
Raine, Nancy Greene	Thompson-Okanagan-Kootenay .	Sun Peaks, B.C.	. Conservative
Ringuette, Pierrette	. New Brunswick	Edmundston, N.B	Liberal
Rivard, Michel	. The Laurentides	. Quebec, Que	. Conservative
Rivest, Jean-Claude	Now Proposite	. Quebec, Que	. Independent
Rompkey William H PC	Newfoundland and Labrador	St. John's, Nfld. & Lab	Liberal
		. Maple Ridge, B.C	
Segal. Hugh	. Kingston-Frontenac-Leeds	Kingston, Ont.	. Conservative
		Saint-Raphaël, Que	
Sibbeston, Nick G	Northwest Territories	. Fort Simpson, N.W.T	. Liberal
Smith, David P., P.C	Cobourg	. Toronto, Ont	Liberal
		Sackville, N.B.	
Stollery, Peter Alan	Bloor and Yonge	Toronto, Ont.	. Liberal
Stratton, Terrance R	Ked Kiver	St. Norbert, Man.	. Conservative
		Edmonton, Alta	
		Saskatoon, Sask	
Wallin Pamela	Saskatchewan	. Kuroki Beach, Sask	Conservative
		. Kunjuaq, Que	
Zimmer, Rod A. A.	. Manitoba	. Winnipeg, Man	Liberal
		r · Oı	

# **SENATORS OF CANADA**

# BY PROVINCE AND TERRITORY

(November 3, 2009)

# ONTARIO—24

	Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
	The Honourable		
	Lowell Murray, P.C		
2	Peter Alan Stollery		
3		Ottawa-Vanier	
4	Jerahmiel S. Grafstein	Metro Toronto	Toronto
2	Anne C. Cools		Toronto
6	Colin Kenny		Ottawa
/	Consiglio Di Nino		Downsview
	Wilbert Joseph Keon		Ottawa Toronto
10	Michael Arthur Meighen	St. Marys	
11	Marjory LeBreton, P.C	Peel County	
12	Marie-P. Poulin		Ottawa
12	Francis William Mahovlich		Toronto
1/		Toronto	Toronto
15	David P. Smith, P.C.	Cohourg	Toronto
16	Mac Harb	Ontario	
17	Jim Munson		Ottawa
18	Art Eggleton, P.C.		
	Nancy Ruth		
20	Hugh Segal		
21		Ontario	
22	Irving Gerstein	Ontario	Toronto
23	Michael Douglas Finley	Ontario-South Coast	
24			Toronto

# SENATORS BY PROVINCE AND TERRITORY

# **QUEBEC—24**

	Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
	The Honourable		
3 4 5 6 7 7 8 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 17 18 19 20 21 22	Charlie Watt Pierre De Bané, P.C. Jean-Claude Rivest Marcel Prud'homme, P.C W. David Angus Pierre Claude Nolin Céline Hervieux-Payette, P.C. Lucie Pépin Serge Joyal, P.C. Joan Thorne Fraser Jean Lapointe Raymond Lavigne Paul J. Massicotte Roméo Antonius Dallaire Andrée Champagne, P.C. Dennis Dawson Francis Fox, P.C. Michel Rivard Patrick Brazeau Leo Housakos Suzanne Fortin-Duplessis Claude Carignan	Stadacona La Salle Alma De Salaberry Bedford Shawinegan Kennebec De Lorimier Saurel Montarville De Lanaudière Gulf Grandville Lauzon Victoria The Laurentides Repentigny Wellington Rougemont Mille Isles	Montreal Quebec Montreal Montreal Quebec Montreal Montreal Montreal Montreal Montreal Montreal Magog Verdun Mont-Saint-Hilaire Sainte-Foy Saint-Hyacinthe Ste-Foy Montreal Quebec Gatineau Laval Quebec Saint-Eustache
23 24	Jacques Demers Judith G. Seidman (Ripley)		

# SENATORS BY PROVINCE-MARITIME DIVISION

## NOVA SCOTIA—10

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
The Honourable		
1 Gerald J. Comeau 2 Donald H. Oliver 3 Wilfred P. Moore 4 Jane Cordy 5 Terry M. Mercer 6 James S. Cowan 7 Fred J. Dickson 8 Stephen Greene 9 Michael L. MacDonald 10 Kelvin Kenneth Ogilvie	South Shore Stanhope St./South Shore Nova Scotia Northend Halifax Nova Scotia Nova Scotia Halifax - The Citadel Cape Breton	Halifax Chester Dartmouth Caribou River Halifax Halifax Halifax Dartmouth
	NEW BRUNSWICK—10	
Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
The Honourable		
1 Noël A. Kinsella, Speaker	Tracadie	Fredericton Tracadie-Sheila Saint-Louis-de-Kent

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
The Honou	TRABLE	
<ul><li>2 Elizabeth M. Hubley</li><li>3 Percy E. Downe</li></ul>	Prince Edward Island Prince Edward Island Charlottetown Prince Edward Island	Kensington Charlottetown

# SENATORS BY PROVINCE-WESTERN DIVISION

# MANITOBA—6

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
The Honoura	BLE	
2 Terrance R. Stratton 3 Sharon Carstairs, P.C 4 Maria Chaput	Manitoba Red River Manitoba Manitoba Manitoba Landmark	St. Norbert Winnipeg Sainte-Anne Winnipeg

# **BRITISH COLUMBIA—6**

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOURABLE  1 Gerry St. Germain, P.C.  2 Mobina S. B. Jaffer  3 Larry W. Campbell  4 Nancy Greene Raine  5 Yonah Martin  6 Richard Neufeld	British Columbia	Vancouver Sun Peaks Vancouver

# SASKATCHEWAN—6

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
The Honourable		
1 A. Raynell Andreychuk 2 David Tkachuk 3 Pana Merchant 4 Robert W. Peterson 5 Lillian Eva Dyck 6 Pamela Wallin	Saskatchewan	Regina Regina

# ALBERTA—6

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
The Honoura	BLE	
2 Tommy Banks	LethbridgeAlbertaAlberta	Edmonton
Grant Mitchell Elaine McCoy	Alberta Alberta Alberta Alberta	Edmonton Calgary

# SENATORS BY PROVINCE AND TERRITORY

# NEWFOUNDLAND AND LABRADOR—6

Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
The Honour	ABLE	
<ul> <li>William H. Rompkey, P.</li> <li>George Furey</li> <li>George S. Baker, P.C</li> <li>Fabian Manning</li> </ul>	Newfoundland and Labrador  Newfoundland and Labrador  Newfoundland and Labrador  Newfoundland and Labrador  Newfoundland and Labrador	St. John's St. John's Gander
	NORTHWEST TERRITO	RIES—1
Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
The Honour	ABLE	
1 Nick G. Sibbeston	Northwest Territories	Fort Simpson
	NUNAVUT—1	
Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOUR	ABLE	
1 Dennis Glen Patterson .	Nunavut	Iqaluit
	YUKON—1	
Senator	Designation	Post Office Address
THE HONOUR	ABLE	

### ALPHABETICAL LIST OF STANDING, SPECIAL AND JOINT COMMITTEES

(As of November 3, 2009)

\*Ex Officio Member

### ABORIGINAL PEOPLES

Chair: Honourable Senator St. Germain, P.C.

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Sibbeston** 

### **Honourable Senators:**

Brazeau, Duffy, Lovelace Nicholas, Raine,

Campbell, Dyck, Patterson, St. Germain, P.C., Carstairs, P.C., Hubley, Peterson, Sibbeston.

#### Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Brazeau, Brown, Campbell, Carstairs, P.C., \*Cowan (or Tardif), Dyck, Hubley, Lang, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Lovelace Nicholas, Peterson, Raine, St. Germain, P.C., Sibbeston.

### AGRICULTURE AND FORESTRY

**Chair: Honourable Senator Mockler** 

Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Fairbairn, P.C.

### **Honourable Senators:**

Baker, P.C.,Finley,Mahovlich,Plett,Cowan (or Tardif),Grafstein,Mercer,Poulin,Eaton,\* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau),Mockler,Rivard.

Fairbairn, P.C., Lovelace Nicholas,

### Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Baker, P.C., Callbeck, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Duffy, Eaton, Fairbairn, P.C., Housakos, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Lovelace Nicholas, Mahovlich, Mercer, Milne, Mockler, Rivard.

# BANKING, TRADE AND COMMERCE

Chair: Honourable Senator Meighen Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Hervieux-Payette, P.C.

### **Honourable Senators:**

Carstairs, P.C., Gerstein, \* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Oliver,

\* Cowan (or Tardif), Greene, Massicotte, Peterson,
Fox, P.C., Harb, Meighen, Ringuette.

Frum, Hervieux-Payette, P.C.,

### Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

\*Cowan (or Tardif), Eyton, Fox, P.C., Gerstein, Goldstein, Greene, Harb, Hervieux-Payette, P.C., \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Massicotte, Meighen, Moore, Oliver, Ringuette.

xiv SENATE DEBATES November 3, 2009

### CONFLICT OF INTEREST FOR SENATORS

Chair: Honourable Senator Joyal, P.C.

Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Andreychuk

**Honourable Senators:** 

Andreychuk,

Angus,

Carstairs, P.C.,

Joyal, P.C.,

Robichaud, P.C.

Original Members agreed to by Motion of the Senate
Andreychuk, Angus, Carstairs, P.C., Joyal, P.C., Robichaud, P.C.

### ENERGY, THE ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES

Chair: Honourable Senator Angus

Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Mitchell

**Honourable Senators:** 

Angus,Lang,Milne,Peterson,Banks,\* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau),Mitchell,Seidman,Brown,McCoy,Neufeld,Sibbeston.

\* Cowan (or Tardif), Merchant,

Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Adams, Angus, Banks, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Kenny, Lang, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Merchant, Mitchell, Neufeld, Peterson, St. Germain, P.C., Sibbeston, Spivak

### FISHERIES AND OCEANS

Chair: Honourable Senator Rompkey, P.C.

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Cochrane** 

**Honourable Senators:** 

Cochrane, Hubley, Patterson, Robichaud, P.C., Cowan, \* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Poy, Rompkey, P.C.,

\* Cowan (or Tardif), MacDonald, Raine, Watt.

Dallaire, Manning,

# Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Adams, Campbell, Cochrane, Cook, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Hubley, Johnson, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), MacDonald, Manning, Raine, Robichaud, P.C., Rompkey, P.C.

### FOREIGN AFFAIRS AND INTERNATIONAL TRADE

### Chair: Honourable Senator Di Nino

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Stollery** 

### **Honourable Senators:**

Andreychuk, Downe, Jaffer, Smith, P.C.,

\* Cowan (or Tardif), Fortin-Duplessis, LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Stewart Olsen,
Dawson, Frum, Mahovlich, Zimmer.

Di Nino, Grafstein,

### Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Andreychuk, Corbin, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Dawson, De Bané, P.C., Di Nino, Downe, Fortin-Duplessis, Grafstein, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Mahovlich, Segal, Stollery, Wallin.

## **HUMAN RIGHTS**

### Chair: Honourable Senator Andrevchuk

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Jaffer** 

### **Honourable Senators:**

Andreychuk, Demers, Mitchell, Poy, Brazeau, Jaffer, Munson, Zimmer.

## Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Andreychuk, Brazeau, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Dallaire, Goldstein, Jaffer, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Martin, Nancy Ruth, Pépin, Poy.

### INTERNAL ECONOMY, BUDGETS AND ADMINISTRATION

# Chair: Honourable Senator Furey Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Tkachuk

### **Honourable Senators:**

Comeau. Furey, \* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Prud'homme, P.C., MacDonald, Robichaud, P.C., Cordy, Greene, Cowan (or Tardif), Jaffer, Massicotte, Stollery, Downe. Kinsella, Munson, Tkachuk.

Fox,

### Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Comeau, Cordy, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Dawson, Downe, Furey, Greene, Jaffer, Kinsella, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), MacDonald, Massicotte, Munson, Rivard, Robichaud, P.C., Stollery, Tkachuk.

### LEGAL AND CONSTITUTIONAL AFFAIRS

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Nolin** 

### Chair: Honourable Senator Fraser

# Honourable Senators:

Angus, Fraser, Milne, Rivest,
Baker, P.C., Joyal, P.C., Nolin, Wallace,
Carignan \* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Poulin Watt.

\* Cowan (or Tardif), Mercer,

### Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Angus, Baker, P.C., Bryden, Campbell, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Dickson, Fraser, Joyal, P.C., \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Milne, Nolin, Rivest, Wallace, Watt.

## LIBRARY OF PARLIAMENT (Joint)

### Joint Chair: Honourable Senator Carstairs

### **Honourable Senators:**

Carstairs, P.C., Jaffer, Lapointe, Stratton. Greene,

Original Members agreed to by Motion of the Senate Baker, P.C., Carstairs, P.C., Greene, Jaffer, Stratton.

# NATIONAL FINANCE

## Chair: Honourable Senator Day Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Gerstein

### **Honourable Senators:**

Callbeck,Day,Eggleton, P.C.,Mitchell,Carignan,De Bané, P.C.,Gerstein,Neufeld,Chaput,Di Nino,\* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau),Ringuette.

\* Cowan (or Tardif), Dickson,

# Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Callbeck, Chaput, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Day, De Bané, P.C., Di Nino, Eggleton, P.C., Gerstein, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Mitchell, Nancy Ruth, Neufeld, Prud'homme, P.C., Ringuette.

### NATIONAL SECURITY AND DEFENCE

Chair: Honourable Senator Kenny Deputy Chair: Hon

·

Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Wallin

**Honourable Senators:** 

Banks, Kenny, Meighen, Tkachuk,
\* Cowan (or Tardif), \* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Moore, Zimmer.
Day, Manning, Raine,

Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Banks, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Day, Kenny, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Manning, Meighen, Moore, Tkachuk, Wallin, Zimmer.

### SUBCOMMITTEE VETERANS AFFAIRS

Chair: Honourable Senator Meighen Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Banks

**Honourable Senators:** 

Banks, Kenny, Meighen, Raine.

Day,

# OFFICIAL LANGUAGES

Chair: Honourable Senator Chaput

Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Chappagne, P.C.

**Honourable Senators:** 

Champagne, P.C., Fortin-Duplessis, Losier-Cool, Seidman, Chaput, Jaffer, Mockler, Tardif.

\* Cowan (or Tardif), LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Pépin,

Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Champagne, P.C., Chaput, Comeau, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Fortin-Duplessis, Goldstein, Jaffer, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Losier-Cool, Mockler, Poulin.

### RULES, PROCEDURES AND THE RIGHTS OF PARLIAMENT

**Chair: Honourable Senator Oliver** 

Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Smith, P.C.

**Honourable Senators:** 

Champagne, P.C., Fraser. Keon. Nolin. \* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Cools, Furey, Oliver, Cordy, Harb, Losier-Cool, Smith, P.C. \* Cowan (or Tardif), Joyal, P.C., McCov. Wallace.

Duffy,

Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Andreychuk, Brown, Cools, Corbin, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Duffy, Fraser, Furey, Joyal, P.C., Keon, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Losier-Cool, McCoy, Nolin, Oliver, Robichaud, P.C., Smith, P.C.

## **SCRUTINY OF REGULATIONS (Joint)**

Joint Chair: Honourable Senator Eyton

**Honourable Senators:** 

Baker, P.C., Hervieux-Payette, P.C., Ogilvie, Wallace.

Dickson, Moore,

Original Members as agreed to by Motion of the Senate

Bryden, Cook, Dickson, Eyton, Hervieux-Payette, P.C., Moore, Wallace.

### **SELECTION**

Chair: Honourable Senator Stratton Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Munson

**Honourable Senators:** 

Cochrane, Fairbairn, P.C., LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Stratton, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Fraser, Munson, Tkachuk.

Di Nino, \* Hervieux-Payette, P.C. Robichaud, P.C.,

Original Members agreed to by Motion of the Senate

Carstairs, P.C., Cochrane, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Di Nino, Fairbairn, P.C., Hervieux-Payette, P.C., \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Munson, Robichaud, P.C., Stratton, Tkachuk.

### SOCIAL AFFAIRS, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

Chair: Honourable Senator Eggleton, P.C.

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Keon** 

### **Honourable Senators:**

Banks. Dvck. Keon. Ogilvie. \* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Pépin, Callbeck, Eaton, Cordy, Eggleton, P.C., Martin. Segal. Fairbairn, P.C.,

\* Cowan (or Tardif),

### Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Callbeck, Champagne, P.C., Cook, Cordy, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Dyck, Eaton, Eggleton, P.C., Fairbairn, P.C., Keon, \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Martin, Pépin, Segal.

## SUBCOMMITTEE ON CITIES

Chair: Honourable Senator Eggleton, P.C.

Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Segal

### **Honourable Senators:**

Cordy, Eggleton, P.C., Martin, Segal. Dyck,

### TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS

Chair: Honourable Senator Dawson

**Deputy Chair: Honourable Senator Johnson** 

# **Honourable Senators:**

Fox, P.C., Rompkey, P.C., Andreychuk, Mercer, Cochrane, Housakos, Merchant, Seidman, \* Cowan (or Tardif), \* LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Rivard, Zimmer.

Dawson,

### Original Members as nominated by the Committee of Selection

Adams, Bacon, Cochrane, \*Cowan (or Tardif), Dawson, Eyton, Fox, P.C., Housakos. Johnson. \*LeBreton, P.C. (or Comeau), Mercer, Merchant, Wallace, Zimmer.

# CONTENTS

# Tuesday, November 3, 2009

PAGE	PAGE
Afghanistan—Fallen Soldier Silent Tribute. The Hon. the Speaker pro tempore	Auditor General November 2009 Report Tabled
SENATORS' STATEMENTS	Canadian NATO Parliamentary Association Conference on NATO's New Strategic Concept: Launching the Process, July 7, 2009—Report Tabled Hon. Jane Cordy
Tributes The Late Right Honourable Roméo Leblanc, P.C., C.C., C.M.M., C.D. Hon. Noël A. Kinsella	Remembrance Day Notice of Inquiry. Hon. Anne C. Cools. 1643
Hon. Bill Rompkey1639Hon. Fernand Robichaud1640Hon. Rose-Marie Losier-Cool1640Hon. Joseph A. Day1640	QUESTION PERIOD
Hon. Jerahmiel S. Grafstein	Health         H1N1 Flu Vaccine.       1644         Hon. James S. Cowan.       1644         Hon. Marjory LeBreton       1646         Hon. Jane Cordy       1646         Hon. Dennis Dawson       1646         Hon. Claudette Tardif       1647         Hon. Lucie Pépin       1647
Hon. Fred J. Dickson	ORDERS OF THE DAY
Hon. Michael A. Meighen	Criminal Code (Bill C-268) Bill to Amend—Second Reading—Debate Continued. Hon. Lillian Eva Dyck
ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS  Citizenship and Immigration 2009 Annual Report Tabled.	Hon. Roméo Antonius Dallaire1652Hon. Gerry St. Germain1653Hon. Sharon Carstairs1653Hon. Tommy Banks1653
Hon. Gerald J. Comeau	Canadians' Support for New Direction in Food Production Inquiry—Debate Continued. Hon. Tommy Banks
2008-09 Annual Report Tabled.  Hon. Gerald J. Comeau	Iran Motion to Support Democratic Aspirations of the Iranian People— Debate Adjourned. Hon. Jerahmiel S. Grafstein
Study on Federal Government's Responsibilities to First Nations, Inuit and Metis Peoples Fifth Report of Aboriginal Peoples Committee— Government Response Tabled.	Hon. Consiglio Di Nino
Hon. Gerald J. Comeau	National Security and Defence Quorum for Subcommittee on Agenda and Procedure—
2007-08 and 2008-09 Annual Reports and Summary of 2009 Corporate Plan Tabled.  Hon. Gerald J. Comeau	Motion Adopted         1655           Appendix



If undelivered, return COVER ONLY to:
Public Works and Government Services Canada
Publishing and Depository Services
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0S5